

NON-TRADITIONAL DIMENSIONS OF THE NATIONAL SECURITY OF PAKISTAN: THE WAY FORWARD

Dr Zia Ul Haque Shamsi

PhD in Strategic Studies from NDU, Islamabad

[Authored three international books: “Nuclear Deterrence and Conflict Between India and Pakistan”
“South Asia Needs Hybrid Peace” and “Understanding Sun Tzu and The Art of Hybrid War.”
Translated Sun Tzu’s The Art of War in Urdu]

Corresponding Author: ziashamsi58@gmail.com

Received: 25 February, 2024

Revised: 24 March, 2024

Accepted: 29 March, 2024

Published: 07 April, 2024

ABSTRACT

The territorial integrity of any sovereign state remains a vital interest for which it can go to war with any adversary. Historically, territorial disputes were the main source of wars and conflicts between nations until the Treaty of Westphalia was signed between the European powers of the time in 1648. However, there is a need to give equal importance to non-traditional security challenges to ensure that they are addressed with the same vigour and priority as territorial security, so that adversaries are unable to exploit fault lines, and the overall national security of the state is not compromised. Pakistan faces several challenges to its national security for a variety of reasons. While the Armed Forces of Pakistan have valiantly defended territorial integrity and sovereignty successfully over time, non-traditional security challenges are fast emerging as serious concerns to its overall security in the medium- to long term. Uncontrolled population growth, lack of national integration, increased intolerance in society giving rise to extremism and terrorism, lawlessness, corruption, air pollution, and cyber security also form part of the long list of serious security concerns for Pakistan. This paper is aimed at suggesting a way forward for Pakistan in the domain of non-traditional dimensions of national security.

Key Words: Traditional Security, Non-traditional Security, Territorial integrity, Terrorism, Extremism, Law and Order

INTRODUCTION

The Treaty of Westphalia formally recognised the sovereignty of a state over its territory and ended the prolonged wars between Spain and the Dutch, who were later joined by the Germans as well. While territorial disputes remain the most compelling cause of military conflicts among nation-states, evolving concepts of security have added newer causes, irritants and threats to states’ survival and the well-being of their people. In the changed paradigm, human security has emerged as the most important element of national security as it relates to basic human needs: food, health, economic, environmental, personal, community, and political,

however, none would be possible without a concerted effort for the sound development of state institutions and systems. Whereas the importance of territorial security cannot be overemphasized, the significance of human security has gained more prominence in the changed paradigm. According to the 1994 UN Report, every element of human security: economic, health, food, environmental, personal, community and political security have an impact on the national security of the state. However, an NTS-Asia study on non-traditional security has included climate change, resource scarcity, natural disasters, infectious diseases, irregular migration,

drug trafficking and people smuggling as important contributors to the challenges to national security.

The elements of national security in the changed paradigm have been identified and explained by many distinguished philosophers, policymakers, and strategists. The academic writings on the subject since the end of the Cold War have insisted on human security rather than physical security. However, the concept of human security as envisaged in Dr Mahbub ul Haq's UNDP Report of 1994, which was prepared after Barry Buzan's masterpiece 'People, States and Fear' remains a far cry for developing nations. The wars between 'Unequal Military Powers' (UMPs) have devastated the people of the target states. Iraq, Afghanistan, Syria, and Yemen are only a few examples of war between UMPs in the post-Cold War era. One fails to understand the logic for an all-out war between a superpower and its allies with a developing country, even if it was ruled by a tyrant regime. The result was obvious: Iraq, Afghanistan, Syria, and Yemen are destroyed, and the fancy concept of human security remains alien to the people of these states.

First and foremost is the equality and non-discrimination among human beings and the same was declared by Prophet Mohammad (Peace Be Upon Him) in his Last Sermon delivered on Hajj in 632 C.E. "All mankind is from Adam and Eve. An Arab has no superiority over a non-Arab, nor does a non-Arab have any superiority over an Arab; a white has no superiority over a black, nor does a black have any superiority over a white; [none have superiority over another] except by piety and good action."

