

DECLINE OF ELECTRONIC MEDIA AND RISE OF SOCIAL MEDIA IN PAKISTAN

Saima Khan^{*1}, Dr. Muzmmil Hussain², Ayesha Siddiqui³

^{*1}MS (Mass Communication), Department of Mass Communication, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore. Pakistan; ²PhD Media & Communication University of Gujrat, Pakistan; ³Department of Media & Communication Studies, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Pakistan.

^{*1}saimaakhan242@gmail.com, ²muzmmilhussain886@gmail.com, ³ayeshasiddiqui764@gmail.com

Corresponding Author: *

Received: 05 November, 2023 Revised: 24 November, 2023 Accepted: 29 November, 2023 Published: 06 December, 2023

ABSTRACT

In Pakistan radio and television have always had a significant impact on the overall media landscape. However, Pakistan is not an exception to the global phenomenon that has been social media's rise. The use of social media platforms like Facebook, Instagram, YouTube, and Twitter has increased across the country, changing the way people share and consume information. More Pakistanis are now able to access social media thanks to the expansion of internet connectivity in the country. This has been made possible by the widespread availability of smartphones and reasonably priced data packages. This study examines the decline of electronic media and rise of social media in Pakistan. Interview method has been used to collect data from the defined participants (comprising of university students and journalists). Findings of the study suggest that number factors have participated in the apparent decline of electronic media in Pakistan; internet penetration, majority youth population, perceived bias, trust issues, controlled media and news credibility being the dominant ones. On the other hand social activism, interactive nature, user friendly and uncensored nature of social media gave credit to increased social media engagement in Pakistan.

Keywords: *Electronic media, decline, social media, credibility, internet penetration, media bias*

INTRODUCTION

There is no denying the media's impact on society. Its influence extends to almost every area of life and every corner of the globe. In Pakistan's past, the media has served pro-democracy movements as well as the goals of both military and civilian governments. It served as the state's platform for a unified national stance on matters of foreign and domestic policy. Private cable and satellite TV channels have proliferated since 2002 as a result of media deregulation. Pakistan now has 4,060 cable operators, 112 satellite TV channels, and 43 international TV channels such as BBC, CNN, etc. (Maqbool, 2021).

Over the past few decades, traditional media has undergone a profound transformation from being the primary source of news and entertainment for millions of people worldwide. The way we consume

information and entertainment has changed dramatically with the introduction of the internet and the explosive growth of digital technology. The relevance and influence of traditional media, such as radio, television, newspapers, and magazines, has consequently greatly decreased (Meyer, 2023).

The emergence of digital media platforms is the main factor causing traditional media to decline. The internet has made it possible for people and organizations to freely create and share content, democratizing the flow of information. The new go-to places for news and entertainment are streaming services, podcasts, social media sites, and online news websites. Audiences have shifted from traditional media to digital media due to its accessibility, convenience, and interactivity (Allen, 2019).

Many traditional media outlets have historically relied on advertising revenue as their main source of funding. But traditional media has been severely impacted by the move in advertising spending from print and television to online platforms. Businesses seeking a return on investment find online advertising more appealing because it provides more measurable and targeted options. As a result, traditional media's ad revenue has drastically decreased, which has made it more difficult for them to create high-quality content (Money, n.d).

The proliferation of regional, privately-owned satellite television channels that are carried by cable networks is a direct result of the media's liberalization. It has since gained a reputation for being lively and scathing of the government. Today, private news channels have enormous influence; many celebrity evening news anchors lead important programs that shape public opinion (WIKE, et al., 2022).

The introduction of Dish, Cable, and Private Channels along with Satellite TV expanded people's awareness. The Pakistani government came to understand the importance and potential of private electronic media, which could not be circumvented by using only state-run television. In order to regulate this industry, government policies pertaining to electronic media took a different approach (Ali, Jan, & Bukhari, 2013).

