

## SIGNIFICANCE OF NON-TRADITIONAL DIMENSIONS OF SECURITY: UNDERSTANDING PAKISTAN'S PREDICAMENTS

Dr Zia Ul Haque Shamsi

PhD in Strategic Studies from NDU, Islamabad

[Authored three international books: “Nuclear Deterrence and Conflict Between India and Pakistan”  
“South Asia Needs Hybrid Peace” and “Understanding Sun Tzu and The Art of Hybrid War.”  
Translated Sun Tzu’s The Art of War in Urdu]

Corresponding Author: [ziashamsi58@gmail.com](mailto:ziashamsi58@gmail.com) / [ziashamsi99@yahoo.com](mailto:ziashamsi99@yahoo.com)

Received: 15 November, 2023 Revised: 05 December, 2023 Accepted: 13 December, 2023 Published: 18 December, 2023

### ABSTRACT

While the territorial integrity of any sovereign state forms part of the core national interest for which it can go to war with any adversary, non-traditional security dimensions have also gained equal importance in the changed paradigm. Thus, human security and the development of any state become dependent on each other in the manner that neither would be viable without the other. This implied that the state could not ensure individual or societal security until it had developed itself and achieved self-sufficiency in food, health, environment, and employment for its citizens and residents. However, the same could not be achieved particularly by the developing countries for various reasons, and Pakistan is no exception. Be it for the religious hate crimes against minorities or the child abuse, be it for the criminal acts of violence against women or murders of the minors after rape and torture; there is no respite and relief for the society in general and parents of the victims in particular. Moreover, uncontrolled population growth, lack of national integration, increased intolerance in society giving rise to extremism and terrorism, lawlessness, corruption, air pollution, cyber security, and perhaps above all political instability, also form part of the long list of non-traditional security concerns for Pakistan. Therefore, this paper aims to carry out a critical appraisal of the non-traditional dimensions of national security and understand the priorities adopted by Pakistan in the last seventy-five years, to suggest a way forward. This would be carried out through the lens of domestic politics through deductive reasoning, however, an inductive approach would be adopted while applying the Possibility-Probability (P-2) model to develop a framework viable for a better outcome in the domain of non-traditional national security dimensions in the future.

**Keywords:** National Security, Human Security, Non-Traditional Security, Human Development, National Integration, Extremism, Domestic Politics, P-2 Model.

### INTRODUCTION

According to Human Development Report 1994, "New Dimensions of Human Security" which was prepared by the Committee headed by a renowned Pakistani economist Dr Mahbub ul Haq, the elements of human security include Economic security, Food security, Health security, Environmental security, Personal security, Community security, and Political security. However, cyber security and financial security may be added to the list due to the ever-

increasing use of technology in governmental functions as well as personal lives.

There is little doubt that human security remains the most important element of national security because it encompasses the basic human needs as mentioned in the above-quoted study, however, none would be possible without a concerted effort for the sound development of state institutions and systems (Shamsi, 2021). While traditional security threats include kinetic application as the

main architect, non-traditional security threats include nearly all other domains of human security. Furthermore, in the changed paradigm, “Non-Traditional Security (NTS) comprises a gamut of human security concerns such as climate change, shortage of food and resources such as energy, infectious diseases, natural disasters, transnational crime, human and drug trafficking, and mass migration.” (Sreeparna and Basu, 2022).

This article is aimed at deliberating the non-traditional dimensions of human security through the lens of domestic politics because political instability appears to be the most probable cause of Pakistan’s present state. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Report emphasizes the protection of human rights and the well-being of all people as part of political security. It also aims to ensure that people are well protected from repression by the state. The states, according to Charles Tilly, at times act as protection rackets and usurp the peoples’ rights of speech, press, and voting. Tilly argued that “the emerging nation-state established itself by acting, essentially, as a racketeer (in terms of the interrelated activities of war-making, state-making, protection, and resource extraction via plunder, taxes, etc.” (Tilly, 1985).

