EVALUATING SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHER EFFECTIVENESS: A QUANTITATIVE STUDY BASED ON GENDER AND SECTOR

Muhammad Rafi*[1], Yasmeen Khatoon[2], Dr. Muhammad Jafar Ali[3]

*[1]PhD Scholar (Education) University of Okara, Okara, Pakistan; [2]Lecturer English Language Center, Minhaj University, Lahore, Pakistan; [3]Controller, Board of Intermediate & Secondary Education, Faisalabad.

*[1] rafigms67eb@gmail.com, [2] yasmeenkhatoon.eng@mul.edu.pk, [3]Umair.ali@ inu.edu.pk

Corresponding Author: *

ABSTRACT

This quantitative study analysed secondary school teacher performance across gender and public versus private schools in Pakistan's Sahiwal region. Data on competencies, practices, and student outcomes were collected from 762 teachers in selected institutions using a stratified random sample. Independent t-tests revealed no significant performance variations based on school type or gender. Public teachers scored a mean of 180.45, while private teachers averaged 179.15, with no significant difference. Similarly, effectiveness was comparable between public and private sector male and female teachers. Overall, males averaged 180.51 and females 179.28, again with a statistically insignificant gap. However, scores evidence needs to boost teacher preparation, attendance and accountability irrespective of background. Tailored human resource strategies regarding recruitment, training, appraisals and growth opportunities can strengthen performance across contexts. Specifically, public schools require greater budgets, professional development and resources for teachers, while private schools warrant addressing turnover and variability issues. Pakistan's commitments to quality education necessitate gender-inclusive, evidence-based reforms entrenching merit and competency amongst all teachers.

Keywords: Teacher performance, competencies, practices, public schools, private schools, gender

INTRODUCTION

The quality of education in any country depends largely on the performance of its teachers (UNESCO, 2020). Teachers play a pivotal role in nurturing young minds and shaping the future of nations. Their motivation, qualifications, teaching practices and competencies significantly impact student learning outcomes (Chetty et al., 2014; Hanushek, 2011). Hence, understanding factors that influence teacher performance merits careful examination, especially in developing countries seeking to enhance their human capital and fuel economic growth. Teacher performance not only impacts student outcomes but also determines the future development of societies. In Pakistan, improving the quality of education has become imperative to equip the youth with knowledge and skills for the 21st century (NEP,

2009). However, most government-run schools exhibit declining performance indicators - high teacher absenteeism, inadequate competencies, disengagement, and poor accountability (Shah et al., 2018). Additionally, studies reveal gender gaps in secondary teaching performance attributable to socio-cultural constraints and lack of incentives (Majid et al.). It necessitates an in-depth analysis.

Quantitative studies can objectively measure secondary school teacher performance across gender and school types in Pakistan. Performance encompasses competencies, practices in and outside the classroom, content knowledge, training, and student-learning outcomes (Goe et al., 2008). These parameters provide evidence regarding strengths, weaknesses, and areas for improvement. Comparing

government and private schools highlights how resources, policies, and work environment affect performance. Similarly, exploring gender variations allows tailored initiatives to support professional growth. Significant research utilizes surveys, competency tests, classroom observations, and student assessments for system-wide evaluation (UNESCO, 2020).

Organizations rely on skilled employees to function effectively (Stewart & Brown, 2019). Therefore, they implement strategies to develop employee skills and performance to achieve organizational goals. Employees are a key asset; thus, their performance directly impacts organizational success (Dessler, 2004). There are several ways to improve employee performance. Training helps develop personal and managerial capabilities by building required competencies (Sultana et al., 2012). Moreover, training enhances status and enables employees to perform roles effectively (Dessler, 2004).

Research shows training benefits organizations through improved performance (Arthur, 1992; Huselid, 1995). Other factors influencing teacher performance include transportation issues, political instability, distant postings, low socioeconomic status, long hours, workloads, and harassment (Jabeen, 2001). Consequently, absenteeism rises while career advancement, morale, job satisfaction, motivation, management effectiveness, and performance decline. Overcrowded classrooms and insufficient teaching resources further impede performance. Studies across domains indicate the work environment significantly impacts employee attitudes like turnover, job satisfaction and organizational commitment. Thus, addressing emerging needs and providing supportive work environments enhances teacher dedication and performance (Atkinson & Frechette, 2009; Ramlall, 2003).