Local newspapers' long-standing business models are under extreme strain as readership is dwindling, advertising is declining, and overall revenues are falling. The losses incurred by the print side of the business have not been remotely offset by the growth of digital. In order to stay profitable or at the very least reduce operating losses, the majority of newspaper companies have responded by reducing expenses. Although the broadcasting industry has fared better than other industries in the digital age, as a business, radio and television are still more frequently organized regionally than locally, and they usually only invest a small amount of money in local journalism. Compared to most other nations, the US has a more developed local television market that places a bigger focus on local news (Nielsen, 2015).

Because they are perceived as biased and influenced by dishonest political leaders, Pakistani media outlets and journalists are generally viewed as

dishonest. The public's mistrust and belief in the media's incredibility have been cemented by this unfavorable view (Manuel, 2013)

Even Imran Khan, the prime minister of Pakistan at the moment, has claimed that "people have lost interest in meaningless current affairs shows" and accused media outlets of using their fabricated shows to conceal the corruption of past administrations (Shabbir, 2020).

The credibility of Pakistani media has been heavily debated in relation to the presumptions and accusations that the mainstream media is biased since the advent of digitalization. This study aims to look into this matter among the younger generation of media professionals. It has been observed that well-known Pakistani media outlets regularly use their standards to violate journalistic ethics, and the widespread belief that journalists are not carrying out their moral obligations is being reinforced by the rise of digitalization. These days, the main goal of Pakistani media outlets has shifted from unbiasedly reporting the truth to making money. The practice of news verification and source validation has been superseded by the rush to cover breaking news (Ali, 2021).

In the meantime, professionals who see objectivity, honesty, and credibility as fundamental components of ethical journalism are being marginalized (Abbas, 2012).

Pakistan's media sector, which was once thought to be one of the liveliest in South Asia, is rapidly contracting as a result of the firing of thousands of journalists and employees and the closure of multiple outlets in recent months. Even large and established media companies have been forced to close their publications and fire journalists due to the nation's failing economy, which is also being exacerbated by the government's withdrawal of subsidies and declining advertising revenue (Rehmat, 2019).

The traditional media, which includes print and electronic media and is regarded as the foundation of society, can be extremely helpful in this area because of its objectivity in providing accurate information as well as professional opinions on the topics and events. Scholars have also examined the various methods used to investigate objectivity in news media, such as validity and trust in the media. What they have discovered is that people living in democratic societies think the media is the only

forum available to them for speaking out on issues both locally and nationally and for resolving them (Semary & Khaja, 2013).

No institution is more vulnerable to the deterioration of credibility than journalism and the mainstream media, which are still widely regarded as vital to democracy. According to Gallup data, in 2016 only approximately 32% of American adults said they trusted the media "a great deal" or "a fair amount." In comparison, the highest percentage was 55% in 1999. "No question: trust is our greatest challenge," observes eminent Washington Post editor Martin Baron. He claims that social media adaptation and monetization are "pale in comparison" (Huang, 2013).

Despite the low level of public trust in the media, news produced by mainstream journalists "remains an important part of public life," according to extensive surveys conducted in 2016 during the US presidential election (Gottfried, Barthel, Shearer, & Mitchell., 2016).

The public and critics of the media have paid close attention to media credibility in this day and age, when the Internet has developed into a dynamic information source, especially as a result of the widespread use of digital media and electronic media (Willnat, Weaver, & Wilhoit, 2017).

Without a doubt, Pakistani news outlets gained popularity in the new millennium as a reliable source of information and thought-provoking discussions. But there are a lot of unanswered questions in the digital age, chief among them being whether electronic news media is credible and easily accessible (Hunter, 2020).

The world has become "a borderless town," as Marshal McLuhan put it, thanks to the impact of communication and the free flow of information. In the current situation, civilization could not advance without organized, structured communication and knowledge (Hungbo, 2007).

Without a doubt, the news media is a vibrant source of global information and plays a significant role in influencing people's narratives and public opinion. People have, nevertheless, also examined the sources and formed opinions regarding media outlets and organizations. Their opinions about the media are derived from their examination and analysis of the stories that the media covers, which shapes their

perceptions, whether favorable or unfavorable (Ceron & Memoli, 2016).

