

IMPACT OF VISUAL AIDS AND PICTORIAL IMAGES ON CREATIVE WRITING SKILL OF ESL STUDENTS AT SECONDARY LEVEL

Imdad Hussain*¹, Dr. Perveen Akhter Farhat², Dr. Ghulamullah³

*¹M.Phil. English (Linguistics), Lahore Leads University Lahore, Punjab Pakistan; ²Assistant Professor, Department of English, Lahore Leads University Lahore, Punjab Pakistan; ³Deputy District Education Officer Tehsil Sheikhpura, District Sheikhpura, Punjab, Pakistan

*¹imdadscholar@gmail.com; ²parveen607@yahoo.com; ³drgmullah@gmail.com

Corresponding Author: *

Received: 6 October, 2023 Revised: 03 November, 2023 Accepted: 13 November, 2023 Published: 26 November, 2023

ABSTRACT

The present study is determining the impact of visual aids and pictorial images on the creative writing of ESL learner in Pakistani context. The research was conducted in a public sector high school of district Lahore during summer vacations. For ethical consideration institute name was not mentioned. Using purposive sampling technique, the researchers selected sixty students of ninth class and divided them in two equal groups, named controlled and experimental groups, the earlier was treated in traditional style and the later was treated by means of visual aids and pictures. The treatment period was contained on three months three hours daily. The data was composed by using pretest and posttest methods, the collected data was later analyzed by using SPSS software latest version. The analyzed data was presented in tables. The posttest results showed significant difference in the scores of both groups, as experimental group performed better than controlled group, while in pretest their score was almost same. The results suggested that visual aids and pictures improved the creative writing of these students, and it's better than traditional style of learning. In nutshell the research will instigate to the educators for employing new approaches in English language learning.

Keywords: ESL learners, writing skill, Creative writing, Visual aids, pictorial mages, Experimental research

INTRODUCTION

In this part of the research paper researchers tried to identify function of research; which looks for inspecting the effectiveness of using pictures in improving 9th graders' writing skills. Writing skill is much tough and several metacognition events occurs in it, for instance, it brightens ideology, arrangement, management, outlining, enlightening, refining etc. and many more. The features of cognition hold specific contemplation, as per investigators exerted to recognize the intellectual capacity of ESL learners. Writing skill is difficult principally for those learners who have to write in an unacquainted language in their instructive context. The procedure of writing is measured like utmost complex and multifaceted skill

in English language compared to other three skills. In fact, skillful writers become busy in determining self direction in the processes of writing (Harris & Graham, 2009).

The creative mode of writing means to put one's thoughts and emotions about some specific matter on paper by using one's thoughts liberally. Moreover, creative mode of writing is original and imaginative instead of truth or homogeneity of ideas, it is a chronological attempt to care for an activity of creativity instead of understanding. Recognition of writing process is very important and writing is not an inborn capacity but it is an ability of cognition. The ability is obtained by the schooling of years

(Khan, 2011). In fact, English is taken like a secondary language in our educational system and the skill of writing is essential here, throughout the entire ESL learning, therefore, ESL learners face huge complexity in writing skill. The instruction is not self-governing in Pakistani context regarding motives like curriculum and valuation. In addition, teachers are reliant on lacking the permission of the authority, they cannot instruct self-reliantly, especially, the responsibility of an autocratic curriculum and powerfully acknowledged the organization of valuation has unclear teachers' particular freedom and diminished their inventiveness (Saleem & Haider, 2019). In this condition, the study is prearranged to attain the aim of evolving creative writing of ESL learners at secondary school level district Lahore.

PROBLEM STATEMENT

The procedures of writings are confusing to a superfluous limit as these seems, for the reason that it comprises several rudiments alike spellings, punctuations, using words and writing system suitably in appropriate mode. Media is a factor of coaching to support the coaching process along with gaining knowledge and it may consist in texts, pictures, animations, images, videos, and sounds. Lack of facilities for good learnings is a great hurdle in the way of increasing writing ability in government institutes and development level is slow than government expectation. Thus, it failed to accomplish the anticipated levels planned to introduce in institutes. In such a confused situation, visual aids and pictures can be a grand motivation for the production of a language and can be applied in the ESL classroom in many ways. Pictorial images deliver imagination, motivation, a logic of the contextual language and definite allusions. Many pictorial images are particularly suitable for entire stages of diction, conversation, sentence structure, writings and literary material can be planned from the pictorial applications, which will prove helpful in improving writing ability of ESL learners. Henceforth, to control this condition, the current research observed the effects of pictorial images on ESL learners' creative writings.

