

THE DIGITAL ERA OF MARKETING AND TRANSFORMATION AND ITS IMPACT ON CONSUMER BUYING BEHAVIOR IN PAKISTAN: A STUDY OF CULTURAL DIFFERENCES AND OTHER FACTORS

Asma Shahzad^{*1}, Dr. Muhammad Asim²

^{*1}Masters in Commerce (Specialization in Marketing), MPhil (Commerce) (Specialization in Marketing), Marketing Researcher and Teacher Department of Commerce (DOC) University of Karachi Pakistan;

²Associate Professor, Karachi University Business School (KUBS) University of Karachi

^{*1}asmaansari876@gmail.com; ²masim@uok.edu.pk

Corresponding Author: *

Received: 05 May, 2024

Revised: 05 June, 2024

Accepted: 17 June, 2024

Published: 30 June, 2024

ABSTRACT

This research investigates the current state of digital marketing and online shopping in Pakistan, focusing on consumer perceptions, platform reliability, and factors influencing online purchasing. Utilizing a sample of 250 participants, the study employs a quantitative methodology, including surveys and statistical analysis, to examine various aspects of digital marketing and online shopping. The findings reveal that digital marketing in Pakistan is predominantly at a middle stage (32.4%), with 26% of participants believing it has reached its peak and 20.8% advocating for further improvement. High prices are identified as the primary barrier preventing the middle class from engaging in online shopping (38%), although a significant portion finds traditional shopping preferable (18%). Safety concerns regarding the sharing of personal information online are mixed, with 34% of participants feeling it is safe, while 26.8% consider it unsafe. Daraz emerges as the most reliable online shopping platform (46.4%), followed by online stores (13.2%). The study also indicates a prevalent belief that the digital era has replaced traditional marketing methods (54.4%) and that social media plays a critical role in raising awareness about digitalization (60%). Participant satisfaction with online shopping is varied, with nearly 50% expressing a need for improvements. Online websites are the most frequently used platforms (50.8%), and online shopping is perceived as making it easier for people from diverse cultures to purchase their preferred products (53.6%). Despite mixed opinions on whether digital marketing effectively targets the right audience, personal factors are found to be the primary influence on online purchasing decisions (32%). This research proves that the digital marketing and online shopping is not stagnant and there is more potential in the future as well as identifying the potential shortcomings, exploring opportunities of growth and development in Pakistan.

Keywords: Digital Marketing, Online Shopping, Consumer Perceptions, Platform Reliability, Safety Concerns, Social Media Marketing, Purchasing Factors

INTRODUCTION

The digital age has significantly impacted the marketing processes as it has made it possible to apply various technologies and platforms that have transformed the ways of interacting with clients (Bag et al., 2022; Graesch et al., 2021; Khrais & Gabori, 2023). This shift is especially visible in the emerging markets such as Pakistan; growth of digital connectivity and social media has significantly changed the consumers' perceptual patterns and preferences (Khan et al., 2023; Ahmad & Hadi

2020). More internet users and greater digital literacy amongst the population makes it essential to explore the effects of digital marketing strategies on consumers' behaviour in the context of the Pakistani market (Akhtlaq & Ahmed, 2015; Shabbir et al., 2020; Hanif et al., 2022).

This research work, therefore, aims to determine the impact of digital marketing transformation on consumer behavior in the Pakistan context with reference to cultural factors. The justification for this

study lies in the lack of understanding of the impact of cultural factors and the introduction of best practices of DM communication that are effective with Pakistani consumers. Since consumers' behavior and regulators' responses differ according to Pakistani culture, which is quite different from the rest of the world, this research can be a useful source of information for companies that want to operate effectively in this multicultural market using digital marketing strategies.

Thus, our paper seeks to assess on the impact of digital marketing transformation to consumers buying decision in Pakistan. Furthermore, the research aims at examining cultural influences when consumers respond to specific digital marketing techniques, finding the best practices of digital marketing strategies within the context of Pakistan, and examining how culture influencing consumers' preferences and behavior.

The organisation of the paper is as follows: The introduction will highlight the background to the research and the literature review will review the existing literature in relation to the study and offer an understanding of the digital marketing practices in Pakistan and the positive impact of the culture on the behaviour of consumers. The implications of the paper are discussed, whereby the main findings are outlined, the significance of the contributions made is explained, and suggestions for further research are provided.

1. Literature Review

The appearance of digital marketing as one of the tools to promote goods and services has presented a new perspective in the business-consumer connection (Kurdi et al., 2022; Jadhav et al., 2023). Also the print and broadcast advertising once formed the main part of the marketing picture, but with help of digital tools the picture has started changing drastically. The advent of internet and mobile technologies has added some other media such as social networks, SEM, e-mail advertising, and mobile multimedia (Selem et al., 2023; Alzubi, 2023). These have made it easier for marketers to get close to consumers and launch specific and strategic campaigns. Accordingly, the literature established that digital marketing improves customer interaction and customization since more focused and targeted messages can be sent to the users based on their preferences and behaviors (Hussain et al., 2023;

Purnomo, 2023; Wuisan & Handra, 2023; Nuseir & Refae, 2022).

Analyzing the consumer buying behavior in the era of the relative dominance of the digital purchasing environment, theoretical concepts have been defined. According to the Theory of Planned Behavior by Ajzen (1991), consumer intentions which are determined by attitudes, subjective norms, and perceived behavioral control are decisive factors in the consumers' buying behavior (Tiwari et al., 2024; La Barbera & Ajzen, 2024; Ajzen, 1991). Furthermore, the Consumer Decision-Making Process model which consists of the problem recognition, information search, evaluation of the alternatives, and the purchase decision (Testa et al., 2024; Alsayat, 2023). The Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) developed by Davis (1989) goes further in elaborating how perceived ease of use and perceived usefulness influences the consumers' acceptance of these new technologies (Lala, 2014; Berakon et al., 2023; Bano & Siddiqui, 2024). These frameworks offer a good understanding on how elements of digital marketing affect consumers' decision making and characteristic (Balaman & Baş, 2023; Abubakari et al., 2023).

Cultural issues are basic to marketing effectiveness (Ruanguttamanun, 2023). According to Hofstede's cultural dimensions theory (Hofstede, 2001), the culture of a certain country affects the behavior of the buyers in the following ways; Individualism/collectivism, power distance, and uncertainty avoidance (Minkov & Kaasa, 2021; Huang et al., 2024). Another work that expands the topic of cultural differences and their influences in businesses is Trompenaars' model (Reis et al., 2013; Müller et al., 2009). Knowledge of these cultural dimensions will help to grasp the specificity of the consumers' behavior and thus will allow for creating adequate marketing strategies (Albarq et al., 2023; Sudirjo, 2023). In Pakistan, collectivism, feminism and religiosity define the consumers' preference and responses to the e-marketing communication strategies effectively (Khan et al., 2019; Ata & Shahzad, 2023).

