

PAKISTAN'S INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL NON-KINETIC THREATS IN THE 21ST CENTURY FINDING THE WAY OUT

Muhammad Ibtasam Ali Shah
Master of Science in International Relations
ibtaxam@gmail.com

Article History: Received on 10th May, 2023, Revised on 19th June 2023, Accepted on 10 June, 2023, Published on 30th June 2023

Abstract

Globalization has considerably transformed the nature of wars. The conflict has shifted from military to non-military forms, with weapons being replaced by words. Several studies have examined the evolving trends in warfare, which have progressed from gunpowder to technology and now, to non-kinetic warfare. Non-kinetic warfare includes economic warfare, psychological warfare, cyber warfare, Artificial Intelligence, and non-traditional warfare-related threats. Pakistan is prepared to counter any threats from its adversaries. This research aims to explore the evolving trends in hybrid warfare and its impact on Pakistan's national security and foreign policy strategies. It will begin with an overview of the essence and origins of the evolution of warfare and explain the essence of hybrid warfare. The review of existing scientific literature will highlight the views and ideas of scholars and experts on Non-kinetic warfare, hybrid warfare, and 5th-generation warfare, including their challenges. Using the Qualitative Method, the researcher analyzes the situation in Pakistan and addresses the situation. The research findings suggest that Pakistan faces numerous kinetic and non-kinetic threats from adversaries such as India and the US, among which Non-kinetic threats pose the greatest danger. To protect itself from non-kinetic warfare and its threats, Pakistan must enhance its governance, military power, and technology. These measures will help the government address Non-kinetic warfare and ensure its security in the future.

Keywords: Non-kinetic warfare, Information warfare, Pakistan, India, US, Israel

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan, like many other nations in the 21st century, faces a range of non-kinetic threats distinct from traditional military threats. These threats, which include challenges to the country's economic, political, and social stability, are often subtler and difficult to address than conventional military threats. Pakistan is a country facing various non-kinetic threats that are detrimental to its national security and stability. Economic instability is one of the most significant challenges that the country faces (Bashir & Hussain, 2021). The country has struggled with economic growth and development, with many of its citizens living below the poverty line (International Monetary Fund, 2020). The COVID-19 pandemic has further exacerbated these challenges, resulting in high unemployment, inflation, and rising debt. Moreover, the country's dependence on foreign aid and investment makes it vulnerable to economic pressure from external actors (Bakhtyar, 2021). Political instability is another significant non-kinetic threat that

Pakistan faces (Ali, 2021). The country has a history of frequent changes in government and military rule. Corruption and cronyism are widespread, eroding public trust in the government and contributing to a lack of political stability. The presence of extremist groups and their political allies further complicates the situation, with the use of violence and intimidation to achieve political goals (Chohan, 2017).

Social instability is also a crucial non-kinetic threat facing Pakistan in the 21st century (Raza, 2023). The country is characterized by significant social inequality, widespread poverty, limited access to education and healthcare, and a lack of social mobility. Discrimination against religious and ethnic minorities is also a persistent problem, contributing to social tension and conflict. Extremist groups use social grievances to gain support and recruit new members, exacerbating social instability (Bukhari, 2021). Besides internal non-kinetic threats, Pakistan faces external non-

kinetic threats, mainly from India and the United States (HALI et al., 2020). India poses a significant external threat, with ongoing border disputes and concerns about Indian support for separatist movements within Pakistan. The United States and other Western powers also pose a threat, with concerns about drone strikes, economic sanctions, and other forms of pressure (Haider & Shaukat, 2021). To address these non-kinetic threats, Pakistan must pursue a comprehensive strategy that addresses both internal and external challenges. The strategy should prioritize promoting economic development, improving political stability and accountability, addressing social inequality, and strengthening the rule of law. At the same time, Pakistan needs to build stronger relationships with its neighbors and the international community, which will help to reduce external threats.