The rapid dissemination of information, the ease of access to vast information repositories, and the abundance of social interaction opportunities afforded by the digital age have fundamentally changed how people behave with regard to media content. Because news channels' content has such a profound impact on our social and political spheres, the practice of endorsing their credibility has grown increasingly important among individuals and political groups in the modern world (Flanagin & Metzger, 2008).

Globally, social scientists study phenomena and problems related to public opinion and people's interest in news media. In recent years, a scholarly discourse has emerged to analyze the factors that contribute to the public's lack of confidence in the news media. The news media is accused of swaying public opinion through its consistently conservative, biased reporting, unrelenting dissemination of standardized opinion, and unrestrained flow of sensationalism and news from around the globe. By spreading rudimentary and superficial knowledge, the news media are swaying public opinion and producing a large number of uninformed people, many of whom are biased and irrational (Quackenbush, 2013).

Rather than any obvious intentions of professional responsibility by the journalists, the elements involved in shaping public opinion are expressive of the political inclinations and "game framing, in which political issues are treated as strategic contests" (McLeod, Wise, & Perryman, 2017).

Traditional journalism is considered credible because of its depth of coverage, which includes analysis, discussion, and commentary on the events, as well as the long history of seasoned correspondents and editors (Semary & Khaja, 2013). that news outlets are biased in terms of politics and ideologies. There is blatant disparity in the attention, time, and opportunities given to political party representatives on contentious issues. In place of the preferred party's representative, an inept and unfit one is chosen. Additionally, their biases are revealed by the language they use in news reports and in the closing remarks of current affairs programs. Without conducting a thorough investigation, anchors attempt to manipulate news stories, whether they are political

or not, by critiquing opposition parties' manifestos and methods. They frequently criticize opponents without cause and support the philosophies and points of view of the party or parties with which they are affiliated (Saeed, Farooq, Khan, & Mahmood, 2021).

LITERATURE REVIEW

The fields of education, advertising, and business have all been entirely surpassed by the influence of social media. It is now an essential component of people's day-to-day lives and has left an indelible mark on the manner in which they connect with one another. An example of this would be how WhatsApp has entirely revolutionized and enhanced the culture of instant messaging (IM). As long as you have access to the internet, you are able to send a text message to anyone in the globe at this time. Other social media platforms, such as Facebook, Twitter, LinkedIn, and Instagram, have also played a role in this transformation, particularly WhatsApp. The function of social media in the realm of communication is a topic that is constantly addressed. Because of the proliferation of internet communication, information has now being disseminated to audiences and individuals who were previously inaccessible. As a direct consequence of it, people are now more attentive to the events that are taking on in different regions of the world. The distribution of information on the fire in the Amazon Rainforest is a perfect example of the reach that social media can have. All of this started with a single post, which swiftly propagated across several social media sites and appeared in the newsfeeds of all users almost immediately. There is an increase in the number of individuals utilizing social media, which has led to the dissemination of movements, advertisements, and items on these platforms. The marketing and sales of items, as well as the development of brand recognition, are increasingly largely dependent on social media platforms for businesses. It gives companies the ability to connect with customers regardless of where they are located. As a result of the internet, the human race now has access to a resource that offers benefits and reach that are beyond anyone's wildest imagination (UCW, 2023).

The days when friends and family would gather around a television to watch shows that major

broadcasters would air at set times are long gone. It has long been anticipated that "linear TV" would eventually die, and this is especially true of TV news programming. Unless it's breaking news, it has already been seen simply as the "news" on ones preferred social media platforms, such as Facebook, Twitter, LinkedIn, or YouTube, by the time they get to turn on the TV. Most likely, it is done as soon as when the eyes are opened in the morning. If not, it is seen during the course of the day—during lunch break, on way back home that evening, or during your commute to work (PELI, 2021).