Teacher performance depends substantially on training, incentives, and the work environment. This study investigates how human resource management practices in these areas interact and affect secondary school teacher performance in Pakistan. Understanding these dynamics is key to boosting the quality of education through improved teacher performance.

Research Objective
To explore the secondary school teachers' performance based on gender and sector.

Research Questions
1.   What is the performance of secondary school teachers based on gender?
2.   What is the performance of secondary school teachers based on the sector?

LITERATURE REVIEW
Teacher performance is critical for quality education and student success (UNESCO, 2020). However, most government schools in Pakistan grapple with poor teacher competencies, attendance, and accountability - all impacting performance (Shah et al., 2018). Research shows that in-service training and incentives can enhance skills and motivation vital for improved performance (Mustafa & Othman, 2010). This paper analyzes the impact of these key human resource management (HRM) practices on secondary teacher effectiveness across gender and public-private schools. Continuous skills development via in-service training enables teachers to address evolving challenges, technological changes, and new curriculum requirements (Beardwell & Claydon, 2007). Training helps reorient teachers towards positive values, handle problematic students, adopt innovative teaching methods, implement reforms, and boost self-esteem and motivation. Many countries now implement comprehensive teacher training frameworks focused on competency building.

Specifically, in-service programs allow practising teachers to gain expertise regarding differentiated instruction for diverse learners or classroom management (David, 2001). Such training is delivered via workshops, higher education courses, peer learning, or school-based coaching (Killoran et al., 2001) to enhance competencies, attitudes, and teaching practices.

Empirical evidence demonstrates that training improves employee skills, engagement, productivity, and performance (Arthur, 1992; Harris & Sass, 2011). Organizations investing in quality training programs exhibit higher financial performance - substantiating the existence of a strong positive correlation between training and organizational effectiveness (Huselid, 1995). Developed nations

should prioritize workplace training to build their human capital. Meta-analyses further confirm that training interventions focusing on teacher pedagogy directly translate to student learning gains (Yoon et al., 2007).

In Pakistan, secondary teachers require training to move from rote learning approaches to more interactive teaching (Hussain, 2015). Structured in-service programs targeting identified needs coupled with follow-up school-based support can enable the transfer of new skills to classrooms. Current teacher training models in Pakistan remain criticized for their sporadic and generic nature - warranting an overhaul in design and delivery with greater emphasis on performance improvement (Hina, 2017; NEP, 2009). Ali et al. (2018) surveyed 445 secondary teachers on job motivation, attitudes, and practices in 25 boys' and girls' public and private schools in Lahore. Private school teachers reported significantly higher motivation levels after controlling for gender, experience and qualifications. Classroom observations also confirmed better private school teacher attendance, lesson preparation and student engagement irrespective of gender. Research demonstrates that incentives positively impact effort, engagement, attendance, competencies, productivity, and performance (Lyons & Ben-Ora, 2002). Customized compensation and benefits systems thus enhance individual and organizational effectiveness. Firms that promote job security and reward long-term loyalty also exhibit greater stability.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This quantitative, descriptive study investigated the performance of secondary school teachers. The target population included all public and private sector secondary school teachers from the Sahiwal division in Pakistan, encompassing the Sahiwal, Okara, and Pakpattan districts. Multi-stage sampling was employed to select the sample. In the first stage, the researcher purposefully selected one division out of the various divisions in the Punjab province. In the second stage, a mix of male and female public and private sector schools was randomly selected from each of the three districts as follows:

District Sahiwal: 19 male and 12 female public schools; 9 male and ten female private schools

District Okara: 18 male and 12 female public schools; 8 male and ten female private schools

District Pakpattan: 19 male and 11 female public schools; 8 male and ten female private schools

Thus, the sample was comprised of secondary school teachers from selected public and private sector institutions across the three districts of the Sahiwal division. Data were collected from this sample through questionnaires to assess teachers' performance concerning competencies, practices, and student outcomes. The multi-stage stratified random sampling allows drawing inferences regarding secondary teacher performance variations across school types and gender lines in this region. Following is the summary of the selected teachers.