OBJECTIVES OF RESEARCH

The research objectives are:

- To identify worth of using picture series for enhancing ESL students' writing ability.
- To find out how visual aids may be helpful in developing story writing.
-

RESEARCH QUESTION

This research is constructed on the following question:

- I. What is the impact of visual aids learning method on ESL learners writing skills?

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

- The research is conducted only in one district, disregarding many others contextual settings as divisional, provincials, national, and international settings.
- The research is limited to build up the writing ability of English language, while other skills were ignored.
- Population was a public secondary school of district Lahore sidestepping private schools. Sample size is also limited to sixty students can be increased.
- Rao, Jeevan & Ahmad, (2023) stated that "gender is always considered an important factor for the teaching and learning process in every research work" (P,319). But in the present research female gender is ignored.
- Only matriculation classes have been sampled. The research is limited to coaching of skill of English writing by applying visual aids pictorial images in English for 9th class.
- The research lasted for three months which is a limited time.

RESEARCH SIGNIFICANCE

The present research work is very significant from many prospectives as the implications in the present study give the impression of validity that it is new study about ESL writing skill and the study might be very significant for ESL teachers while plannings to place and exercise new approaches, arrangements and methods to improvement in ESL learners writing skill. Inspires and stimulates ESL students to employ visual aids tool for refining their writing skill. Designers are regulating, organizing

and advancing the syllabuses for ESL learners by means of diverse instructions, approaches and arrangements for teaching and visual aids are also used in ESL learning as a new technological advancement.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The process of writing is a multifaceted, which offers eternal record of ideas and emotions also allowing us to communicate not only with age group but also with upcoming generation (Ahmad, Shahid, Farhat, 2023). Writing can be described as a change in nature; an everlasting change in manners over time and this is done partially by the awareness of writing process. Getting writing skill can be emphasized with dissimilar coaching acquiring sources since they stimulate, inspire and concentrate on the interest of students during the process of instructions. Ahmad, Maitlo & Jeevan, (2023) stated that academic writing is used in the assignments, exams and publications; so, learners are trained to get the knowledge of writing from textbooks and classrooms. It is the similar for the all class when they write a story or an essay. They are not persuaded to write down their own tales applying some type of techniques. They are not aware that 'creativity' means to make something originally. Although, creativity in writing skill is educated successfully, it can give inspiration and confidence to the students, for building writing skill (Khan, 2011). The coaching of creative writing is limited to the coaching of classical literature English language in Pakistan as the poetry of Wordsworth, Keats and Coleridge, the Shakespearian dramas and Charles Dickens' novels. Instructors do not instruct literature mostly; they coach about the literature in the classroom. It is powerfully recommended that techniques applied for initial language gaining should be applied for learning of secondary language. Though, the teachers of the schools and colleges still have liking to coach the skill of writing through the creative technique, do not apply the method in coaching writing skill and the fundamental aims of getting writing are ignored (Ismiati & Pebriantika, 2020). Writing skill is being educated yet through the GTM (Grammar Translation Method) that is not taken as the learners' linguistic requirements. It is discussed that GTM is applied to coach writing skill in Pakistan. This is not creative skills effective for coaching the learning

writing skill in which the ability of communication and creativity are neglected and a huge pressure is placed on regulations and exemptions of English language (Khan, 2011). The requisites of the learners are that they should be educated that writing is an ability which may connect the writer with concentrating, thinking, mapping, arranging, and modifying to make a man-made article that is right to its outline, function and viewers (Khan, 2011). In contrast, Pakistani learners have no understanding about the different phases occupied in writing. They have no concept of sketching, planning, re-edit and improving their writing skill. They only study models of essays and copy them in the place of depending on images of senses, inspection and experiences of actual life. Their essays are lack of productive view. Therefore, they commit the similar mistakes repetitively.