The impact of digital transformation on consumer behavior is profound (Shahid & Li, 2019; Nawaz et al., 2023). Due to the present use of technology in the consumer society, consumers expect more involvement from brands (Hoyer et al., 2020; Schweidel et al., 2022). Studies prove that digital marketing increases customers' participation by

ensuring that timely and relevant information is communicated to and from the customers (Kausar et al., 2024; Rizvi et al., 2019; Hollebeek & Macky, 2019). In addition, the advanced use of portable gadgets and social media platforms increased the online buying behaviour and customers' expectations regarding the inconvenience level and time (Mahapatra, 2017; Shukla & Nigam, 2018). The implementation of big data and analytics in the promotion of digital marketing makes it easier to target and segment the customers in an effective manner and this has an added advantage of improving customer satisfaction and retention (Anshari et al., 2019; Okorie et al., 2024).

4. Digital Marketing in Pakistan

The digital marketing in the context of Pakistan also has experienced a revolutionary change over the decades due to increased use of Internet and innovation in technology (Asif & Sandhu, 2023; Batada, 2023). Currently, social media has taken a central space for marketers, where Facebook, Instagram and TikTok takes a position in the market to target Pakistani consumers (Iqbal & Khan, 2021). Such platforms are used for advertising, creating the channels for interaction between buyers and sellers and for building communities; it demonstrates the transition to the targeted and active advertising (Fatima et al., 2024; Suboor & Anjum, 2023).

The use of influencers is also on the rise especially because a brand can work with influencers that are popular in the targeted segment to gain trust (Asfar et al., 2022; Pervaiz et al., 2023). They state that consumers trust recommendations from other people especially those personalities they idolize in the TV and social media are key players in consumer decision making hence are vital in the marketing mix (Awais et al., 2022).

E-commerce is another area that has shifted and added to the methods of digital marketing (Siddiqui & ul Hameed, 2023; Ahmad et al., 2024). Due to the sudden rise of online shopping centers, especially in the urban areas, business firms have been forced to spend their hard-earned money on search engine optimization (SEO), pay-per-click (PPC) advertising, and emails marketing in order to maximize their internet marketing presence (Khan et al., 2019; Ashiq & Hussain, 2024).

Some of the major digital technologies and media that constitute Pakistan digital marketing environment have been identified as follows.

Facebook and Instagram are particular social media that extend some levels of targeting so marketers can suitably reach out to their audiences (Hassan et al., 2018; Bashir et al., 2022; Mubarak et al., 2019). Google Ads is used for SEO marketing and enables companies to show up in the search results when a certain keyword is entered and consequently appeal to customers (Saddiq et al., 2023).

Mobile marketing becomes more important, since more consumer are reading content with their mobile phones (Hassan et al., 2018; Ali et al., 2021). Utilizing mobile applications and short message service can be used to involve and inform customers at appropriate times. For the purpose of evaluating the effectiveness of the campaigns and awareness of the business by the target consumer demographics, data analytics tools like Google Analytics and social media analytics tools are beneficial (Waheed & Yang, 2018; SOOMRO et al., 2021; Abbasi et al., 2022).

It might also help to shine a light on some of these issues several successful digital marketing campaigns could do so. For instance, Daraz's '11.11', sale campaign alongside its constituent parts such as social media ads, influencer marketing, and email marketing to raise awareness and create engagement among the consumers to make them engage in the sales campaign. Jazz delivered much improved results with its campaign dubbed as 'Jazz 4G' that was engaging in what was new in 4G services where advertising was done thoroughly on social media and among the influencers so that the regular customers could get a good look at the brand (Khan et al., 2023; Javed & Khan, 2022; Mahmood et al., 2021). Besides, Khaadi, a famous brand of Pakistani apparels has been efficiently using organized social media for business branding; the organic and trendy content and customer centered posts have greatly helped the business in unveiling a brand image to the customers (Idrees et al., 2020; Shahzadi & Maqbool, 2024).

5. Research Methodology

This section defines the research method, explaining the theoretical framework, applied processes, and methods adopted in this research. Some of the areas that the paper addresses include the sampling technique, factors that determine choice of data collection method and the approach used to undertake the research.

In our investigation, digital questionnaires generated the basic qualitative information as required. These questionnaires were administered using Google Forms to social media stakeholders who have ordered products through the organization's online marketing platforms. Quantitative data was employed together with qualitative data in a concurrent mixed-method design as suggested by Rohm et al., (2013) and Dawadi et al., (2021). This research approach entails gathering and analyzing quantitative and qualitative data to give a broader perspective of the research issue. It is important to note that the combined use of both qualitative and quantitative approaches is to achieve results that surpass the capabilities of both kinds of research (Taherdoost, 2022; Olazo, 2023).

Measurement and gathering of information for this research involved the acquisition of information from different sources for many uses. The findings are consistent with data that reflects on the specific research objectives to keep the data relevant and significant. This approach aligns with Mason's (2002) emphasis on obtaining the most substantial and appropriate data for the study. The research employed both qualitative and quantitative data collection methods, gathering data from 250 consumers through self-administered questionnaires. Participants were assured that their responses would be used solely for research purposes. The questions were designed to avoid bias and encourage genuine responses, allowing respondents to express their opinions freely.

The development of the questionnaire began with a thorough assessment of the study's objectives. Schiffman and Kanuk (2009) suggest that the researcher should consider the purpose of the study and the types of information needed. One of the objectives of qualitative research in this context is to provide meaningful data for the quantitative study (Amaratunga et al., 2002; Nassaji, 2020). The research focuses on online stores' perspectives on social networks and their impact on consumers. Hurtado-de-Mendoza et al. (2014) emphasize that interviewers should create questions that encourage respondents to provide relevant information while avoiding leading questions that might influence responses. Guion et al. (2011) add that open-ended questions starting with "Why" or "How" are preferable for exploration purposes.

The research aimed to study the digital era of marketing and its transformation, focusing on

cultural and other factors that impact consumer buying behavior in Pakistan. The study sought to understand how online social networks influence consumers' purchasing decisions and the reasons behind their behavior. A qualitative research approach was chosen to achieve the expected outcomes and insights, as qualitative research focuses on the perceptions and content of interviews rather than numerical data (Curry et al., 2009; Rosenthal, 2016; Mulisa, 2022). According to Zikmund (2010), qualitative research can be defined as presenting and explaining the nature and details of incidents, organisms, and phenomena in words, which offer flexibility when studying people's ideas and perceptions.

Among the sample population the selected 250 was mostly made up of youthful and college going individuals. The survey was conducted cross-sectionally, and the questionnaire was filled only once; it was the participants' expectation to respond in a single wave. Data reliability was ensured through the use of SPSS software, which helped identify relationships among the responses. SPSS version 20.0 was used to analyze the survey data (Sürücü & Maslakci, 2020). Data analysis determined whether participants could provide adequate evidence to address the research questions and support the study's objectives. The data was analyzed using a regression model, specifically Multiple Linear Regression (MLR), given the single dependent variable and three independent variables involved in the research (Vesey et al., 2011; Letzgun et al., 2022).