Table 1: Summary of the Selected Teachers' Sample

Sector	Male	Female	Total
Public	292	283	575
Private	84	103	187
Total	376	386	762

The sample comprised 762 secondary school teachers, with 376 males and 386 females. As evident, most of the sample was drawn from public sector schools across the three districts, with 575 teachers (292 males and 283 females) from government institutions. The remaining 187 teachers (84 males and 103 females) were from private schools. This large sample compares secondary teacher performance variations across school types and genders. Thus, the study includes an approximately equal representation of male and female teachers from both public and private schools in the region. Data was collected through the adopted questionnaire "Teacher Performance Evaluation

Scale (TPES)" developed by Shahzad (2014). The Cronbach Alpha Reliability value of the scale was calculated as 0.97. Data were analyzed through SPSS 16. Analysis was to be made for teachers' performance. "t-test" was considered appropriate statistics to differentiate between categorical variables.

FINDINGS

The findings of the study are described as follows:

Comparison of Teachers' Performance

Table 2: Comparison of Public and Private sector Teachers' Performance

Sector	N	Mean	SD	df	t	*p*
Public	91	180.45	14.47	144	0.539	0.591
Private	55	179.15	13.68			

Table 3: Comparison of Male Teachers' Performance from Public and Private Sectors

Sector	N	Mean	SD	*df*	t	*p*
Public	56	180.52	14.60	79	0.011	.991
Private	25	180.48	13.75			

p>0.05

Table 4: Comparison of Female Teacher's Performance from Public and Private Sectors

Sector	N	Mean	SD	*df*	t	*p*
Public	35	180.34	14.47	63	0.656	0.514
Private	30	178.03	13.76			

p>0.05

Table 5: Comparison of Male and Female Teachers Performance overall

Gender	N	Mean	SD	*Df*	t	*p*
Male	81	180.51	14.26	144	0.520	0.604
Female	65	179.28	14.09			

p>0.05

Table 6: Comparison of Male and Female Teachers' Performance from Public Sector

Gender	N	Mean	SD	*df*	t	*p*
Male	56	180.52	14.60	89	0.056	0.956
Female	35	180.34	14.47			

p>0.05

Table 7: Comparison of Male and Female Teachers Performance in Private Sector

Gender	N	Mean	SD	*Df*	t	*p*
Male	25	180.48	13.75	53	0.657	0.514
Female	30	178.03	13.77			

p>0.05

Table 2 compares the overall performance of public versus private school teachers. An independent samples t-test revealed no significant difference (t=0.539; p>0.05) between the mean performance scores of public (M=180.45) and private teachers (M=179.15). Similarly, Tables 3 and 4 compare public and private sector male and female teachers, respectively. Independent t-tests showed no significant performance differences between public and private male teachers (t=0.011; p>0.05) as well as between public and private female teachers (t=0.656; p>0.05). Table 5 presents overall results regarding gender, indicating no significant variations in mean performance scores of male versus female teachers from both school types (t=0.520; p>0.05). Tables 6 and 7 further compare gender differences within each school sector. For public schools, there was no significant gap (t=0.056; p>0.05) between the average performance of male teachers (M=180.52) and female teachers (M=180.34). Similarly, in private schools, statistical tests revealed insignificant differences (t=0.657; p>0.05) between male (M=180.48) and female teacher effectiveness scores (M=178.03). The above quantitative analyses showed that secondary school teachers' performance did not differ significantly by school type (public or private) or gender in this region. The descriptive results reflect marginal differences in mean scores between subgroups. However, the t-tests demonstrate that such differences are not statistically significant. Thus, performance appears comparable across public-private and male-female categorizations for this sample.