These days, people consume news and other media instantly as it happens on a variety of online platforms. The public can now have mobile access to the internet whenever and wherever they want thanks to technological advancements of the 21st century. In addition, there is now a new demand for news stories that can be found anywhere, at any time. Although it's a bit of a chicken and egg situation, traditional broadcasters must change in response to this technological advancement and the public's growing demand for access to news in real time (PELI, 2021).

As was previously mentioned, people now consume news and other media instantly as it happens on a variety of online platforms. The public can now have mobile access to the internet whenever and wherever they want thanks to technological advancements of the 21st century. In addition, there is now a new demand for news stories that can be found anywhere, at any time. Although it's a bit of a chicken and egg situation, traditional broadcasters must change in response to this technological advancement and the public's growing demand for access to news in real time (eCampusOntario, 2021).

A strategy used by broadcasters to adapt is their active participation in social media. With the growth of social media streaming, this has become particularly evident. Live-streaming content, which was previously dismissed by many as a passing fad, has possibly evolved into a major broadcaster's mainstay. It makes sense that they would use social media streaming to spread their content because people are always near an internet-connected device and news spreads quickly in these situations. It is a medium that can accommodate any kind of news, from professional, multi-camera livestreams via online platforms dedicated to this service, to "citizen

journalism" shot from a smartphone for instant footage at the scene of a story (Gupta, 2023).

In recent years, traditional media has seen a significant drop as a direct result of the emergence of digital media. Customers who are considering making a purchase are becoming less reliant on advertising that are published in conventional media since they are now able to browse, investigate, and discuss any firm and create their own judgments. Another element that is contributing to the decline of conventional media is the capacity of consumers to tune out traditional media by ignoring ads and moving in between different radio stations. As a consequence of this, marketing endeavors are usually neglected or seen to be useless (Whacked Out, 2019).

The mass media serves as a crucial conduit for essential national information to reach rural residents. Television and radio are examples of mass media that can be used to remind people of important facts or to influence target audiences to adopt new behaviors. They can also provide the public with updates in addition to telling them about newly discovered diseases and where to get help. Similarly, electronic media has a significant impact on how we live our daily lives and shapes the student. Electronic magazines, radio, television, and the internet are a few examples of electronic media. The benefits of electronic media are numerous. Electronic media provides students with a wealth of knowledge and information. Because everyone uses some form of electronic media to stay updated, raising awareness in society is best done through electronic media. Everyone is in favor of the advantages that electronic media bring (Sangeetha & Vanitha, 2019).

The main factor contributing to print media's decline was technological innovation. Not surprisingly, technological innovation has also contributed to the decline of the TV news industry. The nation is witnessing a digital media revolution propelled by technological advancement. These days, watching TV in front of the TV seems very outdated. These days, staying online is the norm. Furthermore, internet access and smartphones are no longer considered luxury items in Pakistan. Instead of watching news on television, people can now get it on their smartphones thanks to technological advancements. Additionally, the financial problems facing Pakistan's TV news channel industry have

been made worse by the current government's decision to reduce the advertising budget. In the past, governments would pay news channels significantly more to purchase airtime. For the same duration and time slot, government advertising rates were roughly three times higher than those of private companies. The sudden decline in government advertisement revenue has left most news channels in dire financial straits (Whitney, 2021).

The shifting demographics in Pakistan are another factor causing the broadcast media industry to decline. In Pakistan, the youth make up the bulk of the population. As per a recent study conducted by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), 64% of Pakistan's total population is under 30 years old. Television does not pique the interest of young people. For them, watching the news on TV is tedious. The youth demographic is predominantly highly engaged on social media platforms. Social media is their primary source of news, and they rarely have free time to watch TV. Young children are becoming more interested in news, so they watch television too. People watch news from social networks as well, though it's not as trustworthy (Whitney, 2021).