The theoretical framework identified independent variables affecting purchasing behavior, which served as the dependent variable. Past research informed the selection of these variables. Advertising, social media marketing, and branding were considered significant factors influencing consumer behavior, particularly among materialistic individuals who prefer brands that reflect a certain social status (Shepherd et al., 2015). The study outcomes were assessed using qualitative and quantitative measures (Adcock & Collier, 2001). Qualitative research focused on the content of interviews and participants' perceptions, while quantitative research employed statistical methods to evaluate the extent of phenomena (Fossey et al., 2002; Yadav, 2022). Qualitative research was deemed more flexible and adaptable, allowing for a deeper understanding of subjects' thoughts and

opinions. Operationalization translated the research concepts into measurable indicators (Ahmad et al., 2019). The interview questionnaire was designed with three main sections, each exploring a key idea.

6. Results and Discussion

Data analysis involves systematically applying logical and statistical techniques to describe, summarize, and interpret data (Alem, 2020; Popenoe et al., 2021). Qualitative data analysis involves examining non-numerical data, while quantitative data analysis focuses on numerical and categorical data using various statistical methods (Frericks, 2022; Prakash et al., 2007). This study's digital marketing plan aimed to achieve specific objectives through online channels. Effective digital marketing is crucial for an organization's success, especially as consumers increasingly use mobile devices for business transactions (David Stone & David Woodcock, 2014). This research explored modern digital marketing strategies, comparing past and present approaches, and examined cultural differences, key determinants, and their impacts. In this section, the researcher analyzed data collected through questionnaires. Data analysis, a critical phase of any study, involves interpreting collected data to identify trends and patterns. The questionnaire gathered demographic information followed by topic-oriented questions. Statistical analysis employed both descriptive and inferential statistics.

Table 1: Gender of the Participants

Gender	Frequency	Percent
Male	129	51.6
Female	121	48.4
Total	250	100

Table 1 shows the gender distribution of the study participants, with 129 males (51.6%) and 121 females (48.4%), indicating nearly equal representation of both genders.

Table 2: Age of the Participants

Age Group	Frequency	Percent
18-24 years	111	44.4
25-34 years	78	31.2
35-44 years	30	12.0
45-54 years	19	7.6
55-60 years	12	4.8
Total	250	100

Table 2 presents the age distribution, with the largest group being 18-24 years (44.4%). The study included participants from all age groups, ensuring diverse representation.

Table 3: Educational Qualification of the Participants

Ala1a1q	Frequency	Percent
High school	37	14.8
Intermediate	33	13.2
Graduate	89	35.6
Masters	66	26.4
M.Phil or PhD	25	10.0
Total	250	100

Table 3 highlights the educational qualifications, showing a varied range of education levels, with the majority being graduates (35.6%).

Table 4: Duration of Internet Usage

Duration of Internet Usage	Frequency	Percent
1 hour	45	18.0
2 hours	42	16.8
3 hours	46	18.4
More than 3 hours	117	46.8
Total	250	100

Table 4 indicates that 46.8% of participants use the internet for more than 3 hours a day, demonstrating heavy internet usage among the respondents.

Table 5: Frequency of Online Shopping

Frequency of Online Shopping	Frequency	Percent
Weekly	42	16.8
Monthly	81	32.4
Yearly	40	16.0
As little as possible	87	34.8
Total	250	100

Table 5 shows that 32.4% of participants shop online monthly, while 34.8% shop as little as possible.

Table 6: Impact of Digital Marketing Methods

Response	Frequency	Percent
Yes	130	52.0
No	39	15.6
Maybe	60	24.0
I don't do online shopping	21	8.4
Total	250	100

Table 6 reveals that 52% of participants feel that digital marketing methods compel them to buy more products.

Table 7: Connection with Markets and Brands

Response	Frequency	Percent
Yes, it has	162	64.8
No, it was more easy previously	30	12.0
Social media has disturbed more	35	14.0
Not sure	23	9.2
Total	250	100

Table 7 indicates that 64.8% believe the digital era has provided more opportunities to connect with markets and brands.

Table 8: Hesitations in Online Shopping

Concern	Frequency	Percent
Product fraud risk factor	138	55.2
Product return procedure difficulty	63	25.2
Financial risk	32	12.8
Psychological overthinking	17	6.8
Total	250	100

Table 8 shows that 55.2% of participants are concerned about product fraud when shopping online.

Table 9: Improvements Needed in Digital Marketing

Aspect Needing Improvement	Frequency	Percent
Marketing tactics and techniques	69	27.6
Product specifications clarity	119	47.6
Understandable ads	25	10.0

Easier buying procedures	37	14.8
Total	250	100

Table 9 indicates that 47.6% believe product specifications need to be clearer in digital marketing.

Table 10: Impact of Continuous Advertisements

Response	Frequency	Percent
These ads irritate us	122	48.8
These ads give ideas of new brands/offers	73	29.2
These ads compel me to buy products	31	12.4
No, I haven't been affected	24	9.6
Total	250	100

Table 10 shows that 48.8% of participants find continuous advertisements irritating.

Table 11: Frequencies for Stage of Digital Marketing in Pakistan

Stage of Digital Marketing	Frequency	Percent
Initial	52	20.8%
Middle	81	32.4%
As high as it can	65	26%
Need more improvement	52	20.8%
Total	250	100%

Digital marketing in Pakistan is perceived as being at the middle stage (32.4%), with significant opinions that it is as high as it can be (26%) or needs more improvement (20.8%).

Table 12: Frequencies for Reasons Middle Class Cannot Do Online Shopping

Reason	Frequency	Percent
Due to high prices	95	38%
Process of online shopping is difficult	42	16.8%
They can shop online easily now	68	27.2%
Traditional shopping was much better	45	18%
Total	250	100%

The main reason middle-class individuals cannot shop online is high prices (38%), while a significant portion feels that traditional shopping was preferable (18%).

Table 13: Frequencies for Safety of Sharing Personal Information Online

Opinion	Frequency	Percent
Yeah, it's safe now	85	34%
No doubt, it's unsafe	67	26.8%
Maybe it will not cause any problem in the future	52	20.8%
Not sure	46	18.4%
Total	250	100%

A majority (34%) of participants feel it is safe to share personal information online, but 26.8% believe it is unsafe.

Table 14: Frequencies for Most Reliable Online Shopping Platform in Pakistan

Platform	Frequency	Percent
Daraz	116	46.4%
Online Stores	33	13.2%
Alibaba	15	6%
No Platform	14	5.6%
Facebook Pages	11	4.4%
Ali Express	10	4%
OLX	8	3.2%
Panda Mart	12	4.8%
J.	7	2.8%
Airlift, Elo	4	1.6%
Amazon, Limelight, Naheed.pk, Oriflame	2	0.8% each
Total	250	100%

Daraz is considered the most reliable platform (46.4%), while other platforms like Alibaba and Facebook Pages have smaller shares.

Table 15: Frequencies for Digital Era Replacing Human Marketing

Opinion	Frequency	Percent
Yes, it is right	136	54.4%
No, it is wrong	55	22%
Maybe	48	19.2%
Not sure	11	4.4%
Total	250	100%

Most participants (54.4%) believe the digital era has replaced human marketing methods.