The political security of any state has a direct bearing on all other elements of human security. For instance, the personal security of a citizen would remain in question if he does not enjoy the freedom of speech, press, and voting. Moreover, personal insecurity for the want of political security may lead to instability, thus putting stress on all elements of human security. Likewise, political insecurity may have a question mark on community security as well. Human rights abuses, which are a fundamental threat to political security, catch the attention of international institutions and may put sanctions on states, in case of large-scale violations. This may also expose the state to exploitation by the adversaries and become an easy target to launch a hybrid war on the target state. Thus, ensuring personal security and community security become extremely important elements of human security for the accomplishment of political security.

While emphasizing the significance of political security as an important element of human security, it is necessary to highlight its linkages with economic security. States that are dependent on donor agencies for development and sustenance cannot make independent decisions for the well-being of their people. Therefore, the states that do not have economic independence would remain under stress for the providence of political security to its people. The developing nations that are economically dependent on donor agencies may fall into the categories of states that are not politically secure and cannot endure political shocks due to economic instability.

States are at risk of losing sovereignty more than territorial integrity when they expose their weaknesses to friends and foes alike because, in the realm of international relations, there are no permanent friends or permanent enemies. Lord Palmerston’s centuries-old dictum holds good even now and perhaps forever. The three pillars of Pakistan’s recently released National Security Policy (NSP 2022-2026) include human security, military security, and economic security. Economic security is a vital element of human security or non-traditional security, but to put more emphasis on the former, it has been dubbed as ‘geo-economics’ and discussed separately (Shamsi. 2022).

Pakistan must also exercise extreme care in dealing with political insecurity for the want of economic security, personal security, and community security. The rising inflation and currency devaluation have put a lot of stress on the common man and the same may be exploited by our adversaries to create fissures in the society. Hence, the emphasis laid on human security and the well-being of the people in the recently released National Security Policy (2022-2026) is a step in the right direction. Pakistan must strive to ensure proper implementation of the policy to accrue its benefits for the state and its people.

#### ***Significance of the study***

The human security and the development of any state are dependent on each other in the manner that neither would be viable without the other. This implies that the state cannot ensure individual or societal security until it has developed itself and achieved self-sufficiency in

food, health, environment, and employment for its citizens and residents. Therefore, developing countries are faced with the dilemma of distributing their resources between the state's territorial integrity and the development of human security requirements. This makes the study significant and calls for an introspection of the past and a viable course of action for the future.

### **LITERATURE REVIEW**

Barry Buzan's writings proved extremely useful during the research along with Dr Haq's UNDP Report of 1994. Morgenthau's precepts on classical realism and national interests provided a sound background knowledge to deal with the prevalent state of developing nations. Michael Louw on National Security and Charles Tilly on War making and state-making also proved helpful in developing the argument. Specific to Pakistan, the first few five-year plans helped in understanding the earlier efforts to put a new state on track development, however, domestic politics derailed the process. Unfortunately, there is not much literature available that blames Pakistan's predicament on domestic politics. Therefore, this study is expected to fill the gap in the literature concerning domestic politics.

#### ***Theoretical Precepts***

The significance of non-traditional security in the changed paradigm cannot be overemphasized. Theoretical precepts related to state and government, political instability, and adherence to core national values will be discussed in detail to understand the predicament of Pakistan.

#### **State and the Government**

The universally accepted definition of state includes people, geographical boundaries, and the government, and is recognized by international institutions as a political unit. While the state is a permanent political entity, the governments come and go at regular intervals. However, the decisions taken by impermanent governments may have serious consequences for the state and its people. Perhaps, Pakistan has suffered the most on this account because most governments in the past 50 years were led

by regional political parties headed by family dynasties. Hence, the decision-making had been extremely personalized, politically motivated, and self-serving. Nearly all national institutions and enterprises that contribute to the national security of the state; Pakistan International Airlines (PIA), Pakistan Railways (PR), and Pakistan Steel Mills (PSM), have been rendered worthless and become the cause of a huge economic drain, primarily due to domestic politics with serious consequences to security of Pakistan.