VISUAL AIDS AND PICTURES

ESL teachers must employ new learning approaches in ESL classrooms but it's challenging for them because they have learned themselves in traditional style so they do not contemplate on new methodologies (Farhat, 2019). The usage visual aids generate the curiosity of students and support the instructors to explain the thoughts without difficulty. Visual aides are applied to persuade coaching writing ability in the classroom. Visual aids are the tools which are applied to persuade in the learning of creative writing in the classroom and make it easier and stimulating. The stuff is called instructional aids similar to maps, charts, radio, projectors, television, etc. Visual aids stimulate the attention of students and support the instructors to clarify the ideas with no trouble. Visual aids are images of senses which start or motivate and help in the process of learning. Visual aids are the tools which can be applied to do the experience of learning extra actual, extra correct and additional lively. Visual aids are devices that support to build a matter or session effortless to comprehend and identify (maps, photographs, charts, slides, real objects, videos, etc.). Many visual aids are present at present. These aids may be categorized as visual aids may be used like visual senses. Visual Aids give confidence to the movement of body and it may make stronger the control (Shabiralyani et al, 2015; Halwani, 2017; Haris et al, 2022). The usefulness of application of pictures for developing

writing ability may also be seen to encourage a range of wordings, as of fundamental easy sentences for making extra multifaceted articles for nearly some type of matters along with kinds. Applying pictures in learning records to promote usefulness of pictures in expressive writing, and grow the writing ability (Gutiérrez,2015).

RELATED STUDIES

There are many researches which point out reactions of the participants towards creative writing through visual aids after the completion of the experiment. Following are the researches which were evaluated to examine the attitude of the participants to creative writing by the researchers.

Yusnita & Sada (2012) explored that report writing text of learners can be improved by applying a series of pictures. Intention of the study was to make better the learners' report writing text by applying a series of pictures, because it was difficult for learners to get ideas in report writing on the base instructor's knowledge in coaching. Technique of the study is an act study for a group of students that is based on 2 phases. Forty learners of 10th class participated in the study. Results showed the learners' growth in writing ability in every phase, therefore, the application of a series of pictures proved helpful for learners in making better writing of report. By using a sample size of 165 participants from 11th class Pratiwi (2017) explored that applying pictures technique is helpful in enhancing learners' writing skill.

Wening (2017) discovered, writing is a creative ability that takes part a significant part in English language educating and being trained. On the other hand, educating the process of writing is a complex job, so it needs concentration of English instructors. Writing manufactured goods should accomplish some criteria, such as content, association, use of vocabulary, use of grammar, and mechanics in order to be a good quality one. Educational media is one of the parts that can assist the instructors in educating writing. This piece of writing intends to evaluate the role of picture cycle, as one of the educational media, in getting better learners' writing skill. It covers up the hypothesis, rule, study, and practice in educating writing, provides some instances of a variety of media in educating writing, draws attention to the part of

applying picture cycle in getting better learners' skill, and gives a instance of process of how to apply picture cycle. It is imagined that this piece of writing could give an instruction of educating writing by applying picture cycle and some proposals for upcoming practice and research.

Pérez & Sharples (2001) pointed that MEXICA is a sample of computer that makes outlines of foundation of tales for involvement-reflection of story writing. In involvement of MEXICA produces substance directed by content and symbolic restraints, keeping away from the use of clear objectives or story construction information. During reflection, the system shatters stalemates, estimates the innovation, awareness of development of story along with proves that logic obligations convinced. Likewise, MEXICA matches along with expands the computerized foundation of telling-story on usual problem-solving procedures where clear objectives compel the production of stories. This research tells the involvement-reflection story of writing, the universal uniqueness of MEXICA along with assessment program of stories.

Tok & Kandemir (2015), in the context of Turkey conducted research 7th class students in a middle school by using sampling of 31 students. The aim of this research was to observe students writing ability and results showed that applying creative mode of writing practices possesses an optimistic outcome.