Table 16: Frequencies for Role of Social Media Marketing in Digitalization

Opinion	Frequency	Percent
Yes	150	60%
No	32	12.8%
Maybe	56	22.4%
Not sure	12	4.8%
Total	250	100%

Social media marketing is seen as playing a crucial role in digitalization by 60% of participants.

Table 17: Frequencies for Satisfaction with Online Shopping

Satisfaction	Frequency	Percent
Yes	75	30%
No	33	13.2%
Need improvements	124	49.6%
Not sure	18	7.2%
Total	250	100%

A significant number of participants (49.6%) feel online shopping needs improvements.

Table 18: Frequencies for Most Used Platform for Online Shopping

Platform	Frequency	Percent
Online websites	127	50.8%
Social media ads	81	32.4%
Digitalized emails	28	11.2%
TV ads	14	5.6%
Total	250	100%

Online websites are the most frequently used platform (50.8%) for online shopping.

Table 19: Frequencies for Online Shopping Making it Easy to Buy Favorite Products

Opinion	Frequency	Percent
Yes	134	53.6%
No	28	11.2%
Maybe	65	26%
Not sure	23	9.2%
Total	250	100%

More than half (53.6%) believe online shopping makes it easier for people from different cultures to buy their favorite products.

Table 20: Frequencies for Digital Marketing Targeting the Right Audience

Opinion	Frequency	Percent
Yes	86	34.4%
No	35	14%
Maybe	96	38.4%
Not sure	33	13.2%
Total	250	100%

Opinions are mixed on whether digital marketing targets the right audience, with 38.4% unsure.

Table 21: Frequencies for Factors Affecting Online Product Purchase

Factor	Frequency	Percent
Perceived benefits	62	24.8%
Product variety	48	19.2%
Convenience	57	22.8%
Privacy	31	12.4%
Time saver	52	20.8%
Total	250	100%

Perceived benefits (24.8%) and convenience (22.8%) are the main factors influencing online purchases.

Table 22: Frequencies for Factors Compelling People to Buy Products Online

Factor	Frequency	Percent
Cultural factors	56	22.4%
Social factors	64	25.6%
Personal factors	80	32%
Psychological factor	50	20%
Total	250	100%

Personal factors are the primary influence (32%) compelling people to buy products online.

The researcher formulated the hypotheses based on the objectives of the study. To answer the research questions, these hypotheses were tested. It was essential to consider the assumptions underlying the analysis before conducting any tests. Testing these assumptions allowed for accurate interpretation and conclusions. Given the qualitative nature of the data and the nominal scale of measurement, the chi-square goodness-of-fit test was selected. This test relies on several key assumptions:

After evaluating the data, the researcher confirmed that all these assumptions were met. Consequently, the chi-square goodness-of-fit test was appropriately applied.

H10: there was no significant difference in the satisfaction level of the consumers with the online shopping and digital marketing.

H1a: there was a significant difference in the satisfaction level of the consumers with the online shopping and digital marketing

Table 23: Observed and Expected Counts for Satisfaction with Online Shopping

Are you satisfied with online shopping in Pakistan?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Yes	75	62.5	12.5
No	33	62.5	-29.5
Need improvements	124	62.5	61.5
Not sure	18	62.5	-44.5
Total	250		

Table 24: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Satisfaction with Online Shopping

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	108.624
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.000
Minimum Expected Cell Frequency	62.5
Number of Cells with Expected Frequency < 5	0

H20: there was no significant difference in the opinion of people for the methods that compelled consumers to buy product online.

H2a: there was a significant difference in the opinion of people for the methods that compelled consumers to buy product online.

Table 25: Observed and Expected Counts for Factors that Compel People to Buy Products Online

Which factors compel you to buy products online?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Cultural factors	56	62.5	-6.5
Social factors	64	62.5	1.5
Personal factors	80	62.5	17.5
Psychological factor	50	62.5	-12.5
Total	250		

Table 26: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Factors that Compel People to Buy Products Online

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	8.112
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.044
Minimum Expected Cell Frequency	62.5
Number of Cells with Expected Frequency < 5	0

H30: there was no significant difference in opinion of the people about the factors that irritated people in purchasing product online.
 H3a: there was a significant difference in opinion of the people about the factors that irritated people in purchasing product online.

Table 27: Observed and Expected Counts for Factors that Irritate People in Purchasing Products Online

When you do online shopping, which thing bothers you and hesitates you in buying a product online?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Product fraud risk factor	138	62.5	75.5
Product return procedure difficulty	63	62.5	0.5
Financial risk	32	62.5	-30.5

Psychological thinking over dangers of buying online	17	62.5	-45.5
Total	250		

Table 28: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Factors that Irritate People in Purchasing Products Online

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	139.216
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.000
Minimum Expected Cell Frequency	62.5
Number of Cells with Expected Frequency < 5	0

H40: there was no significant difference in opinion of the people about the stage of digital marketing in Pakistan.
 H4a: there was a significant difference in opinion of the people about the stage of digital marketing in Pakistan.

Table 29: Observed and Expected Counts for Stage of Digital Marketing in Pakistan

At what stage is digital marketing in Pakistan?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Initial	52	62.5	-10.5
Middle	81	62.5	18.5
As high as it can	65	62.5	2.5
Need more improvement	52	62.5	-10.5
Total	250		

Table 30: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Stage of Digital Marketing in Pakistan

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	9.104
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.027
Minimum Expected Cell Frequency	62.5
Number of Cells with Expected Frequency < 5	0

H50: there was no significant difference in the opinion of the people about the factors that affected the people in purchasing product online.
 H5a: there was a significant difference in the

opinion of the people about the factors that affected the people in purchasing product online.

Table 31: Observed and Expected Counts for Factors Affecting Online Purchases

Which factor affects you to buy online product?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Perceived benefits	62	50	12
Product variety	48	50	-2
Convenience	57	50	7
Privacy	31	50	-19
Time saver	52	50	2
Total	250		

Table 32: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Factors Affecting Online Purchases

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	11.240
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	4
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.024

H60: there was no significant difference in the opinion of the people that consumer behavior approach towards online advertisement and marketing affected in online buying.

H6a: there was a significant difference in the opinion of the people that consumer behavior approach towards online advertisement and marketing affected in online buying.

Table 33: Observed and Expected Counts for Consumer Behavior Towards Online Advertisements

Have you ever been affected by continuous advertisements while watching a video on YouTube or any other platform?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
These Ads irritate us	122	62.5	59.5

These ads give idea of new brands and offers	73	62.5	10.5
These ads compel me to buy that particular product	31	62.5	-31.5
No, I haven't been affected	24	62.5	-38.5
Total	250		

Table 34: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Consumer Behavior Towards Online Advertisements

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	98.000
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.000

Note: All cells have expected frequencies greater than 5. Minimum expected cell frequency is 62.5.

H70: there was no significant difference in the opinion of the people regarding platforms that people use the most for online shopping in Pakistan.

H7a: there was a significant difference in the opinion of the people regarding platforms that people use the most for online shopping in Pakistan.