INTERNAL THREATS

Pakistan faces a range of internal non-kinetic threats in the 21st century that affect its stability and security. Some of these threats include:

Political Instability: Political instability has been a persistent problem in Pakistan for several decades, which has had a profound impact on the country's political, economic, and social development. The country has witnessed frequent changes in governments, military coups, political assassinations, and ethnic and sectarian violence, all of which have contributed to the erosion of state institutions and the weakening of democratic processes (Malik, 2019). The most recent example of political instability in Pakistan was the opposition's campaign against the incumbent government, which lasted for several months and resulted in widespread protests, violence, and political polarization (Hussain, 2021). Political instability in Pakistan has been a persistent problem for several decades. The general thinking about political instability in Pakistan is complex and varies depending on the political views and perspectives of different individuals and groups within the country field (Hussain & Ayesha, 2021). Some people view political instability in Pakistan as a result of corruption, weak democratic institutions, and frequent military interventions in politics. They argue that Pakistan's political system is characterized by a lack of accountability, with politicians and bureaucrats often using their power for personal gain rather than serving the

public interest. Others see political instability in Pakistan as a consequence of external factors, including interference by foreign powers and the destabilizing influence of regional conflicts such as the war in Afghanistan (Alam & Sadiq, 2020). Many Pakistanis are frustrated with the frequent changes in government, lack of political stability, and ongoing economic challenges, which they believe are hindering the country's development and progress.

The country has experienced numerous military coups, political assassinations, and governmental crises. The country's democratic institutions are often weak and have struggled to gain a strong foothold due to the frequent interference of the military in the political affairs field. This instability has resulted in a lack of continuity in government policies, leading to a lack of progress on many pressing issues facing the country, such as economic development and the social welfare field (Rafi et al., 2021). Non-kinetic warfare has emerged as a significant challenge for Pakistan due to its political instability. Non-kinetic warfare tactics, such as cyber-attacks, propaganda, and disinformation campaigns, have been used to destabilize the country and exacerbate existing conflicts. For example, foreign actors have targeted Pakistan's infrastructure and institutions through cyber-attacks, leading to significant economic and security damage (Khan, 2021). Political instability in Pakistan has been a longstanding issue that has had a detrimental impact on the country's development and security. The persistence of political instability has created an environment that is vulnerable to non-kinetic warfare, which poses a significant threat to Pakistan's national security. Addressing political instability and strengthening state

Economic Instability: Pakistan has been facing a serious economic crisis for several years, which has had a significant impact on the country's socioeconomic conditions. The crisis has been further exacerbated by political instability and rising debt, which have contributed to a decline in economic growth and increased inflation rates (Hussain, 2023). Political instability has been one of the major factors contributing to Pakistan's economic crisis. According to the (*The Current Situation in Pakistan*), political instability and a lack of political consensus have led to an uncertain economic environment, which has negatively affected both domestic and foreign investment

in the country. This, in turn, has resulted in a reduction in economic growth and increased unemployment rates. In addition to political instability, rising debt has also played a significant role in Pakistan's economic crisis. Pakistan's debt has risen sharply in recent years, which has put considerable strain on the country's finances. This has led to a decrease in foreign exchange reserves, a depreciation of the Pakistani rupee, and a surge in inflation rates (Ahmad, 2023). Moreover, high inflation and a depreciating currency have further worsened Pakistan's economic crisis. Pakistan's persistent inflation and currency devaluation have contributed to a reduction in purchasing power, which has affected businesses and households alike. This has also led to an increase in the cost of essential goods, which has made it difficult for people to make ends meet (Raza, 2023). To mitigate the economic crisis, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) recently approved a \$6 billion loan to Pakistan, which could provide a much-needed boost to the country's economy. The loan is conditional on Pakistan's commitment to implementing structural reforms, which include increasing revenue collection, reducing public expenditure, and improving the business environment (A. Ahmad, 2023). If the Pakistani govt uses it as it the government is highly corrupt, and it is doubtful that they will use it as the condition per IMF. Pakistan's economic crisis is a complex issue with multiple contributing factors. Political instability, rising debt, high inflation, and a depreciating currency are some of the key challenges that the country needs to address to restore its economic stability (Raza, 2023).

Terrorism And Extremism: Pakistan has been a victim of terrorism and extremism for many years, resulting in immense loss of life and property damage. However, it is important to understand that Pakistan is not the only country facing these challenges. In fact, many countries across the world are struggling with terrorism and extremism. Therefore, Pakistan's efforts to counter these issues need to be appreciated (Feyyaz, 2015). Pakistan's counterterrorism policy needs to be critically analyzed to understand its effectiveness. The government has made significant efforts to combat terrorism, including military operations against extremist groups. As a result, the security situation in the country has improved in recent years. However, the threat of terrorism still looms large, and more needs to be done to address the root causes of extremism. One of the major challenges Pakistan faces is

the presence of sectarian violence. Sectarian groups have been targeting members of different religious and ethnic communities, resulting in a significant loss of life and property damage (Khan, 2022; Soherwordi, 2010). The sectarian violence in Pakistan is primarily fueled by differences in religious beliefs and practices. Many sectarian groups in the country hold extreme religious views and are intolerant of other religious groups, which has led to violent clashes between different communities. These groups often use violence as a means to assert their dominance and influence over others and to impose their own religious beliefs on the rest of society (Javai, 2020). The impact of terrorism and extremism on Pakistan's socioeconomic development cannot be ignored. It has had a negative impact on the country's economic growth, as well as its social fabric (Malik, 2019). Therefore, it is important to address these issues comprehensively, by focusing on promoting education and tolerance, as well as addressing poverty, inequality, and social injustice.