Secondly, everyone has a right to physical security so that he/she does not fear for his/her life and property. The same is expanded for families, groups, society, and the state. Individual physical security is the sole responsibility of the state institutions responsible to ensure an umbrella of security. Once an individual has the feeling of being secure, he/she will move on to do things that are necessary to fulfil his/her basic needs.

The basic human needs are to include food, clothing, and shelter. Further expanding the need to include education, health, jobs, and an enabling environment. These basic needs are to be made available by the state and acquired by individuals through personal efforts. In the welfare states, most of these needs are taken care of by the state free of cost, however in the

developing countries, these may not be available on payment as well.

At this stage, the availability and acquisition need to be explained to differentiate between an individual's rights and needs. According to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights by the UN, and the Constitution of Pakistan, "fundamental rights include freedom of speech, freedom of thought, freedom of information, freedom of religion, freedom of association, freedom of the press, and freedom of assembly" all of these would be possible only if physical security is provided by the state.

Likewise, everyone has the right to life, liberty, and security. Furthermore, according to UN Declarations, "everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and his family, including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services, and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age, or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control." Most of the developed states are providing these rights and needs to their people because they have the resources to do so. However, the majority of developing nations can hardly make the basic rights available to their people.

Now, the rights and needs of the people of the developed states are in line with the UN Human Rights Declarations and the Constitutions of the respective states. However, in developing countries, certain rights are not protected and therefore, the fulfilment of the needs remains a far cry.

This article is aimed at suggesting a way forward for Pakistan with more emphasis on non-traditional security or the dimensions of human security. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Report emphasizes the protection of human rights and the well-being of all people as part of political security. It also aims to ensure that people are well protected from repression by the state. The states, according to Charles Tilly, at times act as protection rackets and usurp the peoples' rights of speech, press and voting. Tilly argued that "the emerging nation-state established itself by acting, essentially, as a racketeer (in terms of the interrelated activities of war-making, state-making, protection, and resource extraction via plunder, taxes, etc.)."¹

Significance of the study

The human security and the development of any state are dependent on each other in the manner that neither would be viable without the other. This implies that the state cannot ensure individual or societal security until it has developed itself and achieved self-sufficiency in food, health, environment, and employment for its citizens and residents. Therefore, developing countries are faced with the dilemma of distributing their resources between the state's territorial integrity and the development of human security requirements. This makes the study significant and calls for an introspection of the past and a viable course of action for the future.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Barry Buzan's writings proved extremely useful during the research along with Dr Haq's UNDP Report of 1994. Morgenthau's precepts on classical realism and national interests provided a sound background knowledge to deal with the prevalent state of developing nations. Michael Louw on National Security and Charles Tilly on war-making, and state-making also proved helpful in developing the argument. Specific to Pakistan, the first few five-year plans helped in understanding the earlier efforts to put a new state on track development, however, domestic politics derailed the process. Unfortunately, there is not much literature available that blames Pakistan's predicament on domestic politics. Therefore, this study is expected to fill the gap in the literature concerning domestic politics.

Human Security: Need or Right

According to Human Development Report 1994, "New Dimensions of Human Security" which was prepared by the Committee headed by a renowned Pakistani economist Dr Mahbub ul Haq, the elements of human security include Economic security, Food security, Health security, Environmental security, Personal security, Community security, and Political security. However, cyber security and financial security may be added to the list due to the ever-increasing use of technology in governmental functions as well as personal lives.