Table 35: Observed and Expected Counts for Platforms Most Used for Online Shopping in Pakistan

From which platforms do you do most online shopping in Pakistan?	Observed N	Expected N	Residual
Online websites	127	62.5	64.5
By seeing advertisements on social media apps	81	62.5	18.5
By digitalized email information	28	62.5	-34.5
By seeing ads on TV	14	62.5	-48.5
Total	250		

Table 36: Chi-Square Test Statistic for Platforms Most Used for Online Shopping in Pakistan

Test Statistics	Value
Chi-Square	128.720
Degrees of Freedom (Df)	3
Asymptotic Significance (p-value)	0.000

Note: All cells have expected frequencies greater than 5. Minimum expected cell frequency is 62.5.

7. Discussion of Results:

The findings of the paper on profiling the state of the digital marketing in Pakistan indicated that 32.4% of responses considered it to be in its middle growth, 26% considered it reaching its maximum, and 20.2% said it was good, 8% said it required further improvement. This diversification of perception is quite comparable to the analysis by Goldman et al. (2021) on the maturity stages of digital marketing in emerging markets. The results show that, overall, the respondents acknowledge development but at the same time, a considerable number of them described opportunities, which also points out the continuous change in the approaches to digital marketing.

The survey about various aspects that can be attributed to middle class people of Pakistan not being able to make online shopping a daily routine revealed that 38% people responded to high prices as the reason. This is in line with Zheng et al. (2020), who noted that price sensitivity was a major concern as warned by the government, to barrier freedom. On the other hand, only 27.2% of the participants opined that thanks to online shopping, accessibility has increased, which the information is conflicting with Erdmann et al.'s (2023) observation that there are still such barriers as economic ones that prevent people from engaging in wider usage.

The survey on the safety of posting personal details online utilized in this research revealed that While 34% of the respondents thought that it was safe to share personal information online, 26%. 20% reporting that they felt that it was unsafe to do so. This is in line with Chetioui et al. (2021) who identified differences in trust in online platforms depending on the person's characteristics and the region. This difference underlines the need for analyzing the privacy aspect in the digital marketing as it is discussed by Scarpi et al. (2022).

The preference for Daraz as the most reliable online shopping platform (46.4%) and the higher usage of online websites (50.8%) reflects the findings of

Maskuroh et al. (2022) and Hong et al. (2024). These studies supplement the fact that traditional e-commerce sites' dominance hampers other forms of marketing like ads placed on social media or commercials.

The result displaying the fact that 54 percent of its people preferred to rely on their own judgment came as no surprise to us. According to this, 4% of participants think that the transition to the digital era means that traditional methods of marketing correspondingly has been replaced; This observation is in line with the findings of Brockhaus et al. (2023) where there was noted a great shift toward digital channels. This trend is further supported by Saud et al. (2020) where the authors pointed on the increased importance of social networks in increasing awareness about digitalization.

The finding that 49.6 percent of the participants are dissatisfied with online shopping partially, meaning there is room for improvement is also supported by Fu et al. (2020), who pointed out that the essence of consumers' satisfaction is based on expectation of enhanced service and experience.

An analysis of the key determinant of online purchasing behaviour where perceived benefits stands at 24.8% of the respondents agreed with Tran & Le (2020) who postulated that perceived value and convenience are notable factors affecting consumer decisions on online shopping.

The percentages indicating that social factors (25.6%) and personal factors (32%) are relevant with influencing people to purchase products online support Sudirjo et al.'s (2023) study. In their research, they identified social factors and self-Interest as key determinants to consumer's behavior in cyberspace. All in all, the findings from these hypotheses support both the literature from the regional market and the indigenous features of digital marketing and online selling in Pakistan.

8. Conclusion

This research paper secured an understanding of different aspects of digital marketing and online shopping in Pakistan including the stage of digital marketing, challenges facing online shopping, privacy concerns, and the credibility of online platforms. The purpose of the research was to investigate the perceptions and expectations of the customers at the new level of growth of digital technology.

The results suggest a somewhat high level of digital marketing development in Pakistan to which state there is a high degree of awareness, but at the same time there is a need for further advancement. High prices and a perception that the online shopping process is complicated became the key obstacles for the middle class, which resonates with the generally established concepts related to the impact of the economic barriers on the ability to navigate the digital environment. Issues to do with privacy and security of an individual in the process of sharing information online were evident and thus called for improvement in the level of security and trust. Another noteworthy discovery was the primary choice of popular e-platforms like Daraz, as the largest number of participants said they use online websites to shop.

One obvious trend was a change of reliance from the traditional marketing tactics towards digital marketing ones, which is apparent globally. Nevertheless, the trends that have been identified indicate that even though there has been growth in digital channels of communicating and making sales, there are issues that have remained a concern to the customers regarding services offered. The above research points out perceived benefits and personal factors as the significant factors affecting purchasing online. The social factors also contribute to a great extent, thereby showing the nested-layered grievance of incentives and disincentives that drive consumption.

Therefore, it can be concluded that both digital marketing, as well as online shopping, are gradually developing in Pakistan, however, there are certain issues. Removal of these barriers or improvement of current digital marketing techniques can result in a stronger and improved e-commerce market place for consumers. Further research should be conducted to expand the understanding of these processes especially with regard to new tendencies and shifts in the consumers' expectations in the era of digitalization.

References:

Abbasi, A. Z., Schultz, C. D., Ting, D. H., Ali, F., & Hussain, K. (2022). Advertising value of vlogs on destination visit intention: the mediating role of place attachment among Pakistani tourists. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Technology*, 13(5), 816-834.

- Abubakari, M., Zakaria, G. A. N., & Musa, J. (2023). Digital Learning Acceptance in Islamic Education: Validity and Reliability Testing of the Modified Technology Acceptance Model. *Canadian Journal of Educational and Social Studies*, 3(6), 27-42.
- Adcock, R., & Collier, D. (2001). Measurement validity: A shared standard for qualitative and quantitative research. *American political science review*, 95(3), 529-546.
- Ahmad, A., & Hadi, N. U. (2020). Impact of digitization on consumer buying behavior with respect to consumer demographic factors. *Foundation University Journal of Business & Economics*, 5(1), 15-30.
- Ahmad, M. B., Shaukat, F., Rizvi, F., & Zulqarnain, M. (2024). Bridging Consumer Choices: The Role of Sustainable Packaging Logistics and Trust in E-Commerce Industry of Pakistan. *Sustainable Business and Society in Emerging Economies*, 6(2), 151-166.
- Ahmad, S., Wasim, S., Irfan, S., Gogoi, S., Srivastava, A., & Farheen, Z. (2019). Qualitative v/s. quantitative research-a summarized review. *population*, 1(2), 2828-2832.
- Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. *Organizational behavior and human decision processes*, 50(2), 179-211.
- Akhlaq, A., & Ahmed, E. (2015). Digital commerce in emerging economies: Factors associated with online shopping intentions in Pakistan. *International Journal of Emerging Markets*, 10(4), 634-647.
- Ali, A., Tara, N., Nawaz, N., & Rafi, N. (2021). Exploring The Role Of Mobile Marketing As A Blessing Or Curse: A Case Study Of Pakistan. *Bulletin of Business and Economics (BBE)*, 10(4), 56-63.
- Albarq, A. N., Kumar, S., Piaralal, L., Bhatti, M. A., & Abd Razak, A. Z. A. B. (2023). Impact of Advertising Strategies on Developing Brand Awareness: Role of Cultural Differences. *Transnational Marketing Journal*, 11(1), 75-88.
- Alsayat, A. (2023). Customer decision-making analysis based on big social data using machine learning: a case study of hotels in Mecca. *Neural Computing and Applications*, 35(6), 4701-4722.
- Amaratunga, D., Baldry, D., Sarshar, M., & Newton, R. (2002). Quantitative and qualitative research in the built environment: application of "mixed" research approach. *Work study*, 51(1), 17-31.
- Asif, M., & Sandhu, M. S. (2023). Social Media Marketing Revolution in Pakistan: A Study of its Adoption and Impact on Business Performance. *Journal of Business Insight and Innovation*, 2(2), 67-77.

