

ETHNIC IDENTITY AND POLITICAL CONSTRUCTION: AN ANTHROPOLOGICAL ANALYSIS OF BALUCHISTAN'S STRUGGLE FOR AUTONOMY IN PAKISTAN

Bushra Saleem*¹, Rabia khalid², Shayeema Farooqi³, Khizra Nasir⁴, Zubaria Aziz⁵

*^{1,2,3,4,5}MPhil Anthropology Quaid-e-Azam University Islamabad

Corresponding Author: *¹bushrasaleem275@gmail.com

Received: 04 February, 2024

Revised: 04 March, 2024

Accepted: 17 March, 2024

Published: 01 April, 2024

ABSTRACT

One of the complex issues in Balochistan is autonomy movement that concern historical grievances, social and political phenomena bringing state institutions forefront creating while contesting Baloch identity. This study aims to present some basics of Baloch identity and its conflict with the state, also considering it as a contribution in academic categories of political anthropology; ethnic politics and identity construction under Pakistan context. This study delves into the complex realm of ethnic politics and identity formation in Pakistan, examining Balochistan – a distinct marginal province. Developing an in-depth analysis of the historical climate, dynamics within that time and state institutions this research uses political anthropology to understand not only Baloch ethnic identity but also autonomy against Pakistan.

Keywords: Ethic identity, Autonomy, Political construction.

INTRODUCTION

The Balochistan autonomy movement is a multi-pronged campaign for additional autonomy and self-determination in the domain of Pakistan. The movement's bases can be traced back to historical oppression, cultural uniqueness and economic dominance of the Pakistani state (Grare, 2013). Although the demands of Baloch national movement have covered various degrees from better cultural, economic and political rights to full-scale secession and creation of an independent state Balochistan majority submits a desire for autonomy in provinces rather than independence (Grare, 2013).

The movement, highly left-wing influenced Marxist is deeply split between several separatist factions that struggle for higher autonomy or even self-law. However, the repressive response of state towards demands for increased autonomy has only further aggravated the conflict and resulted in continuous bloodshed along with insurgency (Mendez, 2020). The aspiration of Baloch people to gain independence has been shaped by their distinct cultural and tribal identities the nationalist movement is seen as secular and Marx in influence (Mendez, 2020).

The autonomy movement in Balochistan raises a lot of controversy within wider Pakistani society, has important political and socio-cultural repercussions for the area. The demands of the movement and the government's reaction to these demands have exacerbated the conflict, revealing the intricate interaction of past injustices and socio-political variables in the Baloch autonomy movement (Hashmi, 2015).

Historical animosities, cultural identification and economic greed by the Pakistani state provide impetus to this movement. The Baloch, who are mainly Sunni Muslims and have a unique cultural as well as tribal identity that is important in defining their nationalistic aims (Hashmi, 2015). The fight for self-determination has evolved into a perpetual war and violence within the region, with different separatist groups demanding increased autonomy or even secession (Gopalan, 2022).

Objectives

- To shed light on historical injustice and other socio-political aspects behind the Balochistan autonomy movement.

- In order to demonstrate the function of state institutions in constructing and challenging Baloch identity.
- To gather the Political construction, ethnic identity and aspirations from the government of Pakistan as per Balochistan perception.

Methodology

In this paper, the qualitative methodology has been used to analyse primary and secondary sources that include academic articles journals, books as well in reports. The historical, political and sociocultural factors that have propelled the Balochistan autonomy movement also analysed. Qualitative methodology is appropriate for this study; it provides opportunities to investigate a complex and multi-layered issue of Balochistan autonomy movement in detail. Qualitative research methods are helpful in gaining insights into social phenomena, especially ethnic politics and identity construction or the subjectivity of individuals and groups (Busetto, Wick , & Gumbinger , 2020). The use of primary and secondary sources allows the researcher to access numerous points of view on the Balochistan autonomy however. The primary data has been collected through online interviews from Balochi community, using semi-structured interview guide. The background had traced the historical, political and socio-cultural elements that have led to creation of Balochistan autonomy movement by providing critical conceptual analysis. In general, the qualitative approach is appropriate for this experiment because it gives an in-depth analysis of the autonomy movement Balochistan and its root causes.