There is little doubt that human security remains the most important element of national security because it encompasses the basic human needs as mentioned

in the above quoted study, however, none would be possible without a concerted effort for the sound development of state institutions and systems.ⁱⁱ While traditional security threats include kinetic application as the main architect, non-traditional security threats include nearly all other domains of human security. Furthermore, in the changed paradigm, "Non-Traditional Security (NTS) comprises a gamut of human security concerns such as climate change, shortage of food and resources such as energy, infectious diseases, natural disasters, transnational crime, human and drug trafficking, and mass migration."ⁱⁱⁱ

The political security of any state has a direct bearing on all other elements of human security. For instance, the personal security of a citizen would remain in question if he does not enjoy the freedom of speech, press, and voting. Moreover, personal insecurity for the want of political security may lead to instability, thus putting stress on all elements of human security. Likewise, political insecurity may have a question mark on community security as well. Human rights abuses, which are a fundamental threat to political security, catch the attention of international institutions and may put sanctions on states, in case of large-scale violations. This may also expose the state to exploitation by the adversaries and become an easy target to launch a hybrid war on the target state. Thus, ensuring personal security and community security become extremely important elements of human security for the accomplishment of political security.

While emphasizing the significance of political security as an important element of human security, it is necessary to highlight its linkages with economic security. States which are dependent on donor agencies for development and sustenance cannot make independent decisions for the well-being of their people. Therefore, the states which do not have economic independence would remain under stress for the providence of political security to its people. The developing nations which are economically dependent on donor agencies may fall into the categories of states which are not politically secure and cannot endure political shocks due to economic instability.

States are at risk of losing sovereignty more than territorial integrity when they expose their weaknesses to friends and foes alike because, in the

realm of international relations, there are no permanent friends or permanent enemies. Lord Palmerston's centuries-old dictum holds good even now and perhaps forever. The three pillars of Pakistan's recently released National Security Policy (NSP 2022-2026) include human security, military security, and economic security. Whereas economic security is a vital element of human security or non-traditional security, to put more emphasis on the former, it has been dubbed as 'geo-economics' and discussed separately also.^{iv}

Pakistan must also exercise extreme care in dealing with political insecurity for the want of economic security, personal security, and community security. The rising inflation and currency devaluation have put a lot of stress on the common man and the same may be exploited by our adversaries to create fissures in society. Hence, the emphasis laid on human security and the well-being of the people in the recently released National Security Policy (2022-2026) is a step in the right direction. Pakistan must strive to ensure proper implementation of the policy to accrue its benefits for the state and its people.^v

The Way Forward for Pakistan

Pakistan is blessed with an amazing geography, topography, climatology, natural resources, agriculture, industrial potential, and a talented human resource. Pakistan has an amazing landscape with water resources, which gives people an opportunity to grow their crops, a young and vibrant populace, which is extremely hard-working, and strong-armed forces to ensure territorial integrity, to mention a few. Pakistan is the fifth most populous country in the world with over 220 million people and an alarming growth rate of 2 per cent. According to a World Bank report, only a handful of African countries and Afghanistan have a greater population growth rate than Pakistan. The lack of basic amenities like health, education, nutrition, infrastructure, job opportunities etc. have all contributed to the backwardness of Pakistan. According to the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, the current literacy rate of Pakistan stands at 62.3 per cent, meaning over 60 million people are illiterate and perhaps facing extremely hard living conditions to sustain themselves.

Although Pakistan is striving to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) with its

focus on the 3 Ps 'People, Planet and Prosperity', the focus and practical steps needed to control population growth are lacking due to which the SDGs objectives of ending poverty and hunger would remain a far cry in case of Pakistan. Likewise, 'Prosperity' as part of desire alone cannot be achieved in a country where some 24 per cent of people are living below the poverty line. Moreover, demographic makeup reflects that over 60 per cent of the population is between the ages of 15-64, whereas 35 per cent are below the age of 14 years. The average age in Pakistan hovers around 22 years, suggesting that Pakistan's young population urgently needs education, health, job opportunities, and an extremely careful direction in life about societal values. An educated and socially aware youth can be an asset to the nation, but an uneducated and directionless populace can become a serious national security threat in an evolving regional security environment. There is a need for religious moderation under true Islamic teachings to avoid the repeat of mob-lynching incidents of minorities. Then, rising poverty forces children to stay out of schools due to lack of affordability, and assist their parents by doing menial domestic jobs which contributes to frustration, inequality, and illiteracy.