- Asfar, A., Qamar, A., & Irtaza, S. (2022). SOCIAL MEDIA USAGE AND FEMALE CONSUMER ATTITUDE IN PAKISTAN: IMPACT OF INSTAGRAM INFLUENCERS ON PURCHASE INTENTIONS. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 4(03), 204-214.
- Ashiq, R., & Hussain, A. (2024). Exploring the effects of e-service quality and e-trust on consumers'e-satisfaction and e-loyalty: insights from online shoppers in Pakistan. *Journal of Electronic Business & Digital Economics*, 3(2), 117-141.
- Alzubi, A. (2023). Towards digital media and conventional media challenge and opportunity: What to expect. *International Journal of Advances in Social Sciences and Humanities*, 2(3), 152-158.
- Alem, D. D. (2020). An overview of data analysis and interpretations in research. *International Journal of Academic Research in Education and Review*, 8(1), 1-27.
- Anshari, M., Almunawar, M. N., Lim, S. A., & Al-Mudimigh, A. (2019). Customer relationship management and big data enabled: Personalization & customization of services. *Applied Computing and Informatics*, 15(2), 94-101.
- Ata, M., & Shahzad, K. (2023). Culture Influences on Online Advertising Attitudes: A Pakistani Perspective. *International Journal of Management Perspective and Social Research*, 2(2), 77-96.
- Awais, S., Yasin, Z., & Raza, F. (2022). Impact of mobile application compatibility, online shopping and payment on the user satisfaction in Pakistan context: mediating role of social networking site adoption. *Journal of Management Practices, Humanities and Social Sciences*, 6(1), 28-39.
- Bag, S., Srivastava, G., Bashir, M. M. A., Kumari, S., Giannakis, M., & Chowdhury, A. H. (2022). Journey of customers in this digital era: Understanding the role of artificial intelligence technologies in user engagement and conversion. *Benchmarking: An International Journal*, 29(7), 2074-2098.
- Brockhaus, J., Buhmann, A., & Zerfass, A. (2023). Digitalization in corporate communications: understanding the emergence and consequences of CommTech and digital infrastructure. *Corporate Communications: An International Journal*, 28(2), 274-292.
- Balaman, F., & Baş, M. (2023). Perception of using e-learning platforms in the scope of the technology acceptance model (TAM): a scale development study. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 31(8), 5395-5419.
- Bano, N., & Siddiqui, S. (2024). Consumers' intention towards the use of smart technologies in tourism and hospitality (T&H) industry: a deeper insight into the integration of TAM, TPB and trust. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Insights*, 7(3), 1412-1434.
- Bashir, Z., Mansha, M., & Raja, W. (2022). How social media influence the customers buying behavior during Covid-19? Evidence from Pakistan. *Evidence from Pakistan (January 1, 2022)*. *Jinnah Business Review*, 10(1), 28-47.
- Berakon, I., Wibowo, M. G., Nurdany, A., & Aji, H. M. (2023). An expansion of the technology acceptance model applied to the halal tourism sector. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 14(1), 289-316.
- Batada, I. (2023). Impact of Digital Marketing on Consumer Buying Perspectives in the Pakistan Market. *Journal of Entrepreneurship, Management, and Innovation*, 5(3), 319-345.
- Chetioui, Y., Lebdaoui, H., & Chetioui, H. (2021). Factors influencing consumer attitudes toward online shopping: the mediating effect of trust. *EuroMed Journal of Business*, 16(4), 544-563.
- Curry, L. A., Nembhard, I. M., & Bradley, E. H. (2009). Qualitative and mixed methods provide unique contributions to outcomes research. *Circulation*, 119(10), 1442-1452.
- David Stone, M., & David Woodcock, N. (2014). Interactive, direct and digital marketing: A future that depends on better use of business intelligence. *Journal of research in interactive marketing*, 8(1), 4-17.
- Dawadi, S., Shrestha, S., & Giri, R. A. (2021). Mixed-methods research: A discussion on its types, challenges, and criticisms. *Journal of Practical Studies in Education*, 2(2), 25-36.
- Erdmann, A., Mas, J. M., & Arilla, R. (2023). Value-based adoption of augmented reality: A study on the influence on online purchase intention in retail. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 22(4), 912-932.
- Fatima, A., Ahmad, K., & Tahir, F. (2024). The Impact of Digital Marketing on Pakistan's Telecom Industry Profitability. *Journal of Business and Management Research*, 3(1), 753-782.
- Frericks, P. (2022). How to quantify qualitative characteristics of societal differences: A method for systematic comparison of qualitative data (SCQual). *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 25(3), 311-322.
- Fossey, E., Harvey, C., McDermott, F., & Davidson, L. (2002). Understanding and evaluating qualitative research. *Australian & New Zealand journal of psychiatry*, 36(6), 717-732.
- Fu, X., Liu, S., Fang, B., Luo, X. R., & Cai, S. (2020). How do expectations shape consumer satisfaction? An empirical study on knowledge products. *Journal of Electronic Commerce Research*, 21(1), 1-20.