Sapkota (2012) introduced acquiring to write some language that is a complex art. It is not an easy task to learn. The objective of the research is to develop the ability of writing by starting with correct coaching method. In this regard, an experiment applied to check progress of writing an essay. Collected data showed the improvement of students' performance. Students made more words and well-formed sentences in progress of test. Their errors were less than the previous pre-test. There was proper use of punctuation marks and paragraphs were arranged in good way. The technique of Peer and Teacher Correction was proved as productive way of developing writing skill.

Sampson et al, (2013) find how science specific argumentative writing skills of students and their understanding of ideas changed during the school years as they took part in series of instructional model of Argument-Driven Inquiry

(ADI) in science laboratories. The research was done in two middle schools and two high schools, the process happened over two semesters and at least the activities of eight laboratories included in each course. The data of students' learning were calculated by using an assessment of science content and assessment of science specific argumentative writing that were arranged at the beginning, middle, and end of the school year. The changes in the performances of the students in the two assessments over time showed that the students' science specific argumentative writing skills and their understanding of core scientific ideas had become better over the course of the time. Moreover, the students who took part in ADI activities showed much improvement in their writing skill.

Erdogan (2013) find out the impact of the creative drama method on teachers' writing skills in pre-service classroom and their behavior towards writing skills. Moreover, the ideas of the pre-service teachers relating the creative drama method were also checked out in the research. Twenty-four pre-service teachers studying at Karadeniz Technical University Fatih Faculty of Education were the participants of the research. Qualitative and quantitative methods of research are included in this study. Interviews of participants were taken to show their opinion on the creative drama method. The results of the research recommend that the creative drama method enhanced the participants' writing skills and their attitudes towards writing skills. It is also judged that the participants have positive opinions on the creative drama method.

Maitlo et al, (2023) conducted research to analyze the impact of picture series learning on the creative writing skills of ESL learners in the context of Sindh by using sample of sixty students, and dividing these students in two groups. The results revealed positive effects of picture series learning on creative writing. Although there are enough researches conducted in this field but these are not filling the some research gaps mentioned below.

RESEARCH GAP

I. It is observed that most of the researches were made at primary level, intermediate level and university level. The samplings of the researches were also different. The sample of the research is ideal i.e., sixty students and all the participants are

male. The samples of researches were taken from both genders. i.e., male and female. Different techniques were adopted for data collection i.e., survey, inspection system, questionnaire etc. In the research, a model questionnaire is adapted.

II. Secondly, the time is rapidly passing. With the passing time everything is being changed. The demands of the ages are also being altered. Every age has its own needs and demand with respect to art, literature and language as well. New ages require new models in every field of life. In this respect, all the previous researches were best for their time periods. It is new age that demands new research. That's why the research is made to fulfill the demand of the age.

III. Thirdly, rural and urban areas are quite different from each other. The rural areas are not alike. Urban areas have also differenced among their civilization, culture, traditions and customs. So, their language and literature have also variations. Their needs and demands are also different. Researches of different areas are not helpful for all other areas. They are limited to their specific areas. With respect to the needs and demands of the different areas, every area requires its own research. So, the area of the research demands for the research.

IV. Fourthly, in the area of research, it is seriously felt the need of research at secondary level. Ninth class is considered suitable for the project. The class is taken due to the good level of learning. The students of class are mature enough to understand. It is also observed that the students of this level are responsible. So, they were selected for the research project.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

"Research methodology is the part of the research study in which researchers give an account of the research methods, which they have used to conduct their research" (Ahmad, Maitlo & Jeevan, 2023, p, 402). In the methodology of the present research, researchers tried to find out the answers to four major problems regarding sentence formation, punctuation, a paragraph and a story under the use of pictures in 6-week sentence writing skills course. Hence, this part showed the results collected through applying the pretest and posttests for sentences writing skills on the 9th class learners at public high school in district Lahore. Full discussion and

interpretation of these results would be provided in the end. The section wraps the realistic facets along with process in the research. It gives a whole report of the method of the research design, the population, the sample, the instrumentation, the description of the study tools, validity and reliability.

Research design is mainly the sketch to carry out and perform the research applying different variables. It consists of all processes and their sub-processes of the conduction of research (Ahmad, Farhat & Choudhary, 2022). In this quasi-experimental project, the researchers applied a statistical plan to inspect the results of PSL in secondary school students' ability of writing. The preliminary assessment of this research project showed that quantitative research method would be more suitable than the qualitative to examine the research questions of the study.