An appraisal of the gross neglect of the elements of non-traditional security over the past seven decades reflects the wrong priorities and non-implementation of the relevant policy decisions. However, the salvation lies in correcting the course and this part of the article is aimed at proposing the way ahead so that by 2047 when Pakistan reaches 100 and undertakes its centenary celebrations, its people feel that it is worthy of it.

To propose a way ahead, this author is deploying his published model "Possibility-Probability" (P2),^{vi} which would help in determining the probabilities of the outcome in the intended period. Based on inductive reasoning, this author deploys the P2 Model in this part of the article. It is necessary to briefly mention the theories of possibility and probability so that the proposed way ahead is logically described. The "possibility theory is an uncertainty theory devoted to the handling of incomplete information,"^{vii} whereas, probability deals with "physical observations associated with games of chance."^{viii} However, mathematical calculations have been deliberately omitted in proposing the way

forward for Pakistan. For instance, the probability would imply, “the relative possibility that an event will occur,”^{ix} and possibility would reflect that, “may or can be, exist, happen, be done, be used.”^x For the purpose of this research, the possibility of a certain progress taking place during the period has been taken as “can be,” whereas probability has been taken into account on the basis of prevalent environment (domestic politics, regional and international), leadership (political based on their priorities), and any other factor that may overcome the existing mechanism such as natural calamities of extraordinary magnitude or lack of funding by the donor organizations for the projects related to health, education, environment etc.

The proposed P2 model would help create possible scenarios of peace, progress and development, and determine their probabilities to suggest certain ways forward for Pakistan in 2047.

While lack of education and unchecked population growth may emerge as the drivers of the present dismal state of Pakistan in the domain of human security, this author thinks that lack of sustained political stability was responsible for most of the ills. Repeated reversals of major policy decisions, inconsistent policy implementations, and the lack of continuation of democratic regimes were mainly responsible for incoherence in Pakistan’s development and growth, essentially required for the public good. Pakistan Army may have had its reasons for regular takeovers of the government, but it has been extremely damaging to the development of political and administrative institutions in Pakistan. Over the past 75 years of age, Pakistan has been governed mainly by the Pakistan Army (nearly 32 years), the Pakistan Muslim League (PML-Nawaz) for nearly 10 years, and the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) for nearly 12 years, at the Federal level. The remaining years were consumed by several small tenures mainly before the first military government came in 1958. Of late, Pakistan Tehreek Insaf governed the country for 3.5 years, before a grand coalition of regular parties resumed their power. It has now become an accepted norm that Pakistan/s military establishment makes and breaks the government at the federal level.

Another factor that is seriously affecting the effective control of population growth and numerous other factors related to non-traditional security threats is

related to legal and constitutional bindings on the state. Most of these subjects now fall in the domain of Provincial Governments, and therefore the commitments that the Federal Government makes with International Institutions are not accomplished uniformly in time and in the desired manner. Unfortunately, domestic politics at times overrides serious national objectives and priorities.

While there is a lot of emphasis on human security in the recently released National Security Policy of Pakistan, and rightly so, I do not see enough attention to human safety, unless it is assumed that the two terminologies or concepts have been used synonymously.

In a developing country like Pakistan, where human security in its true sense remains a dream, human safety is equally important, if not more so. Fatalities in road accidents, electrical shocks, gas leakages, and falling into open drains, perhaps number more than the deaths due to security-related incidents.