TV networks are constantly introducing new methods in an effort to gain popularity and high ratings. Because of their academic training, media managers occasionally exhibit a lack of professionalism because some of them are unaware of broadcasting. Undoubtedly, the channels' fairness has become ambiguous due to multiple instances of their favoritism and inflated tiers. It is a widely known fact that media outlets base their agenda framing and agenda cutting strategies on their preconceptions, and as a result, they disseminate news in a biased manner (Zahra, Afsar, & Zaheer, 2022).

OBJECTIVES

Current study focuses on following research objectives;

- To understand the potential reasons for decline of electronic media in Pakistan.
- To study the potential substitutes of electronic media in Pakistan.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS

This research focuses on following research questions;
 Do social media penetration decline electronic media viewership in Pakistan?
 What are the reasons for decline of electronic media viewership in Pakistan?

Decline of electronic media and rise of social; is it good or bad?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comparison of both • Social implications
--	---

METHODOLOGY

This study uses qualitative research method. Purposive sampling method has been used to draw the sample from defined population i.e., journalists and university students. Extensive interviews were scheduled with prior consent of the all 15 participants (journalists and students studying media studies and journalism). Responses were recoded and later transcribed for the analysis.

Results and Discussion

Interviews were conducted based on following categories and sub categories;

Categories	Sub categories
Scope of electronic media in Pakistan	Information <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Entertainment • Viewership • Social significance, • Awareness • Cultural importance
Decline of electronic media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low viewership • Rise of digital media
Reasons for decline in electronic media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Censored media content • Perceived Bias, • Political Influence • Sensationalism • Misinformation and Fake News • Economic Pressures • Cultural and Religious Sensitivities
Rise of digital particularly social media	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhanced internet penetration • Youth population • More accessible information • User friendly • Interactivity • Citizen journalism • Political and social activism

Scope of Electronic Media in Pakistan

Most of the respondents of the interview believe that the electronic media plays a significant part in society. Electronic media in Pakistan has emerged as the most influential medium at the moment as it disseminates knowledge, entertainment, and education. It gives us up-to-date information on happenings and advancements. Pakistan has a vibrant media landscape with diverse sources of information. It has a long history of defending rights of the public. It keeps the people informed about the corruption of politicians, with every small detail. The primary source of electronic media is television. It is significantly contributing to raising public awareness of the nation's social, economic, and health issues. In Pakistan, television effectively fulfills its threefold purpose of providing the people with information, education, and entertainment. There are many energetic and gifted journalists working in Pakistan's media outlets. News outlets in Pakistan are becoming more and more of a constructive forum for discussion and criticism. These media outlets support the nation's economic expansion by operating their own businesses. Similarly, Media messages have a profound effect on society and play a key role in establishing norms that are widely accepted (Ali, Jan, & Bukhari, 2013). Respondents believe that media is often said to be a reflection of society and culture, however, it has most influential role in reshaping and recreating cultural values in a society. Dramas, films and other pieces of cultural representation are often attributed as the most influential in terms of cultural representation and determination. TV plays more influential part in this regard.

Decline of Electronic Media

Because the electronic media is a billion-dollar industry, its primary goal is still to make money rather than to bring society together. As such, it has a very important responsibility to act as the custodian of the facts. The electronic media frequently searches for controversy, sensationalism, and negative news to make headlines. In certain cases, the electronic

media feels that it has the right to interpret what is good or bad for society using its own standards. Likewise, the electronic media was largely and widely used by our previous regimes as a tool of self-propaganda; as a result, the public lost trust in the media due to its poor quality, unreliable reporting, and unimaginative presentation of events and stories. Participants of the interview opined that despite the significant role of electronic media in society, it has been witnessed declining rapidly. They opine that over the years Pakistan has witnessed decreased TV viewership.