Historical Injustices and Socio-political Factors

The main historical injustices that have contributed to the Balochistan autonomy movement are annexation of Kalat state with Pakistan in 1948, which caused resistance from Baluch nationalists (Levesque, 2013)The Baloch identity, envisaged as vetoed by the state and originating from language , culture and territory has been alleged for precipitating an intensified conflict (Levesque, 2013). However, the state of continued repression by Pakistani security forces has radicalized the Baloch nationalist movement that initially was working within a framework of federal constitution to achieve more political rights and fuels ethnic violence and sectarianism in this region (Grare, 2013).

The Baloch community has often demanded a greater degree of autonomy from the central government, lamenting historical grievances concerning minority imbalance and human rights abuse perpetrated by security forces (Tanner, 2019). The Baloch consider their struggle as a quest for the rectification of historical injustices, repression and self-determination (Mendez, 2020). To that end, the different factors in the study have focused on repression of civilian populations and increased military action by Pakistan Army during projection period (Grare, 2013). Some key responses include:

1. Repression: The use of excessive force and human rights violations by the government include extrajudicial executions, forced disappearances which have been perpetrated against Baloch separatists from Pakistan. This has only aggravated the strife and made even more radical than it was a Baloch nationalist movement (Grare, 2013).

2. Negotiations: There have been some negotiations between the government and separatist factions, but these attempts were met with consternation and mistrust among Baloch. The stalling of these talks has further emboldened the call for more autonomy and self-determination in this region (Prasad & Patrick , 2023).

3.Economic development: The government has tried to solve the economic imbalances in Balochistan through focus on development of infrastructure and CPEC i.e. Chinese-Pakistan Economic Corridor (Prasad & Patrick , 2023). Nevertheless, these have not been adequate to address the basic socio-economic causes behind Balochistan autonomy movements (Prasad & Patrick , 2023).

4.Political solutions: The government has been requested to grant true powers to the Balochi people and create a constitutional credible representative of the ruling body called the ‘Baloch government’ in order for it become possible not only reduce violence but also represent this region on national level (Grare, 2013). On the other hand, timidity in giving away relevant powers has only amplified nationalist sentiments (Hashmi, 2015).

Finally, the Pakistani government approach towards Balochistan autonomy movement consisted of suppression, talks, economic development and political settlement. While some of these endeavours were directed to alleviate the systemic socio-political aspects that led participants into movement, others drove conflict and radicalized Baloch nationalist movement.

Role of State Institutions

State institutions have played a vital role in shaping and challenging identity of Baloch. From the other side, this single nationalism promoted by the state through Islam and Urdu has been seen as a threat to Baloch identity (Ahmad, 2018). Meanwhile, the state's unwillingness to bestow real powers on Baloch people only added fuel to the fires of nationalist movement (Ahmad, 2018). Since the demands for greater autonomy were put forward, reaction of the state has been repression and violence that only inflamed conflict. According to recent news reports (Hussain, 2024), The response to the Balochistan autonomy movement by Pakistan's government has been ruthless repression, entailing "kill and dump" policy (Hussain, 2024).

This policy encompasses thousands of ethnic Baloch who are suspected to be either a rebel or support the movement that results in their killing and disappearance. The government is charged with human rights violations concerning Baloch separatists, such as extrajudicial killings and disappearances. The Baloch community have been demonstrating during the custodial killing of a victim Balaach Mola Baksh, who was said to be shot dead while in police custody. The Baloch Solidarity Committee has informed that more than 160 of the protesters have already been released while over one hundred are still in custody, and some missing. To solve the Balochistan issue, merely by addressing its people's socio-economic issues is not enough and all political solution for underlying grievances should be made. This makes the Balochistan autonomy movement a very complicated issue that continues to affect the political and socio-cultural landscape in this region (Hussain, 2024).

As state is not willing for Balochistan as separate identity, as Balochistan is one of largest province of Pakistan. Secondly, the land of Balochistan is vital because of so many factors, one of the reasons is Gwadar (Afaqi & Askari, 2022). The Gwadar Port in Pakistan's Balochistan province is one of the most important parts of the China-Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) and a key element in China's influence on South Asia (foundation, 2018). The port is regarded as a connection to the Belt and Road Initiative and Maritime Silk Road, through which development can be brought to that region (Ismail, 2014). Nevertheless, concerns over the Balochistan autonomy movement have been raised regarding port

impact on tribal and family life of Balos (Ismail, 2014). According to one of the respondents:

"Autonomy of Balochistan actually refers to its long coastal belt and rich for its cultural and tribal values makes it an autonomous province"

The Baloch people have also raised questions as to why there are no major roadways of the latest state-of-the-art design connecting Baluchistan with Afghanistan, which facilitates transportation of contraband and prevents easy trade goods from Gwadar Port to Central Asia Russia through Afghanistan (Ismail, 2014). The Baloch people are demonstrating against the murder of a Balaach Mola Baksh, who was killed in police custody (Hussain, 2024).

The Pakistani government has been blamed for employing disproportionate force and violations of human rights against the Baloch separatists such as extrajudicial killings and forced disappearances (Hussain, 2024). A political solution is required to address the socio-economic discontent and demand for autonomy peculiar of Balochistan Issue (Malik, 2012). As per respondent said:

"Balochistan need to be autonomous in term of everything, that is political construction, and our ethnic values. As we are totally depending on federal government and fighting for our equal rights"

Political construction, ethnic identity and aspirations from the government of Pakistan as per Balochistan perception

The major demands of the Baloch people from Pakistan government have been primarily political and economic autonomy. These have demanded include more cultural, economic and political freedoms to self-determination in some cases or secession coupled with the formation of a sovereign state for Balochistan. A reallocation of power has been attempted by the Baloch people, with the federal government being in control only over certain parts while they have greater influence on their day-to-day lives (Ahmad, 2018). Demands have also included factors that attempt to meet the historical complaints of Baloch nation and absorption in the country (Chan, 2019). However, the Baloch have protested against Islamabad's policies and still remain a separate group untouched by efforts made to include them as part of mainstream Pakistani life (Chan, 2019). Over the years of resistance to authority, demands from Baloch people have been

also shaped by a desire for greater independence and self-governance.

The activist leading the ‘March against Baloch Genocide’ from Turbat to Islamabad, Dr. Mahrang said she knows that “Islamabad will never do justice to Balochs” (Veengas, 2023). She is a victim herself as her father was abducted twice – in 2006 and 2019. Her father, Abdul Ghaffar Lango’s body was mutilated in 2011 as he belonged to a prominent Baloch nationalist activist.

Carrying the marks from early bereavement and extrajudicial killing, when she spoke of her dilemmas, there came out through the depths of her eyes and in words.

“When you ask why my voice is tough; I will tell you it is not hard, but sadness inflicted upon Balochistan from the first day of its annexation with Pakistan” she said.

According to the Express Tribune news, a Baloch activist said:

We require to end forced disappearances and extrajudicial murders. The government should resolve the human rights issues in Balochistan interact with the indigenous people of that area constructively.” – (Asghar, 2023)

According to ANI News, an activist said:

“We want the UN to hold Pakistan responsible for Baloch atrocities. The human rights violations in and around Baluchistan have ground realities that need international attention.” - ANI News

Baloch Activist:

The state turns attacks into a pretext to attack and arrest Baloch activists, protesters. “The practice of abductions followed by disappearances means this is an act that deliberately violates human rights inside Pakistan while seeking to crush our peaceful protests.” - (International, 2022)

Khan Muhammad Shahwani, a Baloch Activist:

“The achievements we had were mass mobilization for the awareness campaign about Balochistan which included arrests, kidnappings, extra judicial killings and violence by Pakistanis; rallies, protests demonstrations to our people why Balochistan is its history current state”- (Paank, 2024)

According to another activist in World social website:

“The Balochistan protests are against the exploitation of forced disappearances, extrajudicial killings and other state crimes by which we appeal to stop repression in Baluchistan”- (Zayar, 2023)

The conflict is of Balochistan autonomy movement which individuals experience deep historical injustice and fight for recognition. Many participants understand the Baloch people have been oppressed for decades, as their struggle is intended at a collective goal of reversion or rebirth in establishing historical redress and rightful place within state itself. As one of the respondents said:

“People of Balochistan just need reassurance and aiming for harmonious resolution, positive exchange of views they are just demanding for their rights because after facing so much brutality their lost members lead them for this protest which is their right to show their grievances”

Another participant said:

We Balochi’s are always neglected by the government and really wanted to be treated equally”

The proponents of the Balochistan autonomy movement regard increased control as a mechanism through which they are putting their community ahead. In spite of their complaints and grievances, the participants in Balochistan autonomy movement hopes for peaceful dialogue with government is often expressed. It is their conviction that there could be a negotiated peace based on rectification of historical wrongs, cultural and economic rights as well as some shared identity within the multicultural tapestry of Pakistan. In short, the views of participants concerning Balochistan autonomy movement are based on a number of interwoven historical stories embedded in aspirations for control and power through cultural preservation, economic justice resistance towards perceived abuses to pursue genuine inclusive governance. Their contribution to the movement symbolizes an effort towards building a future where Baloch people can live with other ethnic groups under the foreground of Pakistani state.