#### **Significance of Non-traditional Security in Pakistan**

The territorial integrity of any sovereign state remains a vital interest for which it can go to war with any adversary. Historically, territorial disputes were the main source of wars and conflicts between nations until the Treaty of Westphalia was signed between the European powers of the time in 1648. The Treaty formally recognized the sovereignty of a state over its territory and ended the prolonged wars between Spain, and the Dutch, later joined by the Germans as well. While territorial disputes remain the most compelling cause of military conflicts among nation-states, evolving concepts of security have added newer causes, irritants, and threats to states' survival and the well-being of their people. Whereas the importance of territorial security cannot be overemphasized, the significance of human security has gained more prominence in the changed paradigm. According to the 1994 UN Report, each element of human security: economic, health, food, environmental, personal, community, and political security, has an impact on the national security of the state. However, an NTS-Asia study on non-traditional security has included climate change, resource scarcity, natural disasters, infectious diseases, irregular migration, drug trafficking, and people smuggling, as important contributors to the challenges to national security.

Pakistan faces nearly all of the above-mentioned challenges to its national security. While the Armed Forces of Pakistan have valiantly defended territorial integrity and sovereignty

successfully over time, non-traditional security challenges are fast emerging as serious concerns to its overall security in the medium- to long-term. Uncontrolled population growth, lack of national integration, increased intolerance in society giving rise to extremism and terrorism, lawlessness, corruption, air pollution, and cyber security also form part of the long list of serious security concerns for Pakistan.

While each element of non-traditional security merits attention, this article will focus on the growing population and its corresponding compound impact on the national security of Pakistan.

Pakistan is the fifth most populous country in the world with over 220 million people and an alarming growth rate of 2 percent. According to a World Bank report, only a handful of African countries and Afghanistan have a greater population growth rate than Pakistan. The lack of basic amenities like health, education, nutrition, infrastructure, job opportunities, etc. have all contributed to the backwardness of Pakistan. According to the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, the current literacy rate of Pakistan stands at 62.3 percent, meaning over 60 million people are illiterate and perhaps facing extremely hard living conditions to sustain themselves.

Although Pakistan is striving to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) with its focus on the 3 Ps 'People, Planet and Prosperity', the focus and practical steps needed to control population growth are lacking due to which the SDGs objectives of ending poverty and hunger would remain a far cry in case of Pakistan. Likewise, 'Prosperity' as part of desire alone cannot be achieved in a country where some 24 percent of people are living below the poverty line. Moreover, demographic makeup reflects that over 60 percent of the population is between the ages of 15-64, whereas 35 percent are below the age of 14 years. The average age in Pakistan hovers around 22 years, suggesting that Pakistan's young population urgently needs education, health, job opportunities, and an extremely careful direction in life about societal values. An educated and socially aware youth can be an asset to the nation, but an uneducated and

directionless populace can become a serious national security threat in an evolving regional security environment. There is a need for religious moderation under true Islamic teachings to avoid the repeat of mob-lynching incidents of minorities. Then, rising poverty forces children to stay out of schools due to lack of affordability, and assist their parents by doing menial domestic jobs which contributes to frustration, inequality, and illiteracy.

Another factor that is seriously affecting the effective control of population growth and numerous other factors related to non-traditional security threats is related to legal and constitutional bindings on the state. Most of these subjects now fall in the domain of Provincial Governments, and therefore the commitments that the Federal Government makes with International Institutions are not accomplished uniformly in time and in the desired manner. Unfortunately, domestic politics at times overrides serious national objectives and priorities.

There is a need to give equal importance to non-traditional security challenges to ensure that they are addressed with the same vigor and priority as territorial security, so that adversaries are unable to exploit fault lines, and the overall national security of the state is not compromised.