Reasons for Decline in Electronic Media

Concern has grown in recent years over Pakistan's declining viewership of mainstream media. Television and print media, which were once widely regarded as the main sources of entertainment and information for the public, are seeing a sharp decline in viewership. Participants have attributed number of reasons for this decline. Digital transformation is top of them. The swift ascent of digital platforms is among the principal causes of the reduction in the audience size of mainstream media. People can now access news and entertainment content online thanks to the widespread use of smartphones and the low cost of internet access. Local streaming services, Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube have all grown in popularity as news and entertainment platforms. Nowadays, viewers can access content whenever it's convenient for them, frequently without the commercial breaks that are typical of traditional media. Similarly, they also think the youth demographics also play a part in this declining TV viewership in Pakistan. The younger generation now prefers digital media over traditional media. They are more likely to use social media and digital platforms to get their news and entertainment because they provide a greater selection of content and real-time interaction opportunities. Due to this change in consumer behavior, traditional media is finding it difficult to grow and keep their audiences.

Additionally, trust issues also participated in this deterioration of electronic media particularly TV. Participants of the interview opine that over the years, Pakistan's mainstream media has experienced its fair share of credibility problems. The public's faith in traditional news organizations has been damaged by the dissemination of false information,

biased reporting, and sensationalism. People are looking for alternative information sources, such as social media and independent digital news platforms, as a result of this lack of trust. A study supports the question of credibility because they are perceived as biased and influenced by dishonest political leaders, Pakistani media outlets and journalists are generally viewed as dishonest. The public's mistrust and belief in the media's incredibility have been cemented by this unfavorable view (Manuel, 2013).

Similarly, the proliferation of news channels and publications in Pakistan has resulted in a more fragmented media landscape. Though in theory this diversity should accommodate a greater variety of viewpoints and interests, it has also resulted in intense competition for both advertising revenue and viewership. A race to the bottom has occasionally resulted from this competition, with sensationalism and sensational reporting growing in popularity. Likewise, in the current scenario perceived bias, political pressures, censorship and propaganda leading to disinformation and fake news have also been cited among major reasons for decline in credibility of TV.

Rise of Digital Particularly Social Media

An increase in video-centric networks such as TikTok and a decline in user engagement on established platforms like Facebook are contributing factors to the evolution of social media. Nevertheless, despite the increasing fragmentation of channels and data indicating that public apprehension regarding deceptive information and algorithms is nearly at an all-time high, our dependence on these platforms continues to grow. It is indisputable from the data that this shift is significantly influenced by the practices of younger generations, who have been raised with social media and frequently accord greater credibility to personalities and influencers than to journalists, even in matters pertaining to news (Newman, 2023)

Journalists agreed to the idea that social media has attracted most of the TV viewers. They opine that social media offers a medium for the quick spread of knowledge. Compared to traditional electronic media, it enables a more immediate and widespread impact by enabling users to share news, opinions, and content quickly.

When it comes to engagement and interaction, social media surpasses traditional media. An interactive and dynamic environment is created by users' ability to share, discuss, and remark on content. In Pakistan, social media has proven to be an effective instrument for social and political activism. It has helped to raise awareness of issues and mobilize people for a variety of causes. Students view social media's interactive nature as more democratic as they find it best way of freedom of expression. They think that they can share their personal views on different issues of social and public worth. Similarly, citizen journalism supported by social media is also for them gate keeping and agenda setting of TV limits freedom speech. Quick consumption and production of the information about important topic has only been possible due to social media platforms. Additionally, students also think that traditional news on TV is mostly political with sensationalism and dramatization. They think that there are other issues that are of greater public interest and completely undermined by the TV news reporting. They labeled such media choices for their corporate purposes and financial gains. Despite the heavily privatized media landscape its does not seem to be free to address public concerns may be due to the sponsored topics being covered in general.

Decline of Electronic Media and Rise of Social; Is It Good or Bad?

Most of the participants gave mixed responses in this regard. Journalists expressed few concerns about the extraordinary free nature of social media especially in a country like Pakistan. they doubted some adverse consequences like propaganda, misinformation, fake news and many others. However, they insisted that traditional media needs to address the concerns of public and transform its way of reporting an issue in hand so that credibility and lack of trust can be well handled. Students, on the hand, think that traditional media such as TV needs to be freer in its expressions and avoid biases and corporate pursuits so that viewers can feel their voices being carried out well through such outlets often called "voice of people". Adaptations are required at both ends so that a healthy society can grow based on authentic and reliable media platforms irrespective their nature of being traditional or new.