- Graesch, J. P., Hensel-Börner, S., & Henseler, J. (2021). Information technology and marketing: an important partnership for decades. *Industrial Management & Data Systems*, 121(1), 123-157.
- Goldman, S. P., van Herk, H., Verhagen, T., & Weltevreden, J. W. (2021). Strategic orientations and digital marketing tactics in cross-border e-commerce: Comparing developed and emerging markets. *International small business journal*, 39(4), 350-371.
- Hanif, M. S., Wang, M., Mumtaz, M. U., Ahmed, Z., & Zaki, W. (2022). What attracts me or prevents me from mobile shopping? An adapted UTAUT2 model empirical research on behavioral intentions of aspirant young consumers in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 34(5), 1031-1059.
- Hassan, M. U., Malik, M., & Iqbal, Z. (2018). SMEs' intention towards the adoption of mobile marketing: a case of Pakistan. *International Journal of Business Forecasting and Marketing Intelligence*, 4(4), 400-425.
- Hollebeek, L. D., & Macky, K. (2019). Digital content marketing's role in fostering consumer engagement, trust, and value: Framework, fundamental propositions, and implications. *Journal of interactive marketing*, 45(1), 27-41.
- Hussain, H. N., Alabdullah, T. T. Y., Ries, E., & Jamal, K. A. M. (2023). Implementing Technology for Competitive Advantage in Digital Marketing. *International Journal of Scientific and Management Research*, 6(6), 95-114.
- Hassan, M. U., Iqbal, Z., Malik, M., & Ahmad, M. I. (2018). Exploring the role of technological developments and open innovation in the survival of SMEs: an empirical study of Pakistan. *International Journal of Business Forecasting and Marketing Intelligence*, 4(1), 64-85.
- Hong, Y., Sawang, S., & Yang, H. P. (2024). How is entrepreneurial marketing shaped by E-commerce technology: a case study of Chinese pure-play e-retailers. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 30(2/3), 609-631.
- Hoyer, W. D., Kroschke, M., Schmitt, B., Kraume, K., & Shankar, V. (2020). Transforming the customer experience through new technologies. *Journal of interactive marketing*, 51(1), 57-71.
- Huang, C. J., Liu, H. Y., Lin, T. L., & Lai, J. Y. (2024). Revisiting Hofstede's dimensions of national culture and environmental sustainability. *Energy & Environment*, 35(3), 1251-1269.
- Idrees, S., Vignali, G., & Gill, S. (2020). Technological advancement in fashion online retailing: a comparative study of Pakistan and UK fashion e-commerce. *International Journal of Economics and Management Engineering*, 14(4), 313-328.
- Iqbal, R. M., & Khan, S. (2021). Impact of social media marketing on building brand equity: an Empirical study of Pakistan apparel brand. *iKSP Journal of Business and Economics*, 1(2), 51-59.
- Jadhav, G. G., Gaikwad, S. V., & Bapat, D. (2023). A systematic literature review: digital marketing and its impact on SMEs. *Journal of Indian Business Research*, 15(1), 76-91.
- Javed, A., & Khan, Z. (2022). Marketing strategies for highly volatile emerging markets: an empirical study from Pakistani cellular industry. *International Journal of Emerging Markets*, 17(3), 812-831.
- Khrais, L. T., & Gabbori, D. (2023). The effects of social media digital channels on marketing and expanding the industry of e-commerce within digital world. *Periodicals of Engineering and Natural Sciences*, 11(5), 64-75.
- Kausar, S., Shah, M. H., & Iqbal, S. (2024). The Influence of Fashion bloggers on Consumer Behavior: Exploring Credibility, Engagement, and Homophily among consumers in Lahore, Pakistan. *Qlantic Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(2), 241-254.
- Khan, M. A., Zubair, S. S., & Malik, M. (2019). An assessment of e-service quality, e-satisfaction and e-loyalty: Case of online shopping in Pakistan. *South Asian Journal of Business Studies*, 8(3), 283-302.
- Khan, S., Qabool, S., ul Haque, I., & Javed, H. (2023). Elevating Consumer Purchase Intentions in Pakistan: The Power of Digital Marketing. *South Asian Journal of Management*, 17(2), 146-169.
- Khan, F. A., Siddiqi, A. A., Quddoos, M. U., Iqbal, M., & Adeel, M. (2023). Social Media Advertising and Brand Image: Unraveling the Mystery Box. *Bulletin of Business and Economics (BBE)*, 12(4), 399-408.
- Kurdi, B., Alshurideh, M., Akour, I., Alzoubi, H., Obeidat, B., & Alhamad, A. (2022). The role of digital marketing channels on consumer buying decisions through eWOM in the Jordanian markets. *International Journal of Data and Network Science*, 6(4), 1175-1186.
- Lala, G. (2014). The emergence and development of the technology acceptance model (TAM). *Marketing from Information to Decision*, (7), 149-160.
- La Barbera, F., & Ajzen, I. (2024). Instrumental vs. experiential attitudes in the theory of planned behaviour: Two studies on intention to perform a recommended amount of physical

- activity. *International Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology*, 22(3), 632-644.
- Letzgius, S., Wagner, P., Lederer, J., Samek, W., Müller, K. R., & Montavon, G. (2022). Toward explainable artificial intelligence for regression models: A methodological perspective. *IEEE Signal Processing Magazine*, 39(4), 40-58.
- Mahmood, S., Mahmood, S., & Rubab, I. (2021). Hidden Agendas: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Pakistani Cellular Company's Promotional Advertisements. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 5(1), 21-35.
- Maskuroh, N., Fahlevi, M., Irma, D., Rita, R., & Rabiah, A. (2022). Social media as a bridge to e-commerce adoption in Indonesia: A research framework for repurchase intention. *International Journal of Data and Network Science*, 6(1), 107-114.
- Mahapatra, S. (2017). Mobile shopping among young consumers: an empirical study in an emerging market. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 45(9), 930-949.
- Minkov, M., & Kaasa, A. (2021). A test of Hofstede's model of culture following his own approach. *Cross Cultural & Strategic Management*, 28(2), 384-406.
- Mubarak, M. F., Shaikh, F. A., Mubarak, M., Samo, K. A., & Mastoi, S. (2019). The impact of digital transformation on business performance: A study of Pakistani SMEs. *Engineering technology & applied science research*, 9(6), 5056-5061.
- Müller, R., Spang, K., & Ozcan, S. (2009). Cultural differences in decision making in project teams. *International journal of managing projects in business*, 2(1), 70-93.
- Mulisa, F. (2022). When Does a Researcher Choose a Quantitative, Qualitative, or Mixed Research Approach?. *Interchange*, 53(1), 113-131.
- Nawaz, M. A., Khan, D., & Khan, Q. M. (2023). Role of Artificial Intelligences in Shaping Customer Demand in E-commerce: A Case Study of Pakistan. *Annals of Human and Social Sciences*, 4(4), 626-635.
- Nassaji, H. (2020). Good qualitative research. *Language Teaching Research*, 24(4), 427-431.
- Nuseir, M., & Refae, G. E. (2022). The effect of digital marketing capabilities on business performance enhancement: Mediating the role of customer relationship management (CRM). *International Journal of Data and Network Science*, 6(2), 295-304.
- Olazo, D. B. (2023). Marketing competency, marketing innovation and sustainable competitive advantage of small and medium enterprises (SMEs): a mixed-method analysis. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 35(4), 890-907.
- Okorie, G. N., Egieya, Z. E., Ikwue, U., Udeh, C. A., Adaga, E. M., DaraOjimba, O. D., & Oriekhoe, O. I. (2024). Leveraging big data for personalized marketing campaigns: a review. *International Journal of Management & Entrepreneurship Research*, 6(1), 216-242.
- Pervaiz, S., Khan, S., & Khan, M. A. (2023). The impact of social media influencers on purchase intention: examining the mediating role of credibility in Sindh, Pakistan. *Journal of Humanities, Social and Management Sciences (JHSMS)*, 4(2), 78-95.
- Popenoe, R., Langius-Eklöf, A., Stenwall, E., & Jervaeus, A. (2021). A practical guide to data analysis in general literature reviews. *Nordic journal of nursing research*, 41(4), 175-186.
- Prakash, D., & Klotz, A. (2007). Should We Discard the "Qualitative" versus "Quantitative" Distinction?. *International Studies Review*, 9(4), 753-770.
- Purnomo, Y. J. (2023). Digital marketing strategy to increase sales conversion on e-commerce platforms. *Journal of Contemporary Administration and Management (ADMAN)*, 1(2), 54-62.
- Rizvi, S. M. A., & Siddiqui, D. A. (2019). Omnichannel development within the Pakistani fashion retail. Rizvi, SMA and Siddiqui, DA (2019). *Omnichannel Development within the Pakistani Fashion Retail. Journal of Marketing and Consumer Research*, 54, 57-87.
- Reis, N., Ferreira, M. P., Santos, J. C., & Serra, F. R. (2013). A bibliometric study of the cultural models in international business research. *BASE-Revista de Administração e Contabilidade da Unisinos*, 10(4), 340-354.
- Rohm, A., D. Kaltcheva, V., & R. Milne, G. (2013). A mixed-method approach to examining brand-consumer interactions driven by social media. *Journal of research in Interactive Marketing*, 7(4), 295-311.
- Rosenthal, M. (2016). Qualitative research methods: Why, when, and how to conduct interviews and focus groups in pharmacy research. *Currents in pharmacy teaching and learning*, 8(4), 509-516.
- Ruanguttamanun, C. (2023). How consumers in different cultural backgrounds prefer advertising in green ads through Hofstede's cultural lens? A cross-cultural study. *Global Business and Organizational Excellence*, 43(1), 35-52.
- Selem, K. M., Shoukat, M. H., Shah, S. A., & de Brito Silva, M. J. (2023). The dual effect of digital communication reinforcement drivers on purchase intention in the social commerce environment. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 10(1), 1-12.