“The population is defined as a set of individuals, data, or items from which a statistical sample is taken” (Younus, Farhat & Ahmad, 2023). The population of the present research was a public high school of district Lahore, and research was accomplished by purposively selecting sample of the 60 students from this school. The ages, grades, and writing ability of these students was almost equal. English subject is concerned in this research because it's taught as a compulsory subject in Pakistani government schools. The researchers divided these students in two equal groups named experimental and controlled groups. The researchers employed two dissimilar instructional methods on these groups, as experimental group was taught by using visual aids and controlled group was taught in traditional method. The duration of class at school is forty minutes daily from June 2023 to August 2023 during summer vacations. For ethical concern researchers find permission from the concerned authorities to conduct their research.

Research instrument is a tool which is employed for the purpose of composing information, it can be in the form of a questionnaire, interview, case study, survey, and observation (Maitlo, Tumrani & Ali, 2022). Research instruments used in the present research, a “Writing Comprehension Test” with an enclosed questionnaire. “Writing Comprehension Test” employed in the present study and the questionnaire was contained the 12 pictorial images illuminating molded stories. Pretest and

posttest in the form of creative-writing were employed as research instruments to estimate students writing skill.

For the data collection researchers planned pretest from both groups to determine their writing capacity before employing new learning techniques. The researchers find that the score of both groups was equal in the pretest. Then the both groups were treated in different ways and after three months researchers planned posttest and find a significance difference between the scores of these groups. The experimental group performed better than controlled group. The collected data was later analyzed by using SPSS software latest version, and analyzed data was presented in tables.

RESULTS AND FINDINGS

Table 01
Group Statistics of Pre and Post Tests

	<i>Groups</i>	<i>Numbers</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>St. Deviation</i>	<i>Std. Error Mean</i>
Pretest scores	Experimental	30	23.03	1.713	.313
	Controlled	30	23.86	1.786	.386
Posttest scores	Experimental	30	27.39	8.10	.279
	Controlled	30	19.29	.763	.144

The table number one above is showing the results pretests and posttests of both groups. These results revealed significant difference between the scores of both groups in posttest, while in pretest scores of these both groups were almost same. The experimental performed better than controlled group in pretest. Therefore, the results suggested that visual aids and pectoral images has positive affect on creative writing skill.

Table 2
Independent Sample Tests of Both Groups

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means				95% Inter Diff Lo	
		F Sig.	t	df	Sig.(2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference		
Pretest Score	Equal variances assumed	.216	.644	-1.14	54	.910	-.054	.471	-9
	Equal variances not assumed			-1.14	53.876	.910	-0.54	.471	-9
Posttest Score	Equal variances assumed	12.731	0.001	6.034	54	.000	1.893	.314	1.2
	Equal variances not assumed			6.034	40.494	.000	1.893	.314	1.2

An independent sample of t-test was applied to contrast the scores of the controlled with experimental group in the pretest and posttest. The above table number two is showing these results in detail. The students of experimental group performed better than controlled group after treatment, which revealed that this technique proved helpful in enhancing creative writing skill through visual aids and pictorial images.

DISCUSSION OF THE RESULTS

The results of the pretest of the two groups showed no major variation in the learners' skill of writing comprehension. But the findings of the post-test indicated that PS has significant positive impacts on the scores of the subjects taught. The t-test illustrated that the group of PSL obtained superior score in the post-test of writing comprehension. The subjects who taught with PSL technique showed enhanced performance in the post-test score as compared those who were taught in conventional style. The results of the research show that the outcomes of some earlier researches done in the realm (Pratiwi, 2017; Noermanzah & Abid, 2018; Wening, 2017), all of them are showing the optimistic power of applying series of pictures and visual signs in getting better writing skill of students of language.