EXTERNAL THREATS

Pakistan faces a range of external non-kinetic threats in the 21st century, including:

Psychological Warfare: Psychological warfare is a non-traditional warfare tactic used by governments, political organizations, advocacy groups, military personnel, and civilian persons against an enemy during a war, danger, or political warfare. The objective of psychological warfare is to capture "hearts and minds" by influencing the values, beliefs, emotions, reasoning, motives, or conduct of the campaign's targets using non-combat methods such as propaganda, threats, and other methods (Linebarger, 2020). There are four types of cognitive/psychological warfare: strategic, white, black, and grey. Strategic psychological warfare is primarily a protracted process that demoralizes or shakes the population's faith in their government. The US and India are working together to harm Pakistan, the world's only Islamic nuclear power. Pakistan is a preferred target of psychological warfare and terrorism. India is using various methods to weaken Pakistan's global position and reach its foreign policy goals by conducting covert operations in Balochistan, Gilgit Baltistan, and the FATA region supporting terrorism, and fomenting lawlessness and confusion in the province to destabilize Pakistan (Kariya, 2020).

Economic Warfare: Economic warfare refers to the use of economic measures, such as trade restrictions, economic sanctions, penalties, tariff discrimination, the blocking of financial assets, the termination of aid, the ban of investments, and the seizure, to damage the economies of adversaries. Economic warfare aims to capture or otherwise control the supply of important economic resources so that friendly military and intelligence agencies may utilize them and enemy forces cannot use them. Economic warfare might compel an adversary in its policies or behavior or obstruct regular connections with other countries (Clemens, 2013). Pakistan has been facing financial threats from several adversaries, mostly from the US and India; they use International Monetary Fund (IMF) and Financial Action Task (FATF) to weaken Pakistan by imposing sanctions on it (Maheen, 2021). The Financial Action Task Force (FATF) was created in 1989 by the G7 to tackle money laundering. It has since expanded its scope to include combating the financing of terrorism and weapons of mass destruction through its nine specific recommendations. Adversaries used FATF and IMF to change Pakistan's policies, and now Pakistan is on the verge of bankruptcy due to IMF and FATF.

The rise of China in the international order is perceived as a threat to the United States, and the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) is seen as a challenge to America's influence. However, the BRI aims to strengthen economic partnerships and infrastructure construction among states and does not pursue western standard bilateral or multilateral treaties. The Build Back Better World (B3W) initiative, launched by G7 countries, aims to invest in low and middle-income countries' infrastructure development, covering health, climate, security, digital technology, and gender equity (Sahrish Safdar et al., 2021). The US will lead and mobilize infrastructure development in low-income and developing countries through the B3W initiative. Pakistan's relationship with China and the US is a matter of concern due to the escalating tensions between the two countries. While Pakistan leans towards China, the B3W program could impact the Pakistani economy and the CPEC program with China. Overall, the US-China competition and the BRI and B3W initiatives have implications for the global order and could lead to geopolitical shifts.

Espionage and Intelligence Agencies: Espionage is an act of gathering confidential information by the use of

undercover agents or spying equipment for military, political, or commercial purposes. Pakistan, being a developing country with multiple internal and external security threats, has been a prime target of various foreign intelligence agencies. India and the US have been actively involved in espionage activities in Pakistan. Pakistan has had to deal with several incidents of spying and has caught and punished many spies over the years (Chaya, 2022). India has been involved in several espionage cases against Pakistan. In 2017, India's former Navy officer Kulbhushan Yadav was caught and sentenced to death for espionage and terrorism activities in Pakistan (Dawn, 2011). Yadav had been in contact with Baloch separatists and provided them with financial and material assistance. India's intelligence agency, Research and Analysis Wing (RAW), has also been accused of engaging in intelligence-gathering activities against Pakistan. The US has also been actively involved in espionage activities in Pakistan, primarily through its Central Intelligence Agency (CIA). The CIA has been accused of spying on Pakistan's military and political leadership. In 2011, the CIA's activities in Pakistan were exposed when Pakistani authorities arrested several Al-Qaida operatives with the help of ISI's taped recordings of CIA activities. To counter the threat of espionage, Pakistan needs to strengthen its intelligence agencies, improve surveillance technology, and increase vigilance. The country needs to invest in training and equipping intelligence officers to keep up with modern espionage techniques. Additionally, Pakistan needs to work on enhancing its cyber defense capabilities to protect against cyber espionage.