#### **Causes of Pakistan's Dismal state**

The dilemma of developing states and the significance of non-traditional security warrants a retrospection of the bygone 75 years to determine the causes of the present dismal state of affairs before a viable way forward is proposed.

#### **Challenges of Societal Security**

Reiterating some of the essential elements of national security: human security, economic security, environmental security, military security, cyber security, and importantly societal security. However, national security, in the changed paradigm is not only reflective of military security alone, but it remains void in the absence of sound human security and societal security.

It is the responsibility of the state that its citizens and residents live, strive, and

thrive in a vibrant society, which gives them a sense of safety, security, and ownership, and provides equal opportunities to all. Unfortunately, an upward and extremely dangerous trend is seen in this regard. Be it for the religious hate crimes against minorities or the child abuse, be it for the criminal acts of violence against women or murders of the minors after rape and torture; there is no respite and relief for the society in general and parents of the victims in particular.

These criminal acts in our country may have been happening for decades but the revolution in social media has made us all aware of these ills of society. Unfortunately, successive governments failed to educate the people, and effectively marginalize the criminality from the society. First of the many such cases that appeared to shake the society was that of Zainab from Kasur. A seven-year girl was abducted, raped, tortured, and murdered in Kasur in January 2018. The entire nation rose to the occasion and called for an immediate arrest of the killer and to be hanged publicly. Imran Ali was arrested and tried expeditiously, perhaps due to immense societal pressure, and hanged in Kot Lakhpat Jail, Lahore in October 2018.

Zainab's case had a profound impact on the morale of the society and parents felt extremely insecure and concerned about their siblings of any age. Despite calls for the public hanging of the culprit, it did not happen due to the certain laws of the land. Therefore, the deterrent effect on other potential criminals appeared diluted and newer cases, one after the other, of similar nature and more horrific, continued unabated, while the government acted on the pressure from society to punish the individuals without any effort to prevent the recurrences.

In September 2020, another shocking incident of gang rape occurred on the Lahore-Sialkot Motorway, where a

mother was victimized in front of her children. Society was shaken by this heinous crime in which the victim survived and helped the prosecution to nab the culprits. Malhi and Ali, the criminals were tried in the Anti-Terrorism Court (ATC) and handed the death penalty in March 2021. This was the first time that all the culprits involved in a gang rape case were awarded a death sentence, and also the fastest culmination of a criminal case, perhaps because it was tried in ATC.

Recently, another heart-breaking tragedy occurred in Capital Islamabad where Ms Noor Muqaddam 27, was brutally tortured, shot, and beheaded by her family friend, Zahir Jaffar. Since the case is subjudice, therefore, I would not comment on the merit of the case, but it is not a simple murder of a young lady, but a crime against society. The narrative has shaken the entire nation and the news that the killer belongs to an influential family, has further angered the people. The entire society stands terrorized, and parents are extremely worried about their daughters of any age stepping out of their homes. I think the brutality, insanity, and adverse impact on society demands that this case be tried in ATC and concluded on priority, to deter the potential criminals.

Pakistan has been under the cloud of hybrid war for the last many decades and a consortium of perpetrators is always on the lookout to declare it as an intolerant and extremist society. Such occurrences provide fodder to the enemies of Pakistan in their efforts. Moreover, another serious trend that is emerging is that in certain cases either the killer or the victim is a foreign national. This further complicates the situation and Pakistan suffers on account of being a safe and secure state for its populace, a serious concern for human security which equals national security.

Pakistan cannot afford to let societal degeneration hit the level that leaves its populace to hold its girls and women locked in their homes to ensure that they are safe and secure. Pakistan's female population is over 50 percent and it is extremely intelligent, hardworking, and result-oriented. From small villages to metropolitan cities, our females are making significant contributions in managing the affairs at home and in offices. It would be worth mentioning that our girls have been consistently outperforming our boys at school, college, and university levels. Let our daughters and sisters feel safe and secure when they move out of their homes for education and work, and let us as parents feel confident that our society does not only comprise criminals but compassionate and civilized men as well.