CONCLUSION

The decrease in the amount of people in Pakistan who watch mainstream media is a complicated problem with wide-ranging effects. The decline in trust, a fragmented media landscape, and economic challenges have all contributed to the decline in media quality, even in addition to the significant role played by digital transformation and shifting consumer preferences. Media organizations must make investments in high-caliber journalism, adjust to the shifting media landscape, and win back the trust of their audiences in order to meet these challenges. Initiatives to promote media literacy can also assist the general public in separating reliable sources from false information in the digital age. The ability of Pakistani media to adapt and stay relevant in a rapidly changing information ecosystem will determine its future. Even though social media has become more popular, radio and television are still important forms of traditional electronic media. For many Pakistanis, television is still their main source of news and entertainment in particular. There is a wide range of privately owned and state-owned media outlets in the nation. Since traditional media has always been a well acknowledged source of social construction, there is need to look into its responsibilities towards people and society once again and prove its worth in more effective and productive way.

REFERENCES

- Whacked Out. (2019). *How Digital Media Is Overtaking Traditional Media*. Retrieved from <https://www.whackedout.in/blog/2019/08/09/how-digital-media-is-overtaking-traditional-media/>
- Abbas, M. (2012). *Can Pakistan's corrupt media be checked? Committee to Protect Journalists*. Retrieved from <https://cpj.org/2012/06/can-pakistans-corrupt-media-be-checked/>
- Ali, S. W. (2021). *Pakistan's electronic media-credibility crisis*. Retrieved from <https://dailytimes.com.pk/773586/pakistans-electronic-media-credibility-crisis/>

- Ali, Z., Jan, M., & Bukhari, S. Q. (2013). ROLE OF ELECTRONIC MEDIA IN CHANGING VALUE SYSTEM IN PAKISTAN. *The International Asian Research Journal*, 01(01), 59-65.
- Allen, S. (2019). Social media's growing impact on our lives . *American Psychological Association* , <https://www.apa.org/members/content/social-media-research>.
- Ceron, A., & Memoli, V. (2016). Flames and Debates: Do social media affect satisfaction with democracy? . *Social Indicators Research*, 126(1), 225–240.
- eCampusOntario. (2021). Digital and Social media. *Advanced professional communication* , <https://ecampusontario.pressbooks.pub/llsadvcomm/chapter/7-1-the-evolution-of-digital-media/>.
- Flanagin, A. J., & Metzger, M. J. (2008). Digital media and youth: Unparalleled opportunity and unprecedented responsibility. *MacArthur Foundation Digital Media and Learning Initiative* , <https://doi.org/10.1162/dmal.9780262562324.005>.
- Gottfried, J., Barthel, M., Shearer, E., & Mitchell, A. (2016). “The 2016 Presidential Campaign—A News Event That’s Hard to Miss.” . *Pew Research Center, Journalism & Media*, <http://www.journalism.org/2017/05/10/americans-attitudes-about-the-news-media-deeply-divided-along-partisan-lines/>.
- Gupta, S. (2023). The Impact of Digital Media – The Society, Future, and Our Lifestyle . <https://www.incrementors.com/blog/impact-of-digital-media/>.
- Huang, C. (2013). “Martin Baron: Loss of Public Trust is Journalism’s Greatest Challenge.”. Retrieved from <https://blog.wanifra.org/2016/03/11/martybaron-loss-of-public-trust-is-journalisms-greatest-challenge>
- Hungbo, J. (2007). Credible news measures: A medium’s integrity. *Nebula*, 4(1), 276–284.
- Hunter, R. (2020). Education in Pakistan. . *WENR*, <https://wenr.wes.org/2020/02/education-in-pakistan>.
- Manuel, S. (2013). Charting Pakistan’s media credibility. *Journalism Pakistan*, <http://www.journalismpakistan.com/Charting-Pakistans-media-credibility>.
- Maqbool, N. (2021). The Electronic Media Economy in Pakistan: Issues and Challenges. *Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE)*, 1-8.
- McLeod, D. M., Wise, D., & Perryman, M. (2017). Thinking about the media: A review of theory and research on media perceptions, media effects perceptions, and their consequences. *Review of Communication Research*, 5 , 35–83.
- Meyer, R. (2023). *The Decline of Traditional Media: Adapting in the Digital Age*. Retrieved from <https://www.newmediaandmarketing.com/the-decline-of-traditional-media-adapting-in-the-digital-age/>
- Money, F. (n.d). Current Trends in Electronic Media. <https://opentext.wsu.edu/com101/chapter/16-4-current-trends-in-electronic-media/>.
- Newman, N. (2023). *Overview and key findings of the 2023 Digital News Report*. Retrieved from <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/digital-news-report/2023/dnr-executive-summary>
- Nielsen, R. K. (2015). *Local Journalism; the decline of newspapers and the rise of digital media* . London: University of Oxford.
- PELI. (2021). *The Effects of Social Media on Traditional Broadcast News Media*. Retrieved from <https://blog.peli.com/areas-of-interest/photography-broadcasting/effects-of-social-media-on-broadcast-media>
- Quackenbush, D. (2013). Public perceptions of media bias: A meta-analysis of American media outlets during the 2012 presidential election. *Elon Journal of Undergraduate Research in Communications*, 4(2), 52–65.
- Rehmat, A. (2019). WHY IS PAKISTAN’S MEDIA IN CRISIS? *Dawn*, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1495230/why-is-pakistans-media-in-crisis>.