Diplomacy as Tool: Diplomacy is a crucial foreign policy tool used by countries to reduce tensions between nations through peaceful means. This approach involves table talks and negotiations aimed at fostering cooperation and mutual benefits. In today's world, diplomacy has replaced military power as the primary tool of statecraft. Countries must commit to spreading security and stability globally, which requires investing resources in the global economy. The fight against non-state threats such as terrorism and migration calls for a coordinated effort across the military, economic, and social spheres. In terms of alliance diplomacy, India has joined many international and regional organizations and has been lobbying with other countries to weaken Pakistan's global image (Poast, 2019). On the other hand, India uses political diplomacy to

support anti-national groups in Balochistan and Kashmir. The US, on the other hand, has been using political diplomacy to destabilize other countries in the past, as seen in the case of Sri Lanka, and military diplomacy to strengthen its ties with Israel and India. For instance, the US and Israel are working together to share technology, and India is also working with both countries to increase their hybrid warfare techniques and counter their enemies (Kashif, 2021). The US and India are also using diplomacy to counter China's growing influence in the region, with the formation of the Quad alliance. Overall, diplomacy can have significant implications for the global order, and countries must use it carefully to achieve their goals without causing harm to others.

Information Warfare: The media plays a significant role in shaping public perception and opinion, particularly in times of information warfare. Information warfare involves the use of various tactics to influence or manipulate public opinion, such as propaganda, disinformation, and fake news (Ortiz-Ospina, 2019). The media can be both a tool and a target in information warfare, and understanding its role is essential in comprehending the impact of this phenomenon on public perception. In an information war, the media is often targeted by actors seeking to spread disinformation or propaganda to influence public opinion. This can include the use of social media platforms to spread false or misleading information, hacking of news sites to disseminate fake news, or the use of paid influencers to spread a specific message (Bukhari, 2021). For example, during the 2019 Pulwama attack, Indian media outlets used false images and videos to falsely claim that the attacker was linked to Pakistan (Iqbal, 2018).

In 2017, several Indian media outlets reported that the Pakistani government had imposed a ban on the teaching of English in schools. The reports claimed that the decision was part of an effort to promote the use of the Urdu language and to distance the country from its colonial past. The reports were widely circulated on social media and in other online forums. Indian media outlets have been accused of using propaganda to influence public opinion and promote a particular political agenda. For example, during the 2019 Balakot airstrike, Indian media outlets spread false information about the number of casualties and the targets that were hit. Pakistan needs to address the growing threat of media warfare and media

propaganda. Cyber warfare is a crucial element of information warfare and is used to disrupt, degrade or destroy an opponent's information systems and infrastructure. In the South Asian context, India has been accused of using cyber warfare to weaken Pakistan economically and militarily, while Pakistan has become increasingly vulnerable to cyber-attacks. Indian hackers and patriotic programmers have been identified as defending Indian national interests through website destruction of Pakistani government sites and APTs have been found targeting both Pakistan and China.

The Indian APT is known for outsourcing activities to external contractors, suggesting it is well-funded and well-organized, possibly with support from within the Pakistan government. As cyber-attacks become more prevalent, it is important for Pakistan to take necessary measures to protect its cyberspace and educate its citizens about potential cyber threats.

Soft Power as a Source of Non-Kinetic Warfare: The world undergoes several transformations. With the aid of various instruments, dangers are also evolving from traditional to non-traditional forms. Soft power retains significant importance in today's world. American analyst and theorist Joseph Nye first proposed the notion of soft power in the 1970s. He argued that both delicate and robust power play an important role in international affairs. It has called "soft power," and it is all about utilizing unconventional methods to get the support of the state (Nye, 1990). Coercing, deterring, or persuading someone to do something via unconventional and non-physical means is an example of soft power. India relies heavily on soft power, such as the media, to bolster its standing as a real democracy worldwide.