#### **Non-adherence of Core National Values**

Pakistan gained independence from British India on August 14, 1947, as the largest Muslim state in the world. Jinnah defined the core values of the newly independent state as – Unity, Faith, and Discipline. Each of these values had a specific purpose and a message for the people of Pakistan. *Unity* was kept on top, primarily because Pakistan was ethnically diverse and needed to join hands to consolidate the new state. *Faith* was meant to remind the populace that this country has come into being as a result of two-nation theory with a specific purpose – a separate state for the Muslims of the sub-continent. Jinnah purposefully included *Discipline* among the core national values so that people could work together for the much-needed sustained development of the newly independent country which did not even have its due share of partition. Jinnah knew that Pakistan could survive only if people were united and disciplined and worked hard for its development right from the beginning.

Unfortunately, Jinnah did not live for long enough to put Pakistan on the path he had envisioned. Likewise, some other leaders who were with Jinnah during the struggle for independence also departed before they could see Pakistan growing to its true potential. However, despite great challenges in the domain of economy, security, immigrant settlement, and water distribution, Pakistan still did reasonably well in the initial years of its existence.

Coming back to the national core values, one might argue that these values are well known to the nation and the real issue lies in the implementation. Well, what I will argue is that values are not implemented by force, rather these are collectively adopted by the people when they are convinced about it. National values are reflective of a nation's beliefs, practices, culture, and religious leanings. An individual cannot be forced to be patriotic, or tolerant, but will have to be motivated. When certain values are adopted by a nation, it is the responsibility of the government, media, civil society, and educational institutions that it is inculcate them into the minds of the people through concerted motivational campaigns. The people would also adopt it only if they saw the leadership and ruling elite practicing the same.

Let me give examples of Western nations. Life, liberty, democracy, etc are the most common values adopted and practiced in the developed world. However, when any of these states tried to implement it by force in the developing countries, it did not work, because the values could not be exported. These are developed indigenously on beliefs, norms, practices, and environmental evolutions over some time.

#### **Lack of Education**

The lack of education has been identified as the most serious impediment to Pakistan's development and progress. Every political party announces that it would impose an education emergency when it comes to power, but the same has not happened as yet. Therefore, the way forward for Pakistan lies in dedicating maximum effort to ensuring access to quality education for all eligible citizens of Pakistan. Since the subject has been devolved to the provinces under the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment, therefore, a consensus must be reached between all stakeholders on a uniform syllabus and requisite funding. The application of the P-2 model reflects that the possibility of improving education standards and literacy rates exists, but the probabilities remain medium to low due to past performances of the successive governments in Pakistan. This conclusion is based on the figures available

According to Quaid's vision, ... the importance of education and the type of education cannot be over-emphasized ... there is no doubt that the future of our State will and must greatly depend upon the type of education we give to our children, and how we bring them up as future citizens of Pakistan ... we should not forget that we have to compete with the world which is moving very fast in this direction.

Quaid's vision was read out at the National Education Conference: in 1947, and several decisions were taken in this regard which were implemented as part of the "National Plan of Educational Development: 1951-57." (GoP, 1957)

The First Five-Year Plan was launched in December 1957. It stated that,

.. a system of universal primary education is imperative. Primary education is essential to prepare citizens for the discharge of their

democratic and civic responsibilities and to provide them with equal opportunities for economic and cultural advancement. It is essential to the nation as a base for the entire structure of secondary and higher education from which will come leadership in all walks of life and support for technical development in agriculture and industry.

Successive governments did recognize the importance of education for the development and progress of the country. It recognized "the concept of education as a vital national investment and a major determination of the nation's economic growth." (GoP, 1965).

Unfortunately, successive governments in Pakistan did not implement Quaid's vision of the need to educate our people. Quaid had categorically stated that our education system should be such that our citizens can compete with people from other parts of the world and not only within ourselves.