In an evolving paradigm, human security deals with an array of elements - from personal security to environmental security, and from economic security to food and health security; whereas, human safety relates to an individual or group’s physical safety from injury, or fatality from incidents, accidents, and routine or special events. For instance, a traffic accident due to callous mistakes or sheer negligence of the law by those involved must be treated separately from an accident caused due to a poor traffic signal system or the absence of that at a critical junction. Similarly, electrocution due to mishandling of electrical equipment must not be treated in the same way as people, especially children, electrocuted on the streets after rains due to poor installations and lack of administrative capacities to deal with a little extra rainfall.

Poverty Alleviation Programmes

Pakistan may be heading in the right direction with a ‘Realizer’ at the helm of the affairs. With a vision to make Pakistan an ‘Islamic Welfare State’ on the pattern of ‘Riyasat-e-Madinah’, several initiatives have been launched to lift the poorest of the poor people out of extreme poverty. Khan government’s flagship ‘Ehsaas Poverty Alleviation Programme’^{xi} is aimed at providing much-needed relief to the people who cannot make their livelihood. ‘Ehsaas’ is precisely what this author is proposing, ‘realization.’

Concurrently, 'Panahgahs'^{xii} for a shelter-less workforce has been created with at least two meals with a pledge that 'No one sleeps hungry.'^{xiii} This programme is expected to take care of the poorest people in society in the short to medium term.

Ehsaas programme has several components aimed at providing relief as well as opportunities for self-development to the needy, particularly the women of the rural areas, who are extremely hardworking and just need some viable support to do their work. Ehsaas Kafaalat^{xiv} programme provides direct monthly cash support to the poor and needy women on the pattern of the Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) with more transparency.

Ehsaas Amdan programme^{xv} aims to support the poorest segment of society with material support so that they can start their small businesses and gradually move out of poverty.

Ehsaas Undergraduate Scholarship Programme^{xvi} is a unique needs-based scholarship program. This program will cover 100 per cent of the tuition fee and a living stipend of 4,000 per month. The programme has been implemented throughout the country.

To ensure health security for the people, the Khan government has introduced 'Sehat Insaaf Cards' which carry an amount of 1.0 million Rupees per year for each deserving family with which they can get medical treatment from any private or government hospital. This programme is considered unique and extremely beneficial for the people in any developing country.

On the front of environmental security, the Khan-led government has launched an ambitious 10 billion Tree Tsunami for Pakistan, after a successful initiative of Billion Tree Tsunami in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) Province in the last five years. The World Economic Forum (WEF) has recently lauded Pakistan's efforts toward a green economy.^{xvii}

Another programme of the Khan-led government which needs to be mentioned is the 'Kamyab Jawan Programme.' This programme aims to support and empower youth because 68 per cent Pakistani population is below the age of 30 years. The programme encompasses youth legislation for the mainstreaming of marginalized youth, social protection, health and well-being, youth institutional reforms, and civil engagement.^{xviii}

To provide shelter to each citizen and resident, the government has launched the 'Naya Pakistan

Housing Project' which is aimed at building some five million economy housing units for people with limited resources through mortgage financing on subsidised terms from the selected banks.

The Ehsaas Programme provides an excellent showcase of how external advisors can help developing country governments apply the general principle of good governance in local contexts. It is a case that deserves wider attention within the broader community of development practitioners and governance specialists, and one that should also broaden our expectations for what can be done to fight poverty around the world.^{xix}

For a long time now, Pakistan had an extremely poor health system for its populace, however with the introduction of the 'Insaaf Sehat Card' or health insurance, people may be able to get some quality treatment. The purpose of this program is to provide essential medical facilities to all citizens starting from the poorest segment of society. Each family is entitled to avail medical treatment from any public and private hospital from Rs. 0.72 million up to Rs. 1.0 million per year. The government plans to expand the programme and include all citizens in the coming years. This kind of health support programme for the poor as well as middle-income groups was always needed, however, was ignored previously. Likewise, the *Ehsaas* nutrition strategy, once implemented would help address the issue of stunted growth and make Pakistan a healthy nation.