Furthermore, this includes making Pakistan's image pious and pure globally and spotting and degrading its image. India, the US, and Israel use the same tactics for the Pakistani state. India has been relying heavily on soft power, such as the media, to portray itself as a fully functional democratic state in the eyes of the world (International Prism, 2022). Making Pakistan's image pious and immaculate is only one part of this strategy; another involves identifying and degrading Pakistan's image. Every aspect of Indian media paints Pakistan as a terrorist-supporting state. Anti-Pakistani politics in India also tried to portray Pakistan as a country that harbors terrorists.

After Pakistan tested its nuclear weapons, the US started a campaign against Pakistan and started using the media to derail Pakistan's image (Ashraf et al., 2021).

AI as a Tool of Non-Kinetic Warfare: AI technology has been used in various ways, including the development of weapons and as a tool to assist soldiers in their tasks. AI applications such as expert systems, natural language processing, speech recognition, and machine vision have already been integrated into military operations. Advancements in algorithmic methodologies have brought AI to the center of public, media, government, and military attention, making it a top priority for defense and intelligence agencies (Wasilow & Thorpe, 2019). However, AI technology can also be used for destabilization in the form of fabricated material, deep fakes, and voice generation. In the war in Ukraine, Russia successfully used Hybrid warfare AI tools such as deep fakes and voice generation to surrender Ukraine soldiers on television. Countries like the US, EU, and Israel have also successfully used and tested these technologies. India has already integrated autonomous weapon systems with drones and is working on hybrid AI technologies like deep fakes and voice software (Wasilow & Thorpe, 2019).

Pakistan, on the other hand, lags behind in AI technology and imports it from countries that are heavily investing in this area. NATO states that AI information will be used to counter threats, and Pakistan needs to be prepared for this potential threat. The social and economic outcomes of hybrid conflicts will be shaped by the ability to mimic, influence, and alter group behavior using AI. Therefore, Pakistan needs to invest in AI technology and develop its own capabilities to counter the potential threat of AI-based Hybrid warfare (Mustafa et al., 2019).

CONCLUSION

The nature of warfare has undergone a transformation in recent times, with nations increasingly avoiding violent wars and focusing on non-violent methods to weaken their opponents. Pakistan is surrounded by non-kinetic threats from various adversaries, including India, the United States, and Israel, who are using a range of tactics to damage Pakistan's image and economy. This research examines the security perils of Pakistan in the context of non-kinetic warfare. Non-kinetic warfare includes tactics such as propaganda, media manipulation, economic sanctions, and cyberattacks. Pakistan has been under

psychological and internet warfare, as adversaries use proxy agents in many fields to distort Pakistan's image both inside and outside the country. The United States and India have portrayed Pakistan negatively in their films, while Israel has been found spying and spreading propaganda against Pakistan. These adversaries use technology to spy and launch cyberattacks against Pakistan, and they provide technology and training to the Indian army to gain an advantage over Pakistan. Pakistan's vulnerabilities, such as weak and struggling society, political marginalization, demographic disparities, and cost-effective inequity, make it a suitable target for non-kinetic attacks. These vulnerabilities, combined with the widespread availability of information technology, allow non-kineticism to flourish. The United States and Israel have already taken the lead in this competition, while India is developing AI-powered weaponry and information that can be used against Pakistan.

To counter non-kinetic threats, Pakistan has implemented various strategies and plans such as Operation Zarb-e-Azab, the National Action Plan, Operation Radd-ul-Fasaad, and the National Internal Security Policy. These plans aim to avoid hybrid warfare, cyber-attacks, and non-kineticism as a threat. However, Pakistan is still far behind in these areas and needs to improve its governance, improve its global image, and strengthen its identity and cultural values to avoid psychological manipulation. Pakistan must also focus on improving its economy by enhancing its trade relationships and reducing its reliance on loans. An economically stable Pakistan would be more challenging to manipulate. Furthermore, Pakistan needs to catch up with the evolving technology in the world to strengthen itself on the military and industrial levels.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TACKLING

In order to effectively address the security challenges posed by hybrid warfare in Pakistan, several key policy recommendations are proposed. These recommendations aim to enhance Pakistan's resilience to hybrid warfare and threats, strengthen its capabilities to detect and respond to attacks, and promote regional and international cooperation to counter hybrid warfare.