The way ahead would largely depend on what decisions and actions are taken now. Unfortunately, Pakistan is once again faced with an extremely testing politico-economic uncertainty, and therefore it is enormously challenging to predict what lies ahead. Therefore, the probabilities of the way forward on the elements of non-traditional threats through the lens of domestic politics do not present a rosy picture. While the people of Pakistan would have liked to join the ranks of developed nations before centenary celebrations, the domestic political elite is busy making counterproductive policies. For instance, the health insurance system introduced by the previous government, which earned international recognition, has lost its steam, primarily due to domestic politics. This reversal and inconsistent implementation of well-established

policies would have far-reaching consequences and take Pakistan's health system back by a decade or so.

***Pre-eminence of Domestic Politics over National Interests***

Domestic politics of any state dominates the crafting of nearly all other public policies including foreign and defense. Relatively weaker states, particularly in the developing world at times end up compromising their national interests to gain grounds in domestic politics. No political party or leader willingly cedes power and therefore takes dictation from the regional or global powers. However, states that are not willing to compromise on their national interests, face the trauma of hybrid war and end up sacrificing the progress and prosperity of the nation.

Domestic politics is often based on the overriding self-interests of the ruling elite. Pakistan's domestic politics is remarkably diverse and extremely personalized. Nearly all the political parties are dynastic in nature including some of the religious parties as well. The two larger provinces: Punjab and Sindh have been ruled by two prominent families for over 30 years now, and the next generations are also aspiring to take the lead. The remaining two smaller provinces have relatively different systems. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) has perhaps the most democratic and dynamic political system where no one political family has a continuous rule like Punjab and Sindh. Historically, the people of KP do not repeat a government due to the incumbency factor, PTI after the 2018 elections is an exception. Balochistan has a unique political system which would be separately discussed.

Unfortunately, the political parties fell prey to the enemy's trap and followed the path of political unrest through street violence which was allegedly supported by the perpetrators of the hybrid war on Pakistan. The evidence of foreign

funding and direct involvement of Pakistan's enemies need a dispassionate analysis and the subject is sub judices' in Pakistani courts.

The phenomenon of agitational movements to remove the elected governments was started by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto against President Ayub Khan and has been continuing ever since. On each occasion, Pakistan's domestic politics benefitted the enemies of Pakistan, either directly or indirectly, deliberately, or inadvertently. In the recent past, while Pakistan remains under the cloud of hybrid war, domestic politics remains volatile and in turn, supports the perpetrators in creating chaos and political instability which suits the enemies and their allies.

Interestingly, in Pakistan, domestic politics compromised security and the development of the state by leaving the state institutions spineless and rudderless so that the political elite could do its corruption without any inhibition of being accountable. However, the most unfortunate part of this reckless domestic politics was that it adversely affected the well-being of the people who elected them to power again and again.

Erratic domestic politics often risks the national security of the state and such leaders are usually referred to as national security risk by the respective opposition parties, again as part of the domestic politics. Unfortunately, Pakistan suffered the most from the political expeditions of the elites and lost half of its country in 1971. The military regime of General Yahya Khan organized one of Pakistan's fairest general elections in 1970 in which all the political parties from East and West Pakistan participated with full zest and zeal. However, domestic politics overcame the peoples' choice, and the largest party of West Pakistan, the Peoples Party led by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto refused to attend the first assembly session in Dacca, hence leading to a



political uprising in East Pakistan fuelled by India, political and militarily. India's incumbent Prime Minister Narendra Modi during his visit to Dacca said, "he was one of the young volunteers who came to Delhi in 1971 to participate in the satyagraha launched by the Jana Sangh to garner support for the Mukti Bahini members." (Modi, 2015). This politically instigated and militarily supported movement by India received much-needed political support from Pakistan's domestic political actors who refused to participate in the parliamentary process leading to the break-up of the country. Bhutto took no time to form a Martial Law government initially, in the remaining West Pakistan and declared it a new Pakistan for its domestic audience.