CONCLUSION

This author is of the view that non-traditional threats to Pakistan lay heavily on inconsistent domestic politics due to which one of the most important elements of political security remains insecure. The regular interventions by the military in Pakistan's domestic politics often led to the imposition of Martial Law and a prolonged military rule has not developed civil institutions and these have remained dependent on military establishments for guidance on governance, development, and even sustenance. However, this argument does not absolve civilian leadership over time of corruption, ineptness, incompetence, and apathy towards issues related to the public good, either in government or in opposition.

There is little doubt that the people of Pakistan deserve a better living because the territory that

belongs to them is blessed with an abundance of natural resources and an extremely hardworking and industrious human resource. Pakistan needs before the centenary celebrations get underway in 25 years, political security as the most essential element of human security. Unless Pakistan achieves sustainable political stability, the probability of achieving other elements of non-traditional security will remain a far cry.

The question remains as to how Pakistan can achieve the much-desired political security so that all other elements like education, health, population control, etc. can fall in line. Because the history, as well as the current scenario, does not help in improving the probabilities of a promising outcome.

Human security is defined as safety from such chronic threats as hunger, disease, repression, and protection from sudden and harmful disruptions in their homes, jobs, and communities. It denotes composure, tranquillity of spirit and the absence of anxiety upon which the happy life depends.^{xx} While the developed states also fail to provide some of the basic tenets of human security to their citizens and residents during COVID-19, the developing world has certainly a long way to go before life returns to normal without fear of further spread of the Pandemic.

Human security and development are dependent on each other in the manner that neither would be viable without the other.^{xxi} While most of the elements of human security relate to basic human needs: food, health, economic, environmental, personal, community, and political; none would be possible without a sound development of state institutions and systems. This implies that the state cannot ensure individual or societal security until it has developed itself and achieved self-sufficiency in food, health, and employment for its citizens and residents. Hence, developing countries can't ensure that all elements of human security are made available for the satisfaction of their citizens and residents before they have reached a certain level of development.

Domestic politics overpowers policymaking and at times at the cost of national security particularly in developing countries where the political elite's corruption, and ineptness are a norm. Pakistan is no exception due to its peculiar political system and geostrategic location. Pakistan's democratic institutions are fragile and unassertive due to

intermittent civilian and military rules. The system is corrupt to the core primarily due to weak and corrupt judiciary and accountability organs.

The political as well as military governments, in their turn, have put domestic political considerations over the security of the state. Pakistan's military establishments are responsible for some of the serious security breaches along with political elites' decisions for personal gains. The breakup of the country in 1971 was primarily due to domestic politics but Pakistan at that time was under the Martial Law regime of General Yahya Khan and therefore the responsibility rested with Pakistan Armed Forces.

Domestic politics often overpowers decisions related to the security requirements of the state. Be it for the defence budget or arms deals, alliance formations or the development of security infrastructure, domestic politics becomes dominant in all policymaking of the state.

Pakistan is only 75 years old and still has time to evolve as a cohesive society. The majority of the population is young, dynamic, emotional, and extremely industrious. However, it needs to be motivated, guided, and led by examples. While Unity, Faith, and Discipline would remain the cardinal principles for the nation, perhaps it is time we add a few more aspects in view to recover the deteriorated state of our society.

Perhaps, the best way would be to look towards the fundamental teachings of Islam because nearly 97 percent of the population is Muslim. I would suggest that we adopt these golden principles of Islam as our national values: Tolerance, Equality, and Social Justice.

Over the decades, particularly since the first Afghan war in 1979, our society has been polarized due to the import of extreme ideas; both on religious grounds, as well as on political dimensions. Extremism has been extremely damaging to Pakistani society and tolerance must be inculcated among our populace particularly the youth that is still developing its thought process.

Equality is badly needed in Pakistani society due to the exponential rise in the gap between the rich and poor. The rising inequalities are fuelling frustration, uncertainty, and emotional imbalances among the people of Pakistan.