DETECTION OF NON-KINETIC WARFARE

There are several ways to detect Hybrid warfare but according to Dr. Patrick Cullen and Dr. Njord Weggev in

their Report: *Countering Hybrid Warfare (2019)* (Monaghan, 2019), Threats are divided into three categories "known", "known-unknown", and "unknown-unknown". Known threats like normal Kinetic threats, "known-unknown" and "unknown-unknown" are hybrid threats or non-kinetic threats. "Known-unknown" can be detected by Monitoring of Hybrid aggressor, monitoring entails examining the surroundings for known unknowns, usually with the help of indicators, to find a collection of predetermined information about potential Hybrid aggression. "Unknown-unknown" can be detected by discovery this mechanism captures and interprets information about an unanticipated hostile, combative activity. For this purpose;

IMPROVED INTELLIGENCE SYSTEM

A reliable intelligence system is crucial for successful non-kinetic activities.

- Intelligence agencies should specialize in military analysis, counter-proliferation, and counter-terrorism targeting.
- Advanced training and career opportunities for senior experts are needed to execute new ideas successfully.
- A bottom-up strategy is essential for superior results in intelligence gathering.
- The feedback loop for intelligence gathering needs to be sped up.
- Accuracy should be prioritized above quantum in intelligence gathering.

STRATEGIC GOALS FOR COMBAT HYBRID WARFARE

Once the threats have been detected, the next is to make strategic goals to counter them. Strategic objectives provide a framework for articulating these policy choices.

Goal 1: Prevent losing your capacity to think and act for yourself. The first and foremost objective is to ensure that governments retain the resources and power to operate independently. This objective is necessary for further goals, as doing so will help reduce the impact of non-kinetic warfare on the government and society.

To Archive goal 1 we need to Implement following;

GOOD GOVERNANCE:

1. Good governance is essential for achieving development goals, with a focus on ensuring human rights on all fronts, including civil, cultural, economic, political, and social rights.

2. Corruption is a major obstacle to good governance, and institutional balance is necessary for democracy, political stability, civil-military ties, judiciary subordination, and bureaucracy depoliticization.
3. Regional collaboration, a legal foundation, fair distribution of resources, efficient budget management, and high standards for education are necessary for effective governance.
4. Curriculum development should be determined by local communities and educators, and standards for education should outline learning goals for students at each grade level.

Effective governance can help combat non-kinetic threats to a nation's security, and an educated and powerful nation has a lower risk of being threatened by internal and external factors.

POSITIVE IMAGE BUILDING

Pakistan has an image problem worldwide that needs to be addressed through effective and credible rebuttals to anti-Pakistan sentiments.

1. The Ministry of Information and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have significant responsibilities in cleaning up Pakistan's worldwide negativity.
2. Public diplomacy can only succeed if regular citizens, not the state, drive it, and the private sector, sports celebrities, and film/TV performers should represent Pakistan positively worldwide.
3. Singers, dancers, and actors may more readily relate to the entertainment community in various countries, allowing them to interact with business partners abroad more effectively, opponents on the cricket field, and fans of their work.

IDENTITY AND CULTURE

The philosophy of Pakistan and its diverse cultural heritage contribute to the country's sense of national pride. It is crucial to strengthen the national identity based on unity in diversity. External interference that promotes divisive speech about racial, religious, and socioeconomic differences undermines national cohesiveness. The state and citizens have made tireless efforts to counter such external interference and maintain national unity.

The approach to fostering national unity should focus on valuing Pakistan's variety, promoting tolerance, and using

cultural and educational institutions for ongoing and committed efforts.

HARMONY BETWEEN POLITICAL AND MILITARY LEADERSHIP

1. An essential political interface is necessary to deliver a complete response to non-kinetics.
2. The Ministry of Defense and the Joint Staff Headquarters must expand their roles, collaborate politically and militarily, and work closely with other state institutions to increase threat awareness and effectively respond to non-kinetic threats.

PUBLIC AND POLITICAL SUPPORT

1. The government must reach out to all religious and political parties to foster genuine support from all stakeholders.
2. There is a need to forge unity among various strands of opinion to develop consensus on challenging issues.
3. A united front will discourage adversaries from targeting the nation.

TRADE, INVESTMENT, AND CONNECTIVITY

To Improve Pakistan's economy

1. Dedicated economic outreach strategy for bilateral and multilateral engagement
2. Focus on broadening the export base to include services and non-traditional items
3. China-Pakistan Business Corridor and other connectivity efforts present opportunities for economic partnerships
4. development of a comprehensive maritime policy to maximize Pakistan's blue economy
5. Emphasis on transit points, ship construction, offshore exploration, port facilities, fishing, coastal tourism, and other maritime industries

IMPROVING TECHNOLOGY

Many jobs in the region are predicted to become outdated in the next 30 years. Technological innovation and adaptation rate will affect industry stability and living standards.