- Schweidel, D. A., Bart, Y., Inman, J. J., Stephen, A. T., Libai, B., Andrews, M., ... & Thomaz, F. (2022). How consumer digital signals are reshaping the customer journey. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 50(6), 1257-1276.
- Shahzadi, M., & Maqbool, A. (2024). Semiotic Analysis of Pakistani Clothing Brands Advertisements using Barthes' Theory. *Competitive Linguistic Research Journal*, 6(1), 21-47.
- Saud, M., Ida, R., Abbas, A., Ashfaq, A., & Ahmad, A. R. (2020). The social media and digitalization of political participation in youths: An Indonesian perspective. *Society*, 8(1), 83-93.
- Shahid, M. Z., & Li, G. (2019). Impact of artificial intelligence in marketing: A perspective of marketing professionals of Pakistan. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research*, 19(2), 27-33.
- Shabbir, M. S., Jabeen, M., Aziz, S., Abbasi, D. R. B. A., & Gul, A. (2020). Effects of E-marketing on growth of businesses: evidence from Pakistani markets. *International Journal of Advanced Science and Technology*, 29(7), 2128-2140.
- SOOMRO, Y. A., Baeshen, Y., Alfarshouty, F., KAIMKHANI, S. A., & BHUTTO, M. Y. (2021). The impact of guerrilla marketing on brand image: Evidence from Millennial consumers in Pakistan. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 8(4), 917-928.
- Shepherd, S., Chartrand, T. L., & Fitzsimons, G. J. (2015). When brands reflect our ideal world: The values and brand preferences of consumers who support versus reject society's dominant ideology. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 42(1), 76-92.
- Siddiqui, M., & ul Hameed, W. (2023). Exploring the Nexus of Religiosity and Trust in E-commerce: Implications for Purchase Intentions in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 11(4), 4003-4015.
- Scarpi, D., Pizzi, G., & Matta, S. (2022). Digital technologies and privacy: State of the art and research directions. *Psychology & Marketing*, 39(9), 1687-1697.
- Saddiq, A. M., Naaz, K., Nisar, S., & Hayat, S. M. H. (2023). THE IMPACT OF DIGITAL SELLING DEVELOPMENT ON ENTREPRENEURSHIP: A CASE FROM INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SECTOR OF PAKISTAN. *Eye-The International Social Science Review*, 1(2), 15-29.
- Suboor, M., & Anjum, S. (2023). The Impact of eWOM, Trust Inclination, and Information on Reader's Intentions in an Evolving Digital Marketing: in Context of Pakistan with Moderating Role of ICO. *International Journal of Academic Research for Humanities*, 3(1), 272-289.
- Shukla, P. S., & Nigam, P. V. (2018). E-shopping using mobile apps and the emerging consumer in the digital age of retail hyper personalization: An insight. *Pacific Business Review International*, 10(10), 131-139.
- Sudirjo, F. (2023). Marketing Strategy in Improving Product Competitiveness in the Global Market. *Journal of Contemporary Administration and Management (ADMAN)*, 1(2), 63-69.
- Sudirjo, F., Lotte, L. N. A., Sutaguna, I. N. T., Risdiyanto, A., & Yusuf, M. (2023). The Influence of Generation Z Consumer Behavior on Purchase Motivation in E-Commerce Shoppe. *Profit: Jurnal Manajemen, Bisnis dan Akuntansi*, 2(2), 110-126.
- Sürücü, L., & Maslakci, A. (2020). Validity and reliability in quantitative research. *Business & Management Studies: An International Journal*, 8(3), 2694-2726.
- Testa, R., Rizzo, G., Schifani, G., Tóth, J., & Migliore, G. (2024). Critical determinants influencing consumers' decision-making process to buy green cosmetics. A systematic literature review. *Journal of Global Fashion Marketing*, 15(3), 357-381.
- Taherdoost, H. (2022). What are different research approaches? Comprehensive Review of Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed method research, their applications, types, and limitations. *Journal of Management Science & Engineering Research*, 5(1), 53-63.
- Tran, V. D., & Le, N. M. T. (2020). Impact of service quality and perceived value on customer satisfaction and behavioral intentions: Evidence from convenience stores in Vietnam. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 7(9), 517-526.
- Tiwari, A., Kumar, A., Kant, R., & Jaiswal, D. (2024). Impact of fashion influencers on consumers' purchase intentions: theory of planned behaviour and mediation of attitude. *Journal of Fashion Marketing and Management: An International Journal*, 28(2), 209-225.
- Vesey, W. B., Vesey, J. T., Stroter, A. D., & Middleton, K. V. (2011). Multiple linear regression: A return to basics in educational research. *Multiple Linear Regression Viewpoints*, 37(2), 14-22.
- Waheed, A., & Yang, J. (2018). The impact of mobile marketing on online consumer buying behaviour: empirical evidence from Pakistan. *International Journal of Mobile Communications*, 16(6), 624-643.
- Wuisan, D. S., & Handra, T. (2023). Maximizing online marketing strategy with digital advertising. *Startupneur Business Digital (SABDA Journal)*, 2(1), 22-30.

- Yadav, D. (2022). Criteria for good qualitative research: A comprehensive review. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 31(6), 679-689.
- Zheng, Q., Chen, J., Zhang, R., & Wang, H. H. (2020). What factors affect Chinese consumers' online grocery shopping? Product attributes, e-vendor characteristics and consumer perceptions. *China Agricultural Economic Review*, 12(2), 193-213.