Applying pictures in the training skill of writing, contain a lot of benefits as constructing the effort extra reasonable and survive, assisting the students to focus extra on mission, and constructing groups of pupils extra attractive by making a relation between the classroom missions with outer humanity. Applying pictures can recover communicative silks of students and partly give back for the rarity of effort and sources in the language of classrooms. The combination of visual signs in training the skill of writing can grow the competencies of learners for writing expressive texts, get better the interest of learner and thoughts towards the getting process, improve enthusiasm of learners to take part in the activities of class, enhance contact among the learners, and help teacher-students contact in class. The outcomes of the above researches pointed out, there was a major variation between the performance of controlled and experimental groups in posttests, indicating that learners of the experimental groups in which visual aids and pictorial images were employed for training, could write down lengthy wordings with extra consistent tools and a smaller number of grammatical mistakes matched up with the presentation of learners of the controlled group. Hence, this can support learners to map their writing extra well, and it may be a cause that the learners of the experimental group in the research could write down extra words and apply extra consistent tools.

CONCLUSION

In the current study researchers exerted to evaluate the impact of visuals aids and pictorial images on students creative writing skill, which is most important skill among the other four linguistic skills. In the instructional field the usage of technological approaches with old-style approaches are rapidly improving language skills

of students and giving best outcomes than traditional methods. Visuals aids and pictorial images have made ESL learning procedure pleasurable and easy for ESL students. In Pakistan ESL learners facing several difficulties writing skill, although this is problematic but this problem can be solved by using visual aids pictorial imageries to enhance creative writing skill of ESL learners. Pretest and posttest results showed new technological methods are more effective than old style methods of learning. At the time of pretest, the scores level of both groups was almost same but after three months treatment experimental group performed better than controlled group. Therefore, these new approaches are more effective than outdated learning approaches.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Therefore, researchers suggested to the administration of educational institutes to motivate instructors to use picture series learning in ESL classrooms. Likewise, it must employ in the students' groups and teachers should essentially have enough knowledge and competence about its usage. The ESL teachers must focus on this subject professionally. The present study makes an effort to examine conceivable outcome through using picture series learning particularly in improving writing skill of ESL students. Findings of the research showed positive outcomes of using picture series in ESL students' writings, and the probable results of using picture and images in teaching different kinds of writings is beneficial for students and teachers.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, A., Farhat, P. A., & Choudhary, S. M. (2022). Students' Insights about the Influence of Text Messaging on Academic Writing Skills. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(4), 522-533. [https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022\(3-IV\)49](https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022(3-IV)49)
- Ahmad, A., Maitlo, S. K., & Jeevan, S. (2023). Exploring The Challenges and Solutions in Doctoral Dissertation Writing and Defense Faced by Pakistani ESL Scholars. *Global Educational Studies Review*, VIII(I), 397-409. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023\(VIII-D\).35](https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-D).35)
- Ahmad, A., Shahid, H. S., & Farhat, P. A. (2023). Comparative Analysis of Syntactical Errors in the Writings of ESL Students at Secondary Level in Pakistan. *Global Language Review*, VIII(II), 203-213. [http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/blr.2023\(VIII-II\).18](http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/blr.2023(VIII-II).18)
- Erdogan, T. (2013). The effect of creative drama method on preservice classroom teachers' writing skills and attitudes towards writing. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education (Online)*, 38(1), 45-61. <https://search.informit.org/doi/abs/10.3316/elapa.722316946964327>
- Farhat, P. A. (2019). *The Effect of Computer Assisted Language Learning (Call) On English Language Learners'pronunciation in Secondary School in Pakistan* (Doctoral Dissertation, Doctoral Thesis, Universiti Utara Malaysia <https://Etd.Uum.Edu.My/Id/Eprint/8134>). https://etd.uum.edu.my/8134/1/s95301_01.pdf