1. Access to high-quality education and necessary skills are crucial for competing in a global economy
2. Change from information consumption to intellectual creation is needed through better education and employer connections

3. Automation and emerging technologies will alter societies, economics, and technology development. A dedicated effort is needed to support AI education, research activities, and start-ups

Goal 1 for Military level

RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS

Research and analysis on non-kinetic warfare and its synonyms are crucial for enhancing military operations, technologies, and response time.

1. Non-contact combat must be prioritized and dealt with accordingly.
2. New doctrines should be created in response to the enemy's actions and replies.
3. Specific formations should be established for a thorough investigation of Hybrid warfare in Pakistan.

UNIQUE TRAINING

New technology demands new training methodologies for the armed forces.

1. Armed forces need to be skilled in all areas of training, including terrorist tactics, relief, and rehabilitation activities.
2. Hybrid warfare and modalities should be emphasized.
3. Army Schools of Instruction are an excellent venue for introduction and discussion of the topic.
4. Mental training techniques should be implemented to protect soldiers from negative psychological impacts.
5. Interaction among top executives can provide a convenient venue for training.

MEDIA CAMPAIGN

The media plays an important role in developing the army's image.

1. ISPR (Inter-Services Public Relations) should focus on improving Pakistan's reputation in the international community. ISPR should utilize television stations to promote Pakistani military campaigns and the country's image.
2. The military and government's victories should be highlighted to improve Pakistan's image and Pakistan's contribution to improving the world should be recounted to enhance its reputation.

3. The military should use the media to promote awareness of its anti-terror and peacemaking capabilities.
4. Using the media can help achieve the goals of countering anti-national elements both inside and outside the country.

Goal 2: Prevent or deter non-kinetic action by an enemy. To discourage or deter an enemy from using non-kinetic warfare is a second, more difficult purpose. While maintaining the ability to act independently may have a deterrence (through deterrence-by-denial), holistic deterrence necessitates going above and beyond resistance to threaten or impose penalties (deterrence-by-punishment). Thresholds are set based on the interests of the defenders, and the adversary's intent and capacity should be created from the beginning and reestablished if it fails.

Goal 3: Disrupt or stop an enemy from engaging in additional non-kinetic attacks. The third and most challenging task is preventing an opponent from engaging in further non-kinetic aggression. Beyond deterrence, this objective aims to interfere with and weaken an adversary's ability to act (Even though these actions have their inherent deterrent value). This objective is necessary so that a non-kinetic aggressor might not alter their behavior without punishment to weaken their capacity or motivation to engage in non-kinetic aggression.

With all achievement Pakistan will be prosperous and secure

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, A. (2023). Pakistan Dispatch: Political Plays Are Risking Economic Instability as IMF Negotiations Drag On. JURIST. <https://www.jurist.org/news/2023/02/pakistan-dispatch-political-plays-are-risking-economicinstability-as-imf-negotiations-drag-on/>
- Ahmad, N. (2023). Pakistan's Economy is in Crisis. Here's What You Need to Know. CNN Business. <https://www.cnn.com/2023/02/02/economy/pakistan-economy-crisis/index.html>
- Alam, M., & Sadiq, M. (2020). Non-kinetic warfare and cyber threats in Pakistan: Vulnerabilities and challenges. *Journal of Strategic Studies*, 783-806.
- Ali, M. (2021). Cold war II. DAWN. Bakhtyar, M. (2021). Pakistan's Implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (No. 23445426453). https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/233812019_06_15_VNR_2019_Pakistan_latest_version.pdf
- Bashir, S., & Hussain, F. (2021). Economic instability in Pakistan: Causes, consequences, and remedies. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences (PJSS)*, 41(1), 71-86.
- Bukhari, S. (2021). Hybrid Warfare and the Role of Social Media. Sassi. Chaya, D. P. (2022). India's Intelligence Culture and Strategic Surprises: Spying for South Block. Taylor & Francis.
- Chohan, U. W. (2017). Public Value: Bureaucrats versus politicians. *Global Encyclopaedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance*. Springer.
- Clemens, J. (2013). An analysis of economic warfare. *American Economic Review*, 103(3), 523-527.
- Dawn. (2011). PAKISTAN: Release Sarabjit Singh who has now spent 21 years in a death cell due to an unfair trial in a case of mistaken identity. Dawn.
- Feyyaz, M. (2015). Why Pakistan does not have a counterterrorism narrative. *Journal of Strategic Security*, 8(1-2), 63-78.
- Haider, S., & Shaukat, S. (2021). Foreign policy of Pakistan: Challenges and opportunities. *Journal of Political Science and International Relations*, 14(2).
- HALI, S. M., AHMED, R., & IQBAL, S. (2020). Investigating Military Effectiveness of India and Pakistan through Clausewitzian Lens.
- Hussain. (2023). Political Chaos, Economic Collapse, and Terror Threat: Pakistan Battling a "Perfect Storm" of Crises. Times of India. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/world/pakistan/political-chaos-economic-collapse-and-terror-threat-pakistan-battling-a-perfect-storm-of-crises/articleshow/97397006.cms>
- Hussain, A. (2021). Political instability and non-kinetic warfare: A threat to Pakistan's national security. *Journal of Political Studies*, 28(1), 181-200.
- Hussain, & Ayesha. (2021). Political instability and non-