This was perhaps one of the biggest losses to any nation for want of domestic politics that the country lost its territorial integrity for good.

#### **Uncontrolled Population growth**

Population control is perhaps an important factor to reduce poverty and ensure a relatively better quality of life for the people. At the present rate, By 2050, Pakistan will still be the fifth largest country by size with around 366 million people. Imagine a day, less than 30 years from now, when there are 132 million more of us – in a country that is one of the most rapidly urbanizing globally. This means less food to go around, less potable water, and higher demands on our social systems. It also means Pakistan will have more voters in 30 years than it ever has. Interesting times as the country will ring in its centennial. (Izza, 2022).

Therefore, it would be necessary to control the population growth in Pakistan by giving it a priority that has

been missing in all the successive governments.

#### **Conclusions**

This author is of the view that non-traditional threats to Pakistan lay heavily on inconsistent domestic politics due to which one of the most important elements of political security remains insecure. The regular interventions by the military in Pakistan's domestic politics often led to the imposition of Martial Law and a prolonged military rule has not let developed civil institutions and these have remained dependent on military establishments for guidance on governance, development, and even sustenance. However, this argument does not absolve civilian leadership over time of corruption, ineptness, incompetence, and apathy towards issues related to the public good, either in government or in opposition.

There is little doubt that the people of Pakistan deserve a better living because the territory that belongs to them is blessed with an abundance of natural resources and an extremely hardworking and industrious human resource. Pakistan needs before the centenary celebrations get underway in 25 years, political security as the most essential element of human security. Unless Pakistan achieves sustainable political stability, the probability of achieving other elements of non-traditional security will remain a far cry.

The question remains as to how Pakistan can achieve the much-desired political security so that all other elements like education, health, population control, etc. can fall in line. Because the history, as well as the current scenario, does not help in improving the probabilities of a promising outcome.

#### **NOTES:**

C. Tilly. War-making and State-making as Organized Crime. In; Evans, PB, Rueschemeyer, D and Scocpol, T (eds) 1985 Bringing the State Back.

Izza Aftab, Pakistan, and the rising global population, The News: July 14, 2022.

Sreeparna Banerjee and Pratnashree Basu, "Strengthening Partnerships to Counter Non-Traditional Security Threats in the Indo-

Pacific,” *ORF Special Report No. 185*, March 2022, Observer Research Foundation.

Mukti Bahini, a term used for Freedom Fighters collectively refers to the armed organizations that fought against the Pakistan Army during the India-Pakistan War of 1971.

Narendra Modi, India’s Prime Minister made the statement during his official visit to Bangladesh on June 7, 2015, to accept a "liberation war" honor on behalf of former Indian premier Atal Bihari Vajpayee.  
<http://www.newindianexpress.com/nation/Pakistan-Urges-UN-to-Take-Note-of-Modis-Remark-on-1971-War/2015/06/10/article2859365.ece>.  
Accessed June 15, 2015.

Satyagraha, concept was introduced by Mahatma Gandhi to designate a determined but nonviolent resistance against the British.  
<http://global.britannica.com/topic/satyagraha-philosophy>. Accessed June 15, 2015.

Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Human Security Equals National Security, Daily Times Islamabad, June 21, 2021.

Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Pakistan’s Humonomic Security may affect its Military Security, Daily Times, Islamabad, June 6, 2022.

Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Societal Challenges of Pakistan, *Pakistan Observer*, on July 31, 2021.

Government of Pakistan, Ministry of the Interior (Education Division), Proceedings of the Pakistan Educational Conference, 1947.

Government of Pakistan, Education Division, Proceedings of The Educational Conference, 1951.

Government of Pakistan, National Planning Board, First Five-Year Plan: 1955-60, 1957.

Government of Pakistan, Planning Commission, *Third Five Year Plan: 1965-70*, 1965.