- Gutiérrez, K. G. C., Puello, M. N., & Galvis, L. A. P. (2015). Using Pictures Series Technique to Enhance Narrative Writing among Ninth Grade Students at Institución Educativa Simón Araujo. *English Language Teaching*, 8(5), 45-71. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1075242>
- Halwani, N. (2017). Visual aids and multimedia in second language acquisition. *English Language Teaching*, 10(6), 53-59. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1143525>
- Haris, S., Farooq Akbar, M. H., Deeba, F., Khan, M. J., & Khan, I. Z. (2022). Impact of Audio Visual (AV) Aids on improving creative writing skills. *Professional Medical Journal*, 29(5). <http://www.theprofesional.com/6729/4851/20616>
- Ismiati, I., & Pebriantika, E. (2020). Designing strategies for university students' writing skill. *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 8(1), 8-19. <http://e-journal.undikma.ac.id/index.php/jollt/article/view/2210>
- Khan, H. I. (2011). Testing creative writing in Pakistan: Tensions and potential in classroom practice. *Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(15), 111-119. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09528130010029820>
- Listyani, L. (2019). The Use of a Visual Image to Promote Narrative Writing Ability and Creativity. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 80, 193-223. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1211623>
- Maitlo, S. K., Soomro, A. R., & Lashari, A. A. (2023). The Impact of Picture Series Learning on the Creative Writing Skills of ESL Learners. *Global Digital & Print Media Review*, VI(II), 211-223. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gdpmr.2023\(VI-II\).14](https://doi.org/10.31703/gdpmr.2023(VI-II).14)
- Maitlo, S. K., Tumrani, G. A., & Ali, S. (2022). Factors Affecting Speaking and Listening Skills of English Language Learners at Secondary School Level in Sindh, Pakistan. *Journal of Development and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 875-884. [https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022\(3-II\)79](https://doi.org/10.47205/jdss.2022(3-II)79)
- Noermanzah, N., Abid, S., & Septaria, S. (2018). Improving the ability of writing a narrative charge by using animated images media student class VB SD Negeri 17 Lubuklinggau. *BAHTERA: Journal Pendidikan Bahasa dan Sastra*, 17(2), 114-127. <http://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/bahtera/article/view/7637>
- Pérez, R. P. Y., & Sharples, M. (2001). MEXICA: A computer model of a cognitive account of creative writing. *Journal of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence*, 13(2), 119-139. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09528130010029820>
- Pratiwi, E. (2017). "Using Pictures Series in Increasing Student's Writing Skill to The Eleventh Grade Students of SMA PGRI 2 Palembang." *Journal Global Expert* 6(1). <https://ejournal.uigm.ac.id/index.php/GE/article/view/258>
- Rao, I. S., Jeevan, S., & Ahmad, A. (2023). Impact of Metacognitive Strategies on Creative Writing of ESL Students at College Level in District Lahore. *Global Language Review*, VIII(I), 315-324. [https://doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023\(VIII-I\).29](https://doi.org/10.31703/glr.2023(VIII-I).29)
- Saleem, R., & Haider, G. (2019). Creative Writing in Classroom: A Real Story. *International Online Journal of Primary Education*, 8(2), 64-68. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/iojpe/issue/69821/1113720>

- Sampson, V., Enderle, P., Grooms, J., & Witte, S. (2013). Writing to learn by learning to write during the school science laboratory: Helping middle and high school students develop argumentative writing skills as they learn core ideas. *Science Education*, 97(5), 643-670.
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/sce.21069>
- Sapkota, A. (2012). Developing students' writing skill through peer and teacher correction: Action research. *Journal of NELTA*, 17(1-2), 70-82.
<https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Ashok-Sapkota/publication/314541841>
- Shabiralyani, G., Hasan, K. S., Hamad, N., & Iqbal, N. (2015). Impact of visual aids in enhancing the learning process case research: District Dera Ghazi Khan. *Journal of education and practice*, 6(19), 226-233.
<https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1079541>
- Tok, Ş., & Kandemir, A. (2015). Effects of creative writing activities on students' achievement in writing, writing dispositions and attitude to English. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 174, 1635-1642.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.815>
- Wening, R. H. (2016). The role of picture series in improving students' writing ability. In *International Conference on Education (ICE2) 2018: Education and Innovation in Science in the Digital Era* (pp. 739-746).
<https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/267023511.pdf>
- Younus, J. ., Farhat, P. A. ., & Ahmad, A. . (2023). Analyzing The Factors Involvement in Declining Kalasha Language. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(3), 3520-3529.
<https://doi.org/10.52131/pjhss.2023.1103.0633>
- Yusnita, E., Sada, C., & Novita, D. (2012). Improving students' recount text writing by using picture series. Unpublished Thesis. Pontianak: Tanjungpura University.
<https://jurnal.untan.ac.id/index.php/jpdpb/article/download/1642/1601>