- kinetic warfare: A threat to Pakistan's national security, 28(1), 181-200. *Journal of Political Studies*, 28(1), 181-200.
- Iqbal, S. (2018). Hybrid Warfare and its Impact on Pakistan's Security: Hybrid Warfare and its Impact on Pakistan's Security. Saghir Iqbal.
- International Monetary Fund. (2020). World Economic Outlook: A Long and Difficult Ascent. *International Monetary Fund*, 1(1), 1-246.
- Javai, P. (2020). Operation Zarb-e-Azb: A successful initiative to curtail terrorism. *South Asian Studies*, 30(2).
- Kariya, S. (2020, August 25). Psychological Warfare – An Opportunity for India. DRAS India.
- Kashif, M. (2021). A new Cold War and Wolf Warrior diplomacy. *Pakistan Today*. <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2021/06/22/a-new-cold-war-and-wolf-warrior-diplomacy/>
- Khan, F. H. (2022). Strategic Risk Management in Southern Asia. *Journal for Peace and Nuclear Disarmament*, 1-25.
- Khan, S. A. (2021). Cyber Warfare As A Non-Kinetic Threat: Implications For Pakistan.
- Linebarger, P. M. A. (2020). Psychological warfare. e-artnow.
- Maheen, A. (2021). Pakistan hit with \$38 billion loss due to FATF grey list. DAWN.
- Malik, H. (2019). Pakistan: Political instability and economic challenges. *Journal of South Asian Studies*, 7(2), 67-84.
- Monaghan, S. (2019). Countering hybrid warfare. *Prism*, 8(2), 82-99.
- Mustafa, G., Nawaz Bhatti, M., Hussain, L., & Professor, A. (2019). Indo-Israel Relations: Implications for Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 3(1), 194-206.
- Nye, J. S. (1990). Soft power. *Foreign Policy*, 80, 153-171.
- Ortiz-Ospina, E. (2019). The rise of social media. Our Data in World. <https://ourworldindata.org/rise-of-social-media>
- Otaiku, A. A. (2018). A framework for hybrid warfare: Threats, challenges and solutions. *J Def Manag*, 8(178), 374-2167.
- Poast, P. (2019). Introduction: The Fragility of Alliance Diplomacy. In *The Art of Agreement in Military-Pact Negotiations* (pp. 1-13). Cornell University Press. <https://doi.org/doi:10.1515/9781501740251-003>
- Rafi, R., ammar, Ali, & Muhammad. (2021). Non-kinetic warfare: A new form of security threat to Pakistan. *The Journal of the Middle East and Africa*, 135-149.
- Raza, S. (2023, January 13). Pakistan: Five Major Issues to Watch in 2023. Brookings Institution. <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2023/01/13/pakistan-five-major-issues-to-watch-in-2023/>
- Sahrish Safdar, M., Scholar, M. P., Aqeel, M., Multan, I., Hussain, S., Asghar, M. M., & Scholar, P. D. (2021). China-Pakistan Economic Corridor: A Study Of Indo-US Nexus To Sabotages CPEC (Vol. 5).
- Soherwordi, H. S. (2010). Pakistan-US Policies on the "War on Terror" and the Taliban: Allies at Loggerheads. *Pakistan Horizon*, 63(2), 51-67.
- The International Prism. (2022). How Does Soft Power Portray India's Image To The World? <https://www.theinternationalprism.com/how-does-soft-power-portray-indias-image-to-the-world/>
- Wasilow, S., & Thorpe, J. B. (2019). Artificial intelligence, robotics, ethics, and the military: A Canadian perspective. *AI Magazine*, 40(1), 37-48.