- Saeed, M., Farooq, T., Khan, M. A., & Mahmood, N. (2021). Perception of Electronic News Media of Pakistan in the Digital Age. *Asian Journal for Public Opinion Research*, 9(3), 293–306.
<https://doi.org/10.15206/ajpor.2021.9.3.293>.
- Sangeetha, N., & Vanitha, J. (2019). A Study on the Impact of Electronic Media in Relation to Social Awareness among High School Students in Coimbatore District. *International Journal of Education*, 7(3), 16–25.
- Semary, H. E., & Khaja, M. A. (2013). The credibility of citizen journalism and traditional TV journalism among Emirati youth: Comparative study. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research*, 3(11), 53–62.
- Shabbir, A. (2020). *Corrupt people used media to hide their corruption: PM Khan*. Retrieved from <https://www.samaa.tv/news/pakistan/2020/04/corrupt-people-used-media-to-hide-their-corruption-pm-khan/>
- UCW. (2023). *How has social media emerged as a powerful communication medium?* Retrieved from <https://www.ucanwest.ca/blog/media-communication/how-has-social-media-emerged-as-a-powerful-communication-medium/>
- Whitney. (2021). Shrinking Advertisement Revenues: Decline of Pakistani TV New Channel Industry. <https://www.businessmodulehub.com/blog/shrinking-advertisement-revenues-decline-of-pakistani-tv-new-channel-industry/>.
- WIKE, R., SILVER, L., FETTEROLF, J., HUANG, C., AUSTIN, S., CLANCY, L., & GUBBALA, S. (2022). Views of social media and its impacts on society. *Pew Research Center*, <https://www.pewresearch.org/global/2022/12/06/views-of-social-media-and-its-impacts-on-society-in-advanced-economies-2022/>.
- Willnat, L., Weaver, D. H., & Wilhoit, G. C. (2017). The American Journalist in the Digital Age. *Journalism Studies*, DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2017.1387071.
- Zahra, N., Afsar, H. A., & Zaheer, K. (2022). Analysis of issues and challenges of media and its sustainability a case study of electronic media in Pakistan. *Pak. Journal of Int’L Affairs*, 5(2), 1532-1546.