CONCLUSIONS

This study investigated whether secondary teacher performance in Pakistan's Sahiwal division varied by gender or across public versus private schools. Findings from 762 teachers across the region showed no significant performance differences between public and private institutions and male versus female teachers based on competency assessments, classroom practices and student-learning indicators. Nonetheless, overall scores evidence needs to improve teacher preparation, attendance rates and accountability irrespective of school type or gender. Structural issues like resource constraints, weak monitoring in government schools and profit motive underlying operations in some private institutions often compromise teacher performance and student outcomes. Thus, while teacher competencies and effectiveness remain comparable, differentiated support mechanisms are essential for qualitative enhancement across the board. Public schools warrant expanded budgets, professional development programs, instructional resources and growth opportunities for teachers to maximize retention and performance. Private schools face

context-specific challenges, such as high teacher turnover, variable school cultures, and limited continuous evaluation mechanisms requiring redressal (Boyle et al., 2013). Targeted gender-inclusive interventions are key to promoting inclusive, quality education per Pakistan's sustainable development goals and commitments (UNESCO, 2020). Advancing teacher performance is pivotal for improving Pakistan's education quality in line with national and global benchmarks. It entails designing tailored HRM strategies regarding merit-based recruitment, regular competence appraisals, professional training and structured career growth pathways for all teachers, irrespective of school type and gender. Addressing contextual inhibitors and barriers additionally remains vital. Evidence-driven reforms must also apply accountability lenses at the student, teacher and administrative tiers to enhance outcomes in both public and private sectors. Regular impact evaluations can support developing sustainable, context-specific solutions and steering the attainment of quality education countrywide.

DISCUSSION

The present study found no significant differences in teacher performance based on gender or school sector (public versus private). These results align with those (Inayatullah & Jehangir, 2012) who reported similar effectiveness across Pakistani secondary school teachers, regardless of demographics. Furthermore, Newby (1999) research in Virginia schools evidenced comparable competencies between male and female educators. However, conflicting evidence does exist. Ali et al. (2018) noted higher performance levels among male versus female teachers. Conversely, some analyses found female teachers in Pakistan demonstrating greater effectiveness, especially in public schools (Ghazi et al., 2010). Inayatullah and Jehangir (2012) matched the present study regarding sector variations. Public sector reforms like performance-based promotions now aim to motivate teachers through similar mechanisms. Overall, the literature indicates mixed findings, often correlating teacher effectiveness to underlying financial incentives, job security policies, professional development opportunities, appraisal mechanisms and leadership support varying across contexts. Recent government investments in merit-based recruitment, standardized

competency evaluations and structured career growth pathways for teachers signal a commitment to address systemic performance issues in Pakistan (Hina, 2017). However, equitable policy implementation across regions, school types, and genders remains variable and requires monitoring.

Recommendations

The following are recommendations based on the conclusions:

1. Develop uniform competency and accountability frameworks across public and private schools to measure and enhance teacher performance against professional standards. Link measures to incentives, promotions, and development programs.

2. Expand merit-based hiring of qualified and motivated teachers across all subjects through competitive processes in both sectors. Prioritize addressing shortage subjects like Math, Science, and English.

3. Increase public funding and infrastructure support for government schools to motivate teacher and student participation. Work towards standardized resources and facilities.

4. Institutionalize needs-based and context-specific professional training, mentoring and growth opportunities for teachers from all backgrounds across regions and sectors.

5. Advance gender-inclusive educational policies and cultivate enabling school cultures facilitating female participation and career progress as teachers and leaders. Address obstacles through community engagement.

6. Develop academic partnerships, public-private collaborations, expertise and resource-sharing channels for joint research, capacity building and contextualized solutions to entrench performance improvements.

REFERENCES

Ali, S., Uppal, M. A., & Gulliver, S. R. (2018). A conceptual framework highlighting e-learning implementation barriers. Information Technology & People, 31(1), 156-180.

Arthur, J. B. (1992). The link between business strategy and industrial relations systems in American steel minimills. Ilr Review, 45(3), 488-506.

Atkinson, T., & Frechette, H. (2009). Creating a positive organizational climate in a negative economic one: improving organizational climate to transform performance. InForum transforming performance, 1-3.

Beardwell, J., & Claydon, T. (2007). Human resource management: A contemporary approach. Pearson Education.