Without social justice, society cannot survive. Historically, the nations were wiped out from the face of the earth where the ruling elite did not do justice to the poor and had different standards of law for the rich and the poor.

Non-adherence to the fundamental values that are professed and practised by all religions is one of the

ⁱ Tilly, C. (1985). War-making and State-making as Organized Crime. In; Evans, PB, Rueschemeyer, D and Scocpol, T (eds) 1985 Bringing the State Back.

ⁱⁱ Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Human Security Equals National Security, Daily Times Islamabad, June 21, 2021.

ⁱⁱⁱ Sreeparna Banerjee and Pratinashree Basu, "Strengthening Partnerships to Counter Non-Traditional Security Threats in the Indo-Pacific," *ORF Special Report No. 185*, March 2022, Observer Research Foundation.

^{iv} Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Pakistan's Humonomic Security may affect its Military Security, Daily Times, Islamabad, June 6, 2022.

^v Ibid.

^{vi} Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, Nuclear Deterrence and Conflict Management Between India and Pakistan (New York: Peter Lang, 2020), 9.

^{vii} Didier Dubois and Henri Prade, *Possibility Theory and its Applications: Where Do We Stand?*

(Toulouse: University of Paul Sabatier, 2011), 1.

^{viii} Robert B. Ash, *Basic Probability Theory* (New York: Dover Publications, Inc. Mineola, 1970), 1.

^{ix} <http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/probability?s=t>, accessed December 14, 2014.

^x <http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/possible>, accessed December 14, 2014.

^{xi} Ehsaas Poverty Alleviation Programme would provide direct financial relief to 7.0 million women.

^{xii} Panahgahs are the shelter homes for the travelers, laborer's, and home-less people with two meals, managed jointly by the government and the charity organizations. PM Khan often goes there and takes meals with temporary residents.

^{xiii} PM Khan launches initiative to feed poor, <https://nation.com.pk/11-Mar-2021/pm-imran-khan-launches-initiative-to-feed-poor> (accessed March 17, 2021).

most pressing causes of societal degeneration in Pakistan. The defined national values must be hammered in the minds of our people through personal examples, motivational campaigns on media, academic institutions, think tanks, civil society, and law enforcement if required.

^{xiv} Ehsaas Kafalat is the Government's programme through which it will give cash stipends of Rs. 2,000 per month.

<https://www.pass.gov.pk/Detailf940ad3f-95a3-4c5a-b170-6f5afd423cbe> (accessed March 20, 2021).

^{xv} Ehsaas Amdan Programme with a total budget of approximately PKR 15 billion is being implemented in the poorest districts across four provinces of Pakistan.

<https://www.pass.gov.pk/Detail1cf24ba7-74f2-4afb-897b-6ad4ec4a20aa> (accessed March 20, 2021).

^{xvi} Ehsaas Undergraduate Scholarship Programme would provide every year, 50,000 students from low-income families for 4 to 5-year support.

<https://www.pass.gov.pk/Detail15ce8962-454f-4865-8c12-c4155644acc0> (accessed March 20, 2021).

^{xvii} Pakistan has planted over a billion trees,

<https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2018/07/pakistan-s-billion-tree-tsunami-is-astonishing/> (accessed March 22, 2021).

^{xviii} National Youth Development Framework, https://www.kamyabjawan.gov.pk/downloads/eng_nydf.pdf (accessed on March 22, 2021).

^{xix} Francis Fukuyama, Foreword for Michael Barber and Muqet Shahzad, Framework for Developmental Welfare State: Lessons from Pakistan's Ehsaas Programme, Stanford Centre on Democracy, Development and the Rule of Law, June 2022.

^{xx} Emma Rothschild, "What is Security," *Daedalus* 24, no. 3 (Summer 1995), 61.

^{xxi} Zia Ul Haque Shamsi, "Human security equals national security" Daily Times, Islamabad, June 21, 2021.