Challenges for Baloch Autonomy Movement

The Balochistan autonomy movement has several challenges, such as divisions within the group; lack of paramilitary strength and sustainable financial backing. The movement is also weak and splintered, while most Baloch people prefer greater autonomy rather than the more radical stance of secession (Chan, 2019). The struggle has been motivated by historical resentments such as suppression of the Baloch nationalist movement undertaken by Pakistani security forces, resulting in ethnic and sectarian violence along with a new evolving militant Islamists insurgency (Noor & Ajmal, 2020).

The present situation of Balochistan autonomy movement seems to be a prevalence wishing for more self-rule by the majority sought as not declaring independence. The demands of the movement have been an increase in revenue as its province and referendum to self-determination. Historical issues, such as the oppression of Baloch nationalism in Pakistan by security forces and subsequent ethnic strife within the province have driven this uprising (Ahmar, 2017). According to respondent:

“My views about the people are that they should not be deprived from their legal rights, conflict should be resolve as soon as possible so that it might lead to something prosperous and productive, if it won't be resolved it will cause sever challenges not just for a single province but for the entire country”

Another respondent said:

“Balochistan people only want justice and this the right of every one to live”

The range of demands tabled by the Baloch nationalist movement have ranged from greater cultural, economic and political rights to autonomy under Pakistan rule or separation entirely with an independent statehood for Balochistan (Kucecz, 2016). This development happened about ten years ago with the emergence of an organized, lethal insurgency and a general consolidation of Baloch armed groups especially following establishment of BRAS alliance (Kucecz, 2016).

However, the movement is viewed as secular and predominantly leftist Marxism. Despite the increasingly severe repression, the movement continues to engender conversation in wider Pakistani society and enjoys support of a majority among Baloch (Grare, 2013). The movement's leaders have asked for a genuine, reliable Baloch government to revive the local control over the province and contain violence as well as represent them in federal arena. The fate of the movement is still unclear since it struggles with repression coupled with internal disputes and a lack of military power strength and economic funding.

Conclusion

Balochistan autonomy movement is an intricate problem that includes historical injustices, socio-political factors along with the role played by state institutions to form and contest over alien ethnic identity. This problem requires a complex analysis that takes into account historical, political and sociocultural aspects. Political anthropology stance

can shed light on how the Baloch people relate to the Pakistani state and how they coexist in a larger socio-cultural landscape. It can also offer new insights on the ways in which power is negotiated and contested with regards to the Balochistan autonomy movement. It is also beneficial to know how the Baloch nationalist movement splits into different separatist groups seeking more autonomy or even independence. This paper adds to the academic debate on political anthropology, ethnic politics and identity construction in Pakistani context. It is emphasized that a more sensitive approach should be taken into consideration while dealing with challenges faced by Baloch region.

Bibliography

- Afaqi, T., & Askari, M. U. (2022). China Pakistan Economic Corridor (cpec) regional integration and challenges. *Khaldunia - Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(1), 21-35. doi:10.36755/khaldunia.v2i1.35
- Ahmad, Z. (2018). The Baloch and identity – How Pakistan dealt with the question of identities; Balochistan and Gwadar Port. *South Asian Journal*(25). Retrieved from <https://southasiajournal.net/the-baloch-and-identity-how-pakistan-dealt-with-the-question-of-identities-balochistan-and-gwadar-port/>
- Ahmar, M. (2017). Conflict Transformation as a Policy Change in South Asia: A Case Study of Balochistan. *Journal of South Asian and Middle Eastern Studies*, 40(3), 57-73. doi:10.1353/jsa.2017.0001
- Asghar, N. (2023, Dec 24). *Govt take dialogue path with Baloch protestors*. Retrieved from The Express Tribune: <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2451015/govt-take-dialogue-path-with-baloch-protestors>
- Busetto, L., Wick, W., & Gumbinger, C. (2020). How to use and assess qualitative research methods. *Neurological Research and Practice*, 14(2). doi:<https://doi.org/10.1186/s42466-020-00059-z>
- Chan, M. H. (2019). The Belt and Road Initiative – the New Silk Road: a research agenda. *Journal of Contemporary East Asia Studies*, 72(7), 1-20. doi:10.1080/24761028.2019.1580407
- foundation, S. (2018, June 15). *CPEC and the Gwadar Port*. Retrieved from Synergia foundation: <https://www.synergiafoundation.org/insights/analyses-assessments/cpec-and-gwadar-port>
- Gopalan, K. R. (2022). The Genesis of Baloch Nationalism: Politics and Ethnicity in Pakistan, 1947–1977. *Asian Affairs an American review*, 49(3), 169-171.

- doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/00927678.2022.2110676>
- Grare, F. (2013, April 11). *Balochistan: The State Versus the Nation*. Retrieved from Carnegie: <https://carnegieendowment.org/2013/04/11/balochistan-state-versus-nation-pub-51488>
- Hashmi, R. S. (2015). Baloch Ethnicity: An analysis of the issue and conflict with state. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan; Lahore*, 52(1). Retrieved from <https://www.proquest.com/docview/1738072440?sourcetype=Scholarly%20Journals>
- Hussain, A. (2024, January 9). 'Kill and dump policy': Baloch protest man's custodial murder in Pakistan. Retrieved from Al-Jazeera: <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/1/9/kill-and-dump-policy-baloch-protest-mans-custodial-murder-in-pakistan>
- International, A. (2022). *Human Rights in Pakistan*. Retrieved from Amnesty International: <https://www.amnesty.org/en/location/asia-and-the-pacific/south-asia/pakistan/>
- Ismail, M. (2014). Geostrategic Importance of Balochistan: Baloch Insurgency and the Global Politics of Energy Resources. *Journal of Political Studies*, 26.
- Kupecz, M. (2016, May). Pakistan's Baloch Insurgency: History, Conflict Drivers, and Regional Implications. *The International Affair Review*. doi:<https://www.iar-gwu.org/print-archive/8er0x982v5pj129srhre98ex6u8v8n>
- Levesque, J. (2013). Managing Diversity in Pakistan: Nationalism, Ethnic Politics and Cultural Resistance [review essay]. *South Asia Multidisciplinary Academic Journal*, 150. doi:<https://doi.org/10.4000/samaj.3551>
- Malik, H. Y. (2012). Strategic Importance of Gwadar Port. *Journal of Political Studies*, 19(2), 57-69.
- Mendez, Z. H. (2020). Repression and Revolt in Balochistan: The Uncertainty and Survival of a People's National Aspirations. *Journal of Indo-Pacific Affairs*, Air University Press.
- Noor, S., & Ajmal, A. (2020). Balochistan Reconciliation. *SSRN*. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3702972>
- Paank. (2024, January 15). *Testimony of Survival: Khan Muhammad Shahwani's Survival Against the Kill and Dump Policy in Balochistan*. Retrieved from Paank: <https://paank.org/testimony-of-survival-khan-muhammad-shahwanis-survival-against-the-kill-and-dump-policy-in-balochistan/>
- Prasad, H., & Patrick, W. S. (2023, January 24). *Pakistan Faces Rising Separatist Insurgency in Balochistan*. Retrieved from New line Institute: <https://newlinesinstitute.org/nonstate-actors/pakistan-faces-rising-separatist-insurgency-in-balochistan/>
- Tanner, T. (2019). Explaining the Resilience of the Balochistan Insurgency Explaining the Resilience of the Balochistan Insurgency (Thesis). *DigitalCommons@UMaine*, 1-73. Retrieved from <https://digitalcommons.library.umaine.edu/honors/533>
- Veengas. (2023). *Pakistan: Baloch Women Brave Threats To Protest Against Extrajudicial Killings, Forced Disappearances*. Karachi: The Wire.
- Zayar. (2023, Dec 11). *Mass protests continue in Pakistan's Balochistan province over extrajudicial killings and other state crimes*. Retrieved from World social website: <https://www.wsws.org/en>