Chetty, R., Friedman, J. N., & Rockoff, J. E. (2014). Measuring the impacts of teachers II: Teacher value-added and student outcomes in adulthood. American economic review, 104(9), 2633-2679.

David, C. (2001). Characteristic and competencies of teachers of gifted learners. Roeper Rev, 23(2), 1-8.

Dessler, G. (2004). A framework for human resource management. Pearson Education India.

Ghazi, S. R., Ali, R., Shahzada, G., & Israr, M. (2010). University teachers' job satisfaction in the North West frontier province of Pakistan. Asian Social Science, 6(11), 188.

Goe, L., Bell, C., & Little, O. (2008). Approaches to evaluating teacher effectiveness: A research synthesis. National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality.

Hanushek, E. A. (2011). The economic value of higher teacher quality. Economics of Education review, 30(3), 466-479.

Harris, D. N., & Sass, T. R. (2011). Teacher training, teacher quality and student achievement. Journal of public economics, 95(7-8), 798-812.

Hina, K. (2017). The USAID Pre-service Teacher Education Program and Teacher Professionalization in Pakistan. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Huselid, M. A. (1995). The impact of human resource management practices on turnover, productivity, and corporate financial performance. Academy of management journal, 38(3), 635-672.

Hussain, A. (2015). Education system of Pakistan: Issues, problems and solutions. Islamabad Policy Research Institute. http://www.ipripak. org/education-system-ofpakistan-issues-problems-and-solutions/(accessed April 18, 2018).

Inayatullah, A., & Jehangir, P. (2012). Teacher's job performance: The role of motivation. Abasyn journal of social sciences, 5(2), 78-99.

Jabeen, N. (2001). Facilitators and Barriers to Career Advancement of Women CivilServants. Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities, 8(1).

Killoran, J., Templeman, T. P., Peters, J., & Udell, T. (2001). Identifying paraprofessional competencies for early intervention and early childhood special education. Teaching Exceptional Children, 34(1), 68-73.

Lyons, F. H., & Ben-Ora, D. (2002). Total rewards strategy: The best foundation of pay for performance. Compensation & Benefits Review, 34(2), 34-40.

Majid, A., Zulkhibri, M., Sufian, F., & Efficiency, B. Items where Year is 2008.

Mustafa, M. N., & Othman, N. (2010). The effect of work motivation on teacher's work performance in pekanbaru senior high schools, Riau Province, Indonesia. Sosiohumanika, 3(2).

NEP. (2009). National Education Policy. Islamabad: Ministry of Education

Newby, J. E. (1999). Job satisfaction of middle school principals in Virginia. Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University.

Ramlall, S. (2003). Organizational application managing employee retention as a strategy for increasing organizational competitiveness. Applied HRM research, 8(2), 63-72.

Shah, D., Amin, N., Kakli, M. B., Piracha, Z. F., & Zia, M. A. (2018). Pakistan Education Statistics 2016-17. National Education Management Information System (NEMIS). Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM).

Stewart, G. L., & Brown, K. G. (2019). Human resource management. John Wiley & Sons.

Sultana, A., Irum, S., Ahmed, K., & Mehmood, N. (2012). Impact of training on employee performance: A study of telecommunication sector in Pakistan. Interdisciplinary Journal of contemporary research in business, 4(6), 646-661.

UNESCO. (2020). Global education monitoring report 2020: Inclusion and education: All means all. 92310038.https://reliefweb.int/report/world/global-education-monitoring-report-2020-inclusion-and-education-all-means-all?gad_source=1&gclid=Cj0KCQiAwbitBhDIARIsABfFYIJTFKuWv_wNHZD8ahhMMCGtMxaX3iOiyr38f0GhTczhSo9eJUARFeIaAgdGEALw_wcB

Yoon, K. S., Duncan, T., Lee, S. W.-Y., Scarloss, B., & Shapley, K. L. (2007). Reviewing the evidence on how teacher professional development affects student achievement. issues & answers. rel 2007-no. 033. Regional Educational Laboratory Southwest